EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY SCOTLAND

No. 35 Spring 2021
ISSN 1085-4894

The Newsletter of the Eighteenth-Century Scottish Studies Society

2020 RELIGION CONFERENCE GOES ONLINE

Faced with a raging pandemic, ECSSS was forced to cancel our joint conference with the Institute for the Study of Scottish Philosophy on "Religion and Enlightenment in Eighteenth-Century Scotland," planned for June 2020 at Princeton Theological Seminary. Instead, ECSSS and ISSP held an abbreviated version of the conference online on 6 and 7 August 2020. Recorded plenary lectures by Samuel Fleischacker on "Adam Smith's Views of Religion" and by Martha McGill on "Bodies, Selves, and the Supernatural in Enlightenment Scotland" were available to all participants in advance, and a plenary Q&A panel with Sam and Martha was held on the first day of the conference. That day also featured panels on "Morality, Probability, and Aesthetics" and "Divine Creation and Divine Providence." On the following day, panels were held on "Language Rhetoric, and Textuality," "Varieties of Presbyterianism in Scotland and America," and "Commerce, Religion, and the Will." James Foster, the Director of ISSP, hosted the event.

Although the online conference was less than half the size of the planned live conference at Princeton, most participants had positive opinions about the mini-conference. We hope to return to Princeton Theological Seminary at some point, either to revisit this topic or to explore another one relating to eighteenth-century religion and philosophy. And as discussed below, we are planning to return to "live" conferences in a big way in 2022, with two opportunities for members to participate.

"SCOTS ABROAD" RESET FOR JULY 2022

The Covid-19 pandemic forced ECSSS to abandon plans for our conference on "Scots Abroad" at the University of Liverpool in late July and early August 2021. But this time, instead of putting an abbreviated version of the conference online, we are rescheduling the conference to the summer of 2022 at almost the identical time—28–30 July—and holding a different, one-day event online this summer (see below). Hosted by the University of Liverpool's Eighteenth-Century Worlds Research Centre, the "Scots Abroad" conference will have fundamentally the same description and Call for Papers as last year. But the 2022 conference will have the added advantage of connections with two other events that will be held in greater Liverpool at about the same time: a two-day symposium at the beginning of the conference sponsored by the AHRC-funded project on Libraries, Reading Communities and Cultural Formation in the 18th-Century Atlantic, and the joint meeting of the British Association for Romantic Studies (BARS) and the North American Society for the Study of Romanticism (NASSR) on "New Romanticisms," at Edge Hill University from 2 to 5 August.

The "Scots Abroad" conference will highlight the roles of Scots in England, Ireland, Europe, and the British Empire, including several who made their way to Liverpool—such as Robert Burns's editor Dr. James Currie and merchant, MP, and slave owner Sir John Gladstone. The conference will also mark the tercentenary of the births in 1721 of the global historian William Robertson and the English emigré Tobias Smollett, and the tercentenary of the death of Alexander Selkirk, the castaway who inspired *Robinson Crusoe*. Professor John Mee of the University of York will deliver a plenary address on the impact of Scots on the "Transpennine Enlightenment" in northern English towns. There will also be excursions to some of the many points of eighteenth-century interest in Liverpool.

The deadline for the submission of proposals for papers and panels is 15 November 2021. For more information, see the Call for Papers on the Scots Abroad Conference website, or contact Mark Towsey at m.r.m.towsey@liverpool.ac.uk.

OTTAWA IN OCTOBER 2022

In addition to the Liverpool conference on "Scots Abroad" in July 2022, ECSSS will also participate in the annual meeting of the Canadian Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies on 13–15 October 2022. The theme of the conference is "Experimenting/ Experiencing Modernity," but as always work on all areas of eighteenth-century studies will be welcome. Held at the Delta Hotel Ottawa City Centre—centrally located near Parliament Hill, the National Gallery of

Canada, the University of Ottawa, and other leading attractions—the conference will feature plenary talks by Professor Nicholas Cronk, Director of the Voltaire Foundation at Oxford University, and Professor Leith Davis of Simon Fraser University, author of *Mediating Cultural Memory in Britain and Ireland* (Cambridge U. Press, forthcoming in 2021). Anyone interested in organizing a Scottish-themed panel or round table at this conference should write to Richard Sher at rbsher6@gmail.com or Pam Perkins at pam.perkins@umanitoba.ca. Proposals for individual papers on Scottish topics that will be integrated into the general program are also encouraged. Further information and a Call for Papers will be available this summer on the CSECS Conference Website.

"RACE & ENLIGHTENMENT" ONLINE

On **20 July 2021 (3 PM UK time)** ECSSS will co-sponsor a one-day online event on "Race and Enlightenment," followed by the ECSSS annual membership meeting and a program of new research. Hold the date for this purpose!

The "Race and Enlightenment" event, co-sponsored by the Institute for the Study of Scottish Philosophy and the University of Liverpool's Eighteenth-Century Worlds Research Centre, and hosted by Mark Towsey, will feature a pre-recorded lecture by Gordon Graham (Henry Luce III Professor of Philosophy and Arts Emeritus, Princeton Theological Seminary) titled "How to Think about Enlightenment and Racism," which will be accessible in advance. On the day of the event, a 90-minute Zoom session will begin with Q&A on Gordon Graham's lecture, followed by a roundtable on "Race and the Scottish Enlightenment" with Stephen Mullen (University of Glasgow), Silvia Sebastiani (École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales), and Felix Waldmann (University of Cambridge), moderated by John Cairns (University of Edinburgh). Then James Foster, the director of ISSP, will present Gordon Graham with the ECSSS Lifetime Achievement Award.

After a short break, the ECSSS AGM will be chaired by ECSSS President Craig Smith, beginning at 5 PM UK time. At this meeting the Board will present a proposal for reinvigorating and expanding the society's book series as an alternative to establishing a new journal (see the story below). We hope a large number of members will be in attendance.

Following the AGM, Mark Towsey will moderate a program of new research on eighteenth-century Scotland by post-graduates and early career researchers, from 6:00 to 7:30 PM UK time.

Access to the pre-recorded lecture and online events will be by Eventbrite Registration. Further details can be found at Race and Enlightenment.

SMITH & PERKINS HEAD ECSSS

At the 2020 annual membership meeting, held online on 7 August, Craig Smith (social & political sciences, U. of Glasgow) and Pam Perkins (literature, U. of Manitoba) were elected to two-year terms as President and Vice President and four-year terms on the Executive Board. Moira Hansen (Scottish literature, U. of Glasgow) and Constance Vassiliou (political science, U. of Missouri) were elected to two-year terms as Members-at-Large. Leith Davis (literature, Simon Fraser U.) and Ned Landsman (history, Stony Brook U.) were reelected to four-year terms on the Board, and Deidre Dawson (French literature, independent scholar) stepped down at the end of her term after many years of valuable service on the Board.

The AGM featured a lively discussion of the proposal to start a new journal. After many pros and cons were raised by the members in attendance, it was decided that the Board would submit proposals to several academic publishers.

PLAN TO REVITALIZE ECSSS BOOK SERIES

After much consideration and debate, the ECSSS Executive Board has decided to bring to the annual membership meeting on 20 July a proposal for revitalizing and expanding the society's book series with Bucknell University Press, ECSSS Studies in Eighteenth-Century Scotland, as an alternative to starting a new journal. This was not an easy decision. The Board received three excellent offers for publishing the journal from Edinburgh University Press in Scotland, University of Liverpool Press in England, and Penn State University Press in the USA. However, after careful consideration of points raised at the last two AGMs, as well as by the ad hoc committee formed in 2019 to study the feasibility of a new journal, it was decided that a revitalized and expanded book series, consisting of thematic multi-author volumes, would be likely to provide more opportunities for intellectual development and to bring the society more distinction, with greater flexibility and less uncertainty and financial strain. Encouragement from Bucknell University Press also helped the Board to reach this decision. The society has produced ten well-reviewed volumes in the series in thirty-one years, but with new co-editors and renewed commitment, it should be possible to increase both the rate of production and the range of topics covered while maintaining or raising the quality of the volumes. Any members with ideas for new volumes in the series should contact the Executive Secretary.

As a result of this decision, the Board will recommend keeping membership dues at their current level, instead of raising them, as a new journal would have necessitated. Dues for post-graduate students and unwaged early career researchers will remain free indefinitely.

ASSOCIATION AND ENLIGHTENMENT

The tenth volume in the ECSSS Studies in Eighteenth-Century Scotland book series—*Association and Enlightenment: Scottish Clubs and Societies, 1700–1830*, edited by Mark C. Wallace and Jane Rendall—was published by Bucknell University Press in December 2020 (see the review in this issue). The book has a

foreword by Christopher A. Whatley, a comprehensive introduction by the editors, and chapters by David Allan on Scottish Enlightenment conceptualizations of associations, Bob Harris on buildings and associations in provincial Scottish towns, Jacqueline Jenkinson on medical societies, Ralph McLean on Glasgow clubs, James J. Caudle on James Boswell's "Soaping Club," Rhona Brown on the "Bohemian Club," Corey E. Andrews on Robert Burns and freemasonry, Martyn J. Powell on fictional clubs in Ireland and Scotland, Rosalind Carr on student societies and masculinity, and Jane Rendall on women's associations. The book has been handsomely produced and is available to ECSSS members in paperback for a very reasonable discount price by entering the member discount code BSCOTT19 in the appropriate place: *Association and Enlightenment* USA ($26.97), *Association and Enlightenment* UK/World (£21.30), *Association and Enlightenment* Canada ($33.57).

THE 18TH-CENTURY SCOTTISH GARDEN

Chapter proposals are invited for *The Eighteenth-Century Scottish Garden*, a projected volume in the ECSSS Studies in Eighteenth-Century Scotland book series published by Bucknell University Press. Like all volumes in the series, this one is meant to be wide-ranging and interdisciplinary, and to cover a variety of aspects of the topic over the course of the long eighteenth century. Among the suggested areas for contributions are garden design and implementation; gardens and Scottish literature; the philosophy of gardening; biographical studies of key figures; Scottish gardens in England, the Americas, and elsewhere; and gardens in regard to everyday life, tourism, landscape, architecture, print culture, clubs and associations, plant introductions, the nursery trade, and other key themes. Please send a one-to-two-page synopsis and a one-page cv by 1 August 2021 to Christopher Dingwall, Vice Chairman and Honorary Research Adviser of Scotland's Garden and Landscape Heritage, at dingwall@guidelines.scot. Chapters should be 7000–8000 words (including notes), and synopses should include information about any proposed illustrations. Completed drafts should be submitted by 1 August 2022, using American spelling and punctuation and the stylistic conventions in the Chicago Manual of Style, as found in earlier volumes in the series.

GLASGOW ENLIGHTENMENT REPRINT

Birlinn Ltd. of Edinburgh has announced plans to publish in October 2021 a new edition of *The Glasgow Enlightenment*, a collection of twelve essays edited by Andrew Hook and Richard Sher. First published by Tuckwell Press in 1995 as the fourth volume in the ECSSS Studies in Eighteenth-Century Scotland book series, and long out of print, the collection developed out of the society's first major conference, in Glasgow in 1990. The Birlinn edition will feature a new bibliographical preface by Richard Sher, which discusses the literature on the Glasgow Enlightenment during the quarter of a century since the book's original publication.

DAICHES–MANNING FELLOWSHIP NEWS

In October 2020 the ECSSS Executive Board renegotiated its agreement with the University of Edinburgh and the American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies in order to increase the size of the stipend that fellows receive. In the original plan, fellows received approximately £2000 (provided equally by ECSSS and the American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies) for a period of study at the Institute for Advanced Studies in the Humanities at the University of Edinburgh (IASH). In the new plan, fellows receive a stipend of £1300 per month, for a minimum of two months and a maximum of three months, so that the maximum award is now £3900—almost twice as much as previously. In this new arrangement, ASECS's contribution to the fellowship (for which we remain extremely grateful) remains unchanged; the increase is due to the generosity of ECSSS members, whose contributions, coupled with the accumulating interest, raised the amount in the fellowship fund to a level sufficient for supporting the stipend increase. Thank you! Further details on the fellowship are available at Daiches-Manning Fellowship.

DAICHES–MANNING FELLOWS

The 2021 recipient of the ECSSS/ASECS Daiches–Manning Memorial Fellowship is Rachael Scally. Rachael was educated at Trinity College Dublin and the University of Oxford, where she received a DPhil in history in July 2020. Her thesis, "Practising the Irish Enlightenment: The Role of Medical Practitioners in Ireland's Learned Societies and Republic of Letters, 1683–1801," is now being revised for publication in Boydell & Brewer's Irish Historical Monographs series. Rachael plans to take up her fellowship at IASH during the last quarter of this year, pursuing a project titled "Slavery, Colonialism and the Edinburgh Medical School in the Long Eighteenth Century." Her research fits well with IASH's three-year (2021–24) project on Decoloniality.

The 2020 Daiches–Manning Fellow, Alasdair Macfarlane, was unfortunately forced to shift his focus because his "residence" at IASH during spring 2020 was virtual due to the Covid-19 pandemic. Unable to visit the Edinburgh archives to examine the papers of the Company of Scotland Trading to Africa and the Indies in regard to the Darien Scheme, as originally planned, he wisely altered his project to take advantage of accessible sources. His well-received Zoom presentation on "contemporary counter-narratives to the Darien scheme" was part of IASH's virtual seminar series, about which Alasdair commented in his post-fellowship report: "I came to really rely on the weekly seminars conducted over zoom as an opportunity to meet my fellow Fellows and to participate in research exchanges during a time of relative isolation." Alasdair's positive experience as a virtual

fellow confirmed the decision of the ECSSS Executive Board (formalized in the renegotiated fellowship agreement discussed above) to provide stipends to Daiches–Manning Fellows if emergency measures should force IASH to close down temporarily.

ECSSS AT ASECS

After a hiatus from ASECS in 2021, ECSSS is proposing a panel at the 2022 ASECS meeting in Baltimore (31 March–2 April). The panel, suggested by Leith Davis and chaired Rivka Swenson, is "Race, Empire, and Eighteenth-Century Scotland." Contributions are invited on topics such as the participation of Scots in British imperial projects, including the transatlantic slave trade; the creation of racialized representations in Scottish philosophical, literary, and medical texts; and Scottish encounters with indigenous peoples. Those interested in participating should look for the listing of this panel in the seminar list on the ASECS website. Or write directly to Leith at leith@sfu.ca or Rivka at rswenson@vcu.edu.

18TH-CENTURY SCOTLAND NOW ONLINE

All back issues of the society's annual newsletter, *Eighteenth-Century Scotland*, are now available in the Publications section of the ECSSS Website. The series begins with the first issue in Spring 1987 and currently extends through the Spring 2020 issue (no. 34). The present issue and future ones will each be posted after a time lag. Each issue is searchable, and a plan is underway to add a comprehensive, searchable contents index.

OLD WAYS NEW ROADS

Old Ways New Roads: Travels in Scotland 1720–1832, The Hunterian Museum's major exhibition originally scheduled for August–November 2020, will soon launch as an online exhibition. It features paintings, prints, drawings, maps and more, addressing the impact of Scotland's new transportation infrastructure on the development of travel, tourism, and topographical descriptions between 1720 and 1832. *Old Ways New Roads* will take users on a journey around many of Scotland's best known locations, following in the footsteps of eighteenth-century travelers. Transferring what was originally conceived as a physical exhibition to an online format will allow The Hunterian to provide multiple layers of interpretation, which would be more difficult to achieve within the constraints of a traditional three-dimensional environment. While introducing the research and stories that underpin the exhibition to a much broader audience, the online platform will also offer visitors the opportunity to undertake their own virtual journey around Scotland.

Accompanying the exhibition is a new publication of the same title, edited by Anne Dulau Beveridge of The Hunterian and John Bonehill (art history) and Nigel Leask (English language and literature) of the University of Glasgow faculty—to be reviewed in the Spring 2022 of *Eighteenth-Century Scotland*. Another component of the project was a series of Zoom talks by the contributors to the volume, from 16 February to 20 April. Recorded versions of several of the talks can be experienced at the project's website, Old Ways New Roads. Yet another part of the project was a delightful "Musical Tour of the Highlands" by four ECSSS members—Nigel Leask, Karen McAulay, Kirsteen McCue, and Bill Zachs—originally presented via Zoom on 16 March and now viewable on the project website.

BOOKS AND BORROWING PROJECT

Books and Borrowing is a digital humanities project, funded by the Arts and Humanities Research Council (AHRC), that is digitizing and transcribing the extant borrowers' registers from sixteen partner libraries throughout Scotland, ranging from large university libraries to small private libraries. Led by Katie Halsey of the University of Stirling and Matthew Sangster of the University of Glasgow, with three postdoctoral Research Fellows and two doctoral candidates, as well as a Digital Humanities Research Officer, Brian Aitken (Glasgow), the project aims to create the largest-ever evidence base relating to book borrowing and circulation.

Although data are still being collected, tentative conclusions suggest some surprises. Among university students at Glasgow and St. Andrews, as well as students at Edinburgh High School, the historian of the ancient world and of education Charles Rollin, along with another French historian, Paul de Rapin-Thoyras, were extremely popular during the third quarter of the eighteenth century. In fiction, a number of Scottish novels, such as John Moore's *Zeluco* (1789) and Jane Porter's *The Scottish Chiefs* (1810), enjoyed great popularity, and Mary Brunton's *Self-Control* (1811) was checked out far more than the novels of Brunton's English contemporary, Jane Austen. But the extraordinary popularity of the works of Walter Scott, and their enormous impact on early nineteenth-century literary culture, is very much in tune with existing scholarship. News of the research findings is posted on the Books and Borrowing Weekly Blog.

TEXTUAL EDITING AT BURNS CENTRE

The Centre for Robert Burns Studies at the University of Glasgow will take up occupancy of a Textual Editing Lab at the university's new Advanced Research Centre in early 2022. This will accommodate ongoing work on the Glasgow Edition of the Works of Robert Burns published by Oxford University Press, as well as other editing projects, and also work by the Glasgow team on manuscript authenticity, which has been piloted in partnership with colleagues in the physical sciences. Work already undertaken has established chemical ink signatures for Robert Burns and his most notorious forger of the late nineteenth century, "Antique" Smith. To be built upon too is the endeavor led by Ronnie Young on the Burns Paper Database on

behalf of the nationally recognized museum and archival partnership, "Burns Scotland," convened by Gerry Carruthers. The database curates watermarks, paper and handwriting samples, and other physical features of Burns's manuscripts. The new lab will also form a convenient base for other aspects of the Centre's scholarship, including work on new virtual reality, led by Pauline Mackay, and on material culture and memory, led by Murray Pittock.

BURNS CHRONICLE EXPANDS

The *Burns Chronicle* is now being published twice a year as a peer-reviewed journal. Gerry Carruthers joins Bill Dawson as one of the co-editors, while Moira Hansen takes on the role of reviews editor. Edinburgh University Press will now publish the journal on behalf of the World Burns Federation, under whose aegis the journal was begun in 1892. The first of the new EUP issues appeared in March 2021, and a specially curated retrospective online issue was also launched by EUP to mark "Burns season." Submissions of essays of 5000–8000 words are sought, and shorter notes and documents are also invited. The new iteration of the journal looks to cover not only the literary criticism and history of Robert Burns but also areas of book history and the many reputational and multimedia performative aspects of Burns in his cultural afterlife.

NEW 18TH-CENTURY BOOK SERIES

Greg Clingham invites inquiries and proposals for monographs, editions, biographies, bibliographies, collections of essays, and other forms of scholarship on eighteenth-century Scotland for a new series with Clemson University Press (in association with Liverpool University Press), Eighteenth-Century Moments. Greg can be contacted at clingham@bucknell.edu.

HUME'S *HISTORY OF ENGLAND* PROJECT

ECSSS members Marc Hanvelt (Carleton University), James A. Harris (University of St. Andrews), Mark G. Spencer (Brock University), and Mikko Tolonen (University of Helsinki) have contracted with Oxford University Press to edit a critical edition of David Hume's *History of England*. They will produce an accurate text with a full record of Hume's alterations, providing explanatory annotation and fleshing out Hume's footnotes and bibliography in order to give a fuller picture of the sources Hume used. Scheduled for completion in 2030, this project will fill a major gap in The Clarendon Edition of the Works of David Hume.

FIRST *HUME STUDIES* ESSAY PRIZE

The Hume Society invites submissions for the first Hume Studies Essay Prize, to be awarded in 2022. The biennial competition is open to PhD candidates as well as recent (i.e., within ten years of the degree) PhDs. The winning paper will be published with acknowledgment in *Hume Studies*, and the author will receive $1000. *Hume Studies,* the interdisciplinary journal of the Hume Society, publishes work on all aspects of Hume and his world. To be eligible for the first prize, papers must be submitted to the journal for publication before 2 August 2021. Papers will undergo the regular anonymized referee review process, and those deemed competitive by the editors will also undergo a separate anonymous review by a subset of members of the Editorial Board, who will decide the competition winner. Papers not selected for the award may still be accepted for publication. The first winning essay will appear in an issue of *Hume Studies* next year. Please direct questions to the incoming editors, Elizabeth Radcliffe (eradcliffe@wm.edu) or Mark Spencer (mspencer@brocku.ca).

"VIRTUAL VOLUMES" AT NRS

Members of ECSSS will be delighted to learn that National Records of Scotland (NRS) launched its new Virtual Volumes service in March. Virtual Volumes is a modified online version of the image viewing facility in use in the NRS's search rooms, enabling readers to view images of historical records by registering at ScotlandsPeople. As in the search rooms, the online records are free to view, but there is a small charge for downloading images.

First to go onto the site were over six thousand volumes of the Church of Scotland's synod, presbytery, and kirk session records. These contain details of key events in communities across the country between 1559 and 1900 and offer remarkable insights into the everyday lives of ordinary Scots. The kirk sessions created many records of interest for family history, oversaw basic education, and disciplined parishioners for what today would be called antisocial behavior, such as drunkenness, cursing, fornicating, and breaking the Sabbath. Their records include accounts of how people dealt with exceptional historical events such as wars, witchcraft trials, epidemics, crop failures, and extreme weather. For example, the Inveresk records for 6 April 1796 (ref: CH2/531/70) show how poor funds were raised during 1795 by organizing card assemblies and dress balls to exploit the presence of the fencibles and cavalry camped in Musselburgh. Presbytery and synod records show much more of the higher governance of the church, and these courts heard appeals against sentences in the more complicated cases coming from the parishes. At the resumption of the Napoleonic Wars, the Dalkeith Presbytery minutes for 24 August 1803 (ref: CH2/424/17) contain a lengthy "solemn address on the current state of public affairs and the duty of the people on such a crisis." Drawn up by Rev. Alexander Carlyle and meant to be read from all the local pulpits, it gives a fascinating insight into concepts of Scottish and British patriotism.

The site can be searched by place, year, record creator, and record type. The records themselves are presented as individual volumes for readers to

browse. While they are unindexed, they are electronically "way-pointed" by a contents page, with each volume divided into years to allow easier searching. The image viewer allows readers to reduce or enlarge the images, as well as adjust contrast.

This is a major initiative by NRS, and there are already over one million images in the system. For the next few months our focus will be on adding more church volumes, and eventually the records of the General Assembly and secession churches. But this is only the start. Over time we intend to add historic records from Scottish civil and criminal courts as well as many other series, including both individual and bundled records. Inevitably it will not be possible to upload some categories of documents because of data protection, copyright issues, or restrictions on the reproduction of privately owned material. Overall, however, this service is now transforming the opportunities for research on all aspects of Scotland's history by readers unable to get to our Edinburgh buildings.

David J. Brown, Head of Archival Innovation and Development, NRS

OSSIAN: WARRIOR POET

Scottish artist Eileen Budd has teamed up with publisher Alice Sage of Wide Open Sea to produce a new illustrated edition of James Macpherson's Ossian. Besides the text, the edition will feature twenty color illustrations based on archeological, linguistic, and geological research, hand-drawn maps showing the locations and routes of events in the poems, family trees for the main characters, new introductions and commentaries for each chapter, and a comprehensive index. The price is £40 for the softcover, but until publication this summer it can be preordered for £30.

DECOLONIZING SCOTTISH STUDIES AT SFU

On 17 April the Centre for Scottish Studies at Simon Fraser University hosted a remote panel discussion on "Decolonizing Scottish Studies." The event began with a presentation by SFU English MA student Alyssa Bridgman on the construction of the cultural memory of Simon Fraser, a Scottish–Canadian "explorer" who has been forgotten and remembered at various points in Canadian history since his original journey in 1808. Alyssa pointed out how Fraser's story has involved the occlusion of indigenous memory, illustrating her talk with images from her digital humanities project: Simon Fraser: Sites of Cultural Memory and Amnesia. From a focus on British Columbia, the panel next moved virtually across the Atlantic to hear from Emma Bond of St. Andrews University and Michael Morris of the University of Dundee on Scotland as a hub of imperial commerce in the nineteenth century and on the work that Scottish museums such as the V&A Dundee are doing to address Scotland's colonial legacy (see the Transnational Scotland project for further details). Finally, Nisga'a scholar Amy Parent/Noxs Ts'aawit (Mother of the Raven Warrior Chief) of the University of British Columbia brought the discussion back to local British Columbia connections and to present-day colonial legacies as she told the story of the removal of her family pole, the Niis Joohl pole, in the early twentieth century. The pole was sold to and is currently on display in the National Museum of Scotland. Amy Parent is working to repatriate the pole as well as to replace it with a newly carved pole. The "Decolonizing Scottish Studies" panel attracted an audience of 135 people, with high attendance from Vancouver and Edinburgh but also including individuals from as far away as the Shetland Islands, Sweden, Italy, and New Zealand. SFU's Centre for Scottish Studies will be organizing further events designed to advance the work of decolonization.

Leith Davis, SFU Centre for Scottish Studies

MRS. MONTAGU'S LETTERS TO BEATTIE

The Aberdonian poet and philosopher James Beattie maintained a long epistolary relationship with his friend and patron, the London bluestocking Elizabeth Montagu. On 10 May 2021 the Elizabeth Montagu Correspondence Online project at Swansea University held a Zoom launch of Montagu's letters to Beattie, consisting of 114 items from 1771 to 1798, mostly from the James Beattie Papers at University of Aberdeen. As many of Beattie's letters to Mrs. Montagu have been published in Sir William Forbes's biography of Beattie (1806) and in Roger Robinson's edition of *The Correspondence of James Beattie* (2004), it is now possible to track both sides of this fascinating correspondence.

EDINBURGH GAZETTEER ONLINE

In 2017 Rhona Brown of the University of Glasgow completed a project that has not been properly noticed in this periodical. As a result of her efforts, with support from the Royal Society of Edinburgh, the Mitchell Library, and the National Library of Scotland, it is now possible to access all issues of the *Edinburgh Gazetteer*, a radical newspaper that flourished from November 1792 to January 1794. Besides containing a fully searchable text of the newspaper, the website The Edinburgh Gazetteer: Radical Networks and Journalism in 1790s Scotland includes useful background material, a map of reform societies, and a short bibliography.

WORLD LIT CONGRESS POSTPONED

The International Association for Scottish Literatures has postponed the Third World Congress of Scottish Literatures at Charles University in Prague, Czech Republic, to 22–26 June 2022. Originally scheduled for 2020, and postponed to February 2001, the congress had to change its date yet again as a result of the Covid-19 pandemic. The theme of the congress is "Transnationalism and Minor Cultures," approached from the interrelated perspectives of (1) empires, imagined communities, and social, economic, and cultural exchanges, and (2) the importance of Celtic literatures and cultures for the internal dynamic and transnational functioning of Scottish literatures.

DIGITIZING THE LYON IN MOURNING

In collaboration with the National Library of Scotland and Simon Fraser University's Digital Humanities Innovation Lab, Leith Davis is spearheading the Digital Humanities Project on The Lyon in Mourning manuscript by Robert Forbes (NLS Adv. MS.32.6.16-26). The manuscript has been digitized, and, as part of her Digital Research Fellowship at the Institute for Advanced Studies in the Humanities at the University of Edinburgh, Leith is analyzing the contents, using both qualitative (archival research and close analysis) and quantitative (digital humanities) methodologies.

YALE TERMINATES BOSWELL EDITIONS

After six years of funding cutbacks and staff reductions, the Yale University administration has finally closed (effective 30 June 2021) one of the most renowned editing projects of the past century, The Yale Editions of the Private Papers of James Boswell. So ends—in its current form— this celebrated enterprise after more than seventy years of producing high-quality editions, beginning in 1950 with Frederick A. Pottle's best-selling *Boswell's London Journal, 1762–1763*. That volume was the first in the "trade" edition of Boswell's journals which concluded with its thirteenth volume in 1989, published by McGraw-Hill in North America and Heinemann in the UK. The project has more recently focused on the "research" edition of the journals, correspondence, and the manuscript edition of Boswell's *Life of Samuel Johnson*, (as well as a three-volume *Catalogue* of the Boswell Papers at Yale, which appeared in 1993)—co-published by Edinburgh University Press and Yale University Press. The four-volume *Life of Johnson* manuscript edition, completed in 2019, is called "essential for anyone working on Boswell or Johnson" in Jack Lynch's review essay in this issue (p. 18). One volume of the journals and nine volumes of correspondence have been published in the research series, with a tenth volume—*The Correspondence of James Boswell and Sir William Forbes of Pitsligo*, edited by Richard B. Sher—now in the press. Edinburgh University Press is committed to publishing the volumes of journals and correspondence now underway in the research edition, and it is open to considering publication of projected but unassigned volumes in the series. Decisions are yet to be announced by the Yale librarians about the future disposition of materials currently held in the "Boswell Office" in Sterling Memorial Library at Yale, where the Yale Boswell Editions has been headquartered since the 1940s.

IN MEMORIAM: VINCENZO MEROLLE (1941–2018)

We learned belatedly that Vincenzo Merolle passed away on 18 February 2018 at the age of 77. Known chiefly for his work on Adam Ferguson, Merolle was a spirited presence at ECSSS conferences. He took great pride in the fact that he was born in Arpino, the village of Cicero's birth. For many years, he taught politics at the University of Rome, "La Sapienza," retiring only well into the first decade of the new millennium. His two-volume edition of Ferguson's *Correspondence* from 1745 to 1816 appeared in 1995, followed by *The Manuscripts of Adam Ferguson* (2006). He and I edited two volumes of scholarly essays, *Adam Ferguson: History, Progress and Human Nature* (2008) and *Adam Ferguson: Philosophy, Politics and Society* (2009). Some years earlier he had published, with an introduction in Italian, an edition of texts he regarded as the handiwork of John Millar, the *Letters of Crito* and *Letters of Sidney* (1984). His studies of Ferguson and Millar continued with the appearance of his *Saggio su Ferguson, con un Saggio su Millar* (2000). After retirement from teaching, he published a newsletter, *2000: The European Journal*, labored energetically on a multilingual dictionary (a first volume, *The European Dictionary,* A–C, appeared in 2013), and continued his research into Cicero and the eighteenth century. He had a talent for languages, once confessing that his English was entirely self-taught. He also had a knack for aggravating and endearing. He worked hard, sought the good, and remained devoted to Adam Ferguson and the study of eighteenth-century morals and politics.

Eugene Heath, State U. of New York at New Paltz

IN MEMORIAM: HOWARD D. WEINBROT (1936–2021)

Distinguished literary scholar Howard D. Weinbrot died on 19 January 2021 at the age of 84. According to a very full account of his scholarly career that appeared in the March 2021 issue of East-Central ASECS's *Eighteenth-Century Intelligencer*, he was diagnosed with Covid-19 on 31 December 2020, suffered cardiac arrest on New Year's Day, was placed in intensive care, and did not recover. Howard was the Vilas Research Professor of English Emeritus at the University of Wisconsin, Madison. His list of publications and accomplishments is long and can be found in other obituaries. He was an early member of the American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies and a longtime member of ECSSS. His interest in eighteenth-century Scottish studies was focused on what he called "Celtic Scotland," as discussed in the climax of one of his most important works, *Britannia's Issue: The Rise of British Literature from Dryden to Ossian* (1993). As a thoroughgoing Johnsonian, Howard was naturally skeptical, if not antagonistic, toward the Ossianic poetry of James Macpherson, whom he regarded as "almost certainly a fabricator, plagiarist, and scoundrel" (p. 478). Yet in a clever twist, *Britannia's Issue* argues that Ossian and Johnson were part of the same "cacophonous harmony" (p. 556) that established "British Literature" as a distinct entity. Because Macpherson's Ossianic poetry was presented in a "familiar and safely classical"—which is to say, English—manner (p. 542), it achieved a result that was productively paradoxical: "affirming Scottish genius, history, and identity while helping Macpherson and

Scotland move toward the south" (p. 556). In this way, a case was made for Macpherson's Ossian playing a crucial role in bringing about the cultural union of England and Scotland, quite apart from the issue of "authenticity."

Richard B. Sher, NJIT and Rutgers U., Newark

MEMBERS ON THE MOVE

New member **Kendra Asher** received a PhD in economics from George Mason U. in May with a dissertation on "The Esoteric Writing of David Hume"… **Gerry Carruthers** will serve as co-editor of the *Burns Chronicle*; in November 2020 he gave online (on behalf of himself and Martyn Jones) the annual Glasgow U. Thomas Muir Lecture on Muir's Latin Faculty of Advocates' admission thesis on slavery (1787)…**Jim Caudle** has joined the Allan Ramsay Editions on the *Ever Green* team at U. of Glasgow, in addition to his work on the correspondence of Robert Burns…**Greg Clingham** is now Professor of English Emeritus at Bucknell U. (see the notice in this issue on his new book series)...on 14 May the Scottish Writers in the 19th Century group at the U. of Edinburgh sponsored an online talk by **Ian Duncan** on the evolution of "Scott's Ghost-seeing" from *Waverley* to later novels such as *The Bride of Lammermoor* and *The Monastery*…**Matthew Eddy** has been promoted to a professorship in the history and philosophy of science at the U. of Durham…in November 2020 **Clarisse Godard Desmarest** passed her Habilitation à Diriger des Recherches at the Sorbonne with a dossier titled "Architecture, patrimoine et nation: enjeux identitaires en Écosse, 17th–21st siècles;" in September she will begin an EU Marie Curie individual fellowship on "The Architecture of William Burn," and she is organizing the Congress of the Société Française d'Études Écossaises in Amiens, 7–8 October 2021…**James Foster** has been promoted to associate professor of philosophy and theology at the U. of Sioux Falls…in 2020 **Katherine Grenier** co-edited with Amanda R. Mushal *Cultures of Memory in the Nineteenth Century: Consuming Commemoration* (Palgrave); an interview with Katherine and Amanda was recently featured at New Books Network...**Knud Haakonssen** has taken up an honorary professorship of intellectual history at the Saxo Institute in the U. of Copenhagen, but he continues his active roles at both the U. of Erfurt and the U. of St. Andrews…new member **Tabea Hachstrasser** is a PhD candidate in history of science and ideas at Umeå U. in Sweden, working on popular Enlightenment ideas in the Scottish Lowlands…**Derek Jane** received his PhD from the Maritime Historical Studies at Exeter U. in 2020 with a thesis on "Smuggling in South East Scotland, c.1750–1790: John and David Nisbet and Their Associates"… **Elizabeth Kraft** is now professor emerita of English at the U. of Georgia…new member **Jamie Kelly** received his PhD in history from Glasgow U. in 2020 with a thesis on the Society in Scotland for Propagating Christian Knowledge and education during the period 1690–1735…**Ned Landsman** is retiring this summer as professor of history at Stony Brook U.… new member **Felicity Loughlin**, Research Fellow at the Institute of Intellectual History at the U. of St. Andrews, has been awarded a Leverhulme Early Career Fellowship for a study of unbelief in Scotland...**Cristina Martinez** is co-editor of a forthcoming volume titled *Female Printmakers, Printsellers and Publishers in the Eighteenth Century: The Imprint of Women in Graphic Media, 1735–1830*… new member **Wendy McGlashan** completed her PhD at Aberdeen U. in 2020 with a thesis on "'A New Species of Liberty': John Kay's Edinburgh Portraits, 1781–1822"…new member **Eamonn O'Keeffe** is a PhD candidate at Oxford U., working on Highland piping and music-making in the British army…**Florence Petroff** received her PhD from U. of Paris 8 in 2020 and will join the History Dept. at U. of La Rochelle in September (see her article in this issue)…**Spartaco Pupo** published in 2020 *Scritti satirici (1750–1760),* a volume of Italian translations of satirical writings that he attributes to David Hume (including *Bellmen's Petition*, *Sister Peg*, and a squib against James Fraser)…**Alasdair Raffe** has been promoted to senior lecturer at Edinburgh U.…economist **Salim Rashid** braved the skies this spring by flying to Dhaka, where he conducted research and kindly volunteered to have his research assistant Rifat Piash help with indexing back issues of *Eighteenth-Century Scotland*…new member **Rachael Scally** received her DPhil from Oxford U. in July 2020 with a thesis on medical practitioners in the Irish Enlightenment...in November 2020 **Patrick Scott** delivered online the Burns Federation St. Andrews Lecture titled Hunting for Burns Manuscripts…**Juliet Shields**'s book *Mary Prince, Slavery, and Print Culture in the Anglophone Atlantic World*, published in April in Cambridge U. Press's new Elements in Eighteenth-Century Connections series, has two chapters on Thomas Pringle, the Scottish poet who emigrated to South Africa and later became Secretary of the Anti-Slavery Society in London…**Mark Spencer** is beginning a five-year term as co-editor of *Hume Studies*… in 2020 **Hideo Tanaka**, recently retired from Aichi-gakuin U., published his Japanese translation of Caroline Robbins's classic, *The Eighteenth-Century Commonwealthman*, and his translation of the first three volumes of J. G. A. Pocock's *Barbarism and Religion* is being published this year by Nagoya U. Press…**Mikko Tolonen** heads an international Academy of Finland project on "The Rise of Commercial Society and Eighteenth-Century Publishing"…**Paul Tonks** has received a fellowship from the Rothermere American Institute in Oxford… new member **Dana Van Kooy**, associate professor of transnational literature at Michigan Technological U., works on the Highland clearances, Scotland and the Americas, and other topics relating to Scotland and the world…**Eric Wehrli, Jr.** retires in June from Canterbury School in Fort Wayne, Indiana, where he chaired the History Dept. for many years.

The Scots' Response to the American Revolution: A North British Vision of Empire, Constitution, and Representation

By Florence Petroff, University of Paris 8

As Linda Colley argues persuasively in *Britons: Forging the Nation, 1707–1837* (1992), "Britishness" was invented in the eighteenth century and has since been superimposed on preexisting identities without either replacing or merging with them. Yet eighteenth-century Scottish elites eagerly engaged in Anglicization while preserving many aspects of their distinctiveness. The contours of the resulting "North British" identity have been defined by Colin Kidd ("North Britishness and the Nature of Eighteenth-Century British Patriotisms," *Historical Journal* 39.2, 1996). Being British was commonly understood throughout the British Empire as enjoying the "English liberties" enshrined in the constitution and protected by the Hanoverian dynasty. Bernard Bailyn, Jack Greene, Pauline Maier, Eliga Gould, and a number of other historians have pointed out that the Thirteen Colonies initially resisted attempts at centralization by Britain in the name of these liberties. Being British also meant taking part in a shared transatlantic culture, as Ned Landsman has shown in *From Colonials to Provincials: American Thought and Culture, 1680–1760* (1997), as well as Brendan McConville in *The King's Three Faces: The Rise and Fall of Royal America, 1688–1776* (2012).

My work explores the notions of Britishness that Scots and colonists forged in the context of the imperial crisis from the enactment of the Stamp Act in 1765 to the Treaty of Paris in 1783. It contends that two distinct, even competing, conceptions of Britishness were shaped by Scots and Americans through processes of identification with England and differentiation with each another. The American Revolution was undoubtedly the catalyst for the emergence of an American identity. Yet before rejecting Britishness, the American Patriots first built up a hybrid identity combining Britishness with Americanness; until the mid-1770s they claimed that they could remain part of the empire while benefiting from the large amount of autonomy that their colonial assemblies had acquired since the late seventeenth century. They asserted their Britishness through differentiation with the French, as all Britons then did, as well as with the Scots. In 1967 Bernard Bailyn briefly mentioned in *The Ideological Origins of the American Revolution* that a version of the conspiracy theory that pervaded the colonies involved former Prime Minister Lord Bute, a Scot accused of secretly manipulating George III and the government against America (pp. 147–48). The question of what Scotland embodied for American revolutionaries has not drawn much attention since then, possibly because Scotland was hardly ever mentioned in American revolutionary literature. It was, however, discussed in the colonial press. Newspapers throughout the Thirteen Colonies, particularly in Virginia, disseminated an image of Scotland as inherently Jacobite and supportive of tyranny and Roman Catholicism. They reveal a different political culture from that of the pamphlets and display a discourse based on disinformation, fantasy, and fear that originated in the English Scottophobic Grub Street rhetoric of John Wilkes and Charles Churchill. The belief in a "Scottish plot" against America waged by Bute, Scottish ministers, and the Scottish nation was in turn appropriated by Americans such as Rev. Ezra Stiles, whose diary entry for 23 July 1777 states: "Let us boldly say, for History will say it, that the whole of this War is so far chargeable to the Scotch Councils, & to the Scotch as a Nation (for they have nationally come into it) as that had it not been for them, this Quarrel had never happened. Or at least they have gloried in the Honor of exciting & conduct[ing] these Measures avowedly by their Earl of Bute behind the Curtain." Scotland was not just considered an enemy to the American Patriots' cause. It was also the antithesis of the Britishness that the Americans identified with through binary oppositions such as Hanover/Stuart, liberty/tyranny, and Protestantism/Catholicism.

Conversely, the Scots considered themselves the opposite of the American rebels and predominantly opposed the American Revolution. The perceptions of the American Revolution in Scottish public opinion were explored by Dalphy Fagerstrom in 1954 ("Scottish Opinion and the American Revolution," *William and Mary Quarterly*, 11.2) and D. B. Swinfen in 1977 ("The American Revolution in the Scottish Press," in *Scotland, Europe, and the American Revolution*, ed. Owen Dudley Edwards and George Shepperson). My approach is based on a more extensive study of the Scottish pamphlet literature in order to investigate the various reasons why the Scots stood against the Americans. At least sixty-six works on America were published either by a Scot or anonymously in Scotland between 1768 and 1784, with a peak of forty-two between 1776 and 1779. Thirty-six authors produced one, two, or three pamphlets, sermons, or books discussing the conflict with the colonies. A number of them took part in the Scottish Enlightenment, including prominent figures such as Adam Smith and Adam Ferguson and less familiar ones such as William Barron. About half of these authors published on a variety of other topics, including religion, history, husbandry, poetry, economic improvement, and literature. They were educated professionals who worked as teachers, lawyers, or clergymen. With the exception of a few officers of the Crown and the loyalists George Chalmers and John McAlpine, none had ever been to America. Some, like George Johnstone, Alexander Wedderburn, and Lord Mansfield, were pursuing careers as politicians, judges, or civil servants in London. Ministers in the Church of Scotland account for almost half these authors, dominated by Moderate Party clergymen such as Alexander Carlyle, George Campbell, Adam Ferguson, Alexander Gerard, and Thomas Somerville. A majority of these Scottish authors argued that the Americans were wrong in declaring themselves independent. They be-

lieved them to be manipulated by a faction of ungrateful American politicians apt to endanger the empire and the well-being of all its inhabitants for the sake of their personal ambitions. Some expected Britain to bring the rebels back to their senses by force, while others believed that the colonists could be convinced by sound reasoning. The Johnstone brothers, who both sat in Parliament in the 1770s, first appeared as "friends of America" when they advocated for the right of the colonists to tax themselves and condemned the Coercive Acts of 1774. George, known as Governor Johnstone, reversed his opinion after the creation of the United States and its alliance with Britain's rival, France. In some of the most thoughtful and articulate pamphlets on the topic, his brother Sir William Pulteney recounted the growing tensions between Britain and its colonies and proposed a peace negotiation in 1779 based on the granting of fiscal and legislative autonomy to the colonies, assuming independence could still be reversed. John Erskine and William Thom in the Popular Party disapproved of the war but did not support the Declaration of Independence. All told, only two Scots openly endorsed American resistance to Britain's policy throughout the Revolution. George Dempster, politician and agricultural improver, expressed his staunch belief that the American Patriots were in the right, even after they seceded from the empire. James Murray, a Presbyterian minister at Newcastle upon Tyne, kept defending the American Patriots in sermons and in *An Impartial History of the Present War in America* (1778).

The Scots did not actually engage in a direct debate with the American pamphleteers, whom they hardly ever quoted or mentioned. Rather, they tried to refute Richard Price's *Observations on the Nature of Civil Liberty* (1776) and other British pamphlets. Thus, they addressed the American controversy as Britons speaking to other Britons, in an attempt to convince them that the American rebellion was unconstitutional and that the empire had to be preserved. The American controversy provided Scottish elites with an opportunity to display their British patriotism. They professed their commitment to the constitution and the principle of parliamentary sovereignty as well as their Hanoverian loyalty. The Americans were accused of being far worse rebels than the Scottish Jacobites in 1745 because they threatened not only the dynasty but also the constitution and "English liberties." The natural rights that the Declaration of Independence cited were considered "an inalienable right to talk nonsense," according to the comments inserted in the text of the Declaration in the *Scots Magazine* of August 1776. The colonists' grievances and claims were seen as a ploy that could not disguise the real motive of Congress: a quest for power. The American republic that pretended to ensure the liberties of its citizens challenged the belief in the perfection of the British constitution which, most Scots believed, remained the only real source of liberty. The Scottish approach to the issue of the American Revolution combined a commitment to Britishness with a desire to promote the interests of the Scottish nation. Sir John Dalrymple and Alexander Carlyle called for the right to establish a Scots militia and to expand recruitment of Highlanders in the army. Robert Alves, Charles Nisbet, and John Stevenson glorified the part played by the Scots, especially the Highlanders, in the patriotic war against the rebels. British patriotism mixed with Scottish patriotism, as in Stevenson's description of the Highlanders in his *Letters in Answer to Dr. Price's Two Pamphlets on Civil Liberty* (1778): "they fought, they bled, and they conquered as Britons" (p. 149).

As Emma Macleod has shown in *British Visions of America, 1775–1820* (2013), American independence met with dismay and disbelief in Britain. Consequently, most of the Scots who published their reactions to the American Revolution from 1776 onward discussed matters that had been settled before 1776 in the eyes of the American Patriots. To the American claim for "no taxation without representation," the Scots answered that not only could the colonists be rightfully taxed by Parliament but also that they were not entitled to reject its authority since they were represented virtually. The empire was described as a community in which each part had to contribute to the defense of the whole through taxation in order to maintain its dominance. Scottish pamphleteers articulated the vision of a centralized empire, united by a unique fiscal system and transatlantic commerce. Adam Smith even suggested in *The Wealth of Nations* (1776) that the colonists should be given the right to elect their own representatives in Parliament, an idea that did not generate much enthusiasm in Great Britain, much less in America. Even though they were not in favor of an imperial Parliament, those who discussed the imperial crisis generally assumed that the empire should somehow be reorganized on the model of the Union.

The concept of representation exemplifies the discrepancy between Scottish and American visions of empire and constitution. The colonists believed they were not represented in the Westminster Parliament because their understanding of representation was based on their political experience within the colonies. Their assemblies were regarded by the American Whigs as the only bodies that represented them. These political bodies had grown into the main institutions in colonial America by enlarging their prerogatives at the expense of governors and councils. Not only were they geographically close, whereas the Westminster Parliament was more than three thousand miles away, but they also defended the interests of their constituents. Bernard Bailyn has argued that the American concept of representation drew on the English medieval notion of representation seen as a form of attorneyship, in which the electors delegated power to the elected. The representatives in the colonial assemblies were accountable to their voters, whose interests they defended, sometimes even receiving instructions from them (*Ideological Origins of the American Revolution*, p. 164). It was a general rule that candidates had to live in the county, parish, or precinct where they were running for an election. In Virginia, they had at least to possess land in the county, as was the case for George Washington when elected to the Virginia House of Burgesses in Frederick County in 1758 even though he lived in the neighboring county of Fairfax (see Richard R. Beeman, *The Varieties of Political Ex-*

perience in Eighteenth-Century America, 2004, p. 39). With an average of 75 percent of the white adult male population having access to the vote, the colonial assemblies had a direct connection with a large part of the community, even though many voters did not care to exert their right. Representation was also conceived on the local scale in eighteenth-century America because the colonists identified first and foremost with their colony. From the failure of Benjamin Franklin's Albany Plan in 1754, the building of a collective American identity and the unification of all colonies was a long, arduous process. It is the conflict with Britain that actually stimulated the creation of the Stamp Act Congress in New York in 1765 and the Continental Congress from 1774. In the American vision of empire, sovereignty was shared, and each colony acted as a state within a confederation under the sole authority of the Crown. There was also the historical precedent of Scotland and England between 1603 and 1707, as Benjamin Franklin argued in 1768 in a letter to his son William and in the press (*The Papers of Benjamin Franklin*, vol. 15, ed. William B. Willcox, 1972, pp. 74–78; A Briton, "Arguments Pro and Con: I," *London Chronicle*, 18–20 October 1768; *Boston Evening-Post,* 11 April 1774, p. 1). Why should America be ruled by the Westminster Parliament, asked John Adams, when Scotland had not been at the time of the union of the crowns: "So the Scots held their lands of him who was then king of England, his heirs and successors, and were bound to allegiance to him, his heirs and successors, but it did not follow from thence that the Scots were subject to the English parliament" (Novanglus, "XII. To the Inhabitants of the Colony of Massachusetts-Bay, 17 April 1775," *Novanglus, and Massachusettensis, or, Political Essays: Published in the Years 1774 and 1775, on the Principal Points of Controversy, between Great Britain and Her Colonies,* 1819, pp. 133–39).

Contrary to the Americans, most eighteenth-century Scots regarded the incorporating union as an improvement compared to the time when they had their own Parliament**.** They conceptualized a notion of representation on the model of Britain, which was not based on the electoral process. In Britain the voting population was much more limited than in America, and it was even more limited in Scotland, where there were fewer than three thousand electors for a population of one million people. The unequal distribution of the franchise within burghs and counties was not considered an issue, for it was understood that MPs were not accountable to their electors since, once elected, they became "representatives of the state at large; not only their own constituents, but every individual member of the community" (*Free Thoughts on the American Contest*, 1776, p. 22). They defended the interests of the whole nation when voting on laws and taxes that everyone was subjected to, including themselves. Representatives were in any case increasingly less connected to the constituency that elected them in eighteenth-century Britain since many did not live there; some 60 Scots even sat for an English or a Welsh constituency between 1760 and 1790, 130 between 1790 and 1820. The Scots thus felt as much under the protection of Parliament against oppression and unfair taxation as the inhabitants of England or Wales, even though they elected only 45 MPs out of 558 in the House of Commons. They were committed to centralization, believing the empire needed a single head to keep all its parts together, and their attitude toward authority was the opposite of American distrust of central power (see Jack P. Greene, *Peripheries and Center: Constitutional Development in the Extended Polities of the British Empire and the United States, 1678–1788,* 1986; Ned C. Landsman, "British Union and American Revolution: Imperial Authority and the Multinational State," in *The American Revolution Reborn*, ed. Patrick Spero and Michael Zuckerman, 2016; Paul Tonks, "Rethinking the Eighteenth Century Province and Periphery: A Historiographical Reflection on Scotland, Scottish Thought, and the Government of the British Atlantic Empire," *Korean Journal of British Studies*, no. 22, Dec. 2009).

Scottish elites believed their interests were better protected in the Westminster Parliament, which provided a stronger counterweight to the Crown's prerogative than they had enjoyed in their pre-Union unicameral Parliament or in local institutions such as town councils. They adopted the notion that virtual representation included the colonists, as George Grenville's government maintained. James Macpherson, then pensioned by the government, argued in *The Rights of Great Britain Asserted against the Claims of America: Being an Answer To the Declaration of the General Congress* (1776) that, like the Americans, most British subjects did not vote, and he concluded: "the truth is, Representation never accompanied Taxation in any State" (p. 4). In his *Letters in Answer to Dr. Price's Two Pamphlets on Civil Liberty*, John Stevenson added that the members of the House of Commons "represent actually and virtually, not only all the inhabitants of this island, but also every individual throughout the colonies" (p. 24). Liberty was not seen as contingent upon the franchise by most Scottish pamphleteers, who contended that Britons were free because they had a Parliament that checked the Crown's power, no matter how it was elected.

Harry T. Dickinson observes in *Liberty and Property: Political Ideology in Eighteenth-Century Britain* (1977) that a movement for electoral reform swept through England from the 1770s onward, partly under the influence of American revolutionary ideas (pp. 217–18). Since they considered the British system of representation as nearly perfect, Scots who wrote about the American controversy did not support that movement, with the exception of James Burgh, a London radical. Burgh's 1500-page work *Political Disquisitions* (1774–75) called for reform that would correct the many flaws and inequalities in the electoral system and reduce the influence of the aristocracy, for example by putting an end to government intrusion in elections and establishing a more equitable electoral franchise at all levels of society. He believed that most people who paid indirect taxes on malt, soap, and other necessities were not represented in Parliament since they could not vote. These radical views were hardly supported in Scotland. The burgh reform movement had connections with the Society for Constitutional Information and

Chistopher Wyvill's Yorkshire Association, but it followed a different path. Its appeal for an enlargement of the ruling elite in Scottish burghs stemmed not from a hope to reform the constitution but from a wish to modernize local institutions, which were seen as archaic compared to those in England.

The Scottish reception of the American Revolution was generally unsympathetic, as the Americans correctly perceived, but it was not rooted in Jacobitism, as the Americans believed. On the contrary, the Scots rejected Whig American thought because it questioned the British conception of liberty and empire that they endorsed. The American notions of natural rights, direct representation, and shared sovereignty within the empire induced the Scots to assert their commitment to the principles of parliamentary sovereignty across the empire, the perfection of the constitution, and loyalty to the Hanoverian dynasty—all fundamental elements of an emerging British identity. The imperial crisis arguably weakened the empire but was also a catalyst for Britishness, which was built not merely in opposition to a French "Other" but also in opposition to an American one.

This article is based on Florence Petroff's doctoral thesis, "Le Miroir atlantique. L'Ecosse et l'Amérique dans la crise impériale: regards croisés et identités hybrides au sein du monde britannique (1765–1783)"/"Scotland and America in the Imperial Crisis: Mutual Perceptions and Hybrid Identities within the Anglo-American World (1765–1783)," for which she was awarded a PhD in history from the University of Paris 8 in 2020. In September 2021 Florence will take up a faculty position in the History Department at the University of La Rochelle. She is planning to publish her thesis in French and a few articles in English. Her research interests focus on the circulation of political thought, opinions, and representations within the British Atlantic world. She would welcome any comments or be happy to engage in a discussion of those topics (florence.petroff@gmail.com).

"All tread upon the kibes of one another": Urban Social Organization in John Millar and Tobias Smollett

By Michael C. Amrozowicz, State University of New York at Albany

Matthew Bramble, the head of a country gentry family on tour through Britain in Tobias Smollett's *Humphry Clinker* (1771; ed. Shaun Regan, 2008), paints a picture of the burgeoning metropolis of London through sensory imagery ("I breathe the steams of endless putrefaction," p. 135), town and country metaphors ("the capital is become an overgrown monster" with a "dropsical head," p. 99), and statistics ("seven years, eleven thousand new houses"; "one sixth part of the natives of this whole extensive kingdom is crowded within the bills of mortality," pp. 99–100). Despite the unsanitary conditions, overcrowding, urban sprawl, and industrial pollution, not all of London's developments were negative according to Bramble: the streets were better paved and lighted, the new streets "spacious, regular, and airy," the new houses "generally convenient," and the newly constructed Blackfriar's bridge (designed by a Scot) "a noble monument of taste and public spirit" (p. 99). He then wonders "how they stumbled upon a work of such magnificence and utility" amidst all the seeming discord and chaos that London and its social institutions had become in the new commercial age (p. 99). Bramble was not alone in his inability to reconcile the organizational patterns of society at large with the uncoordinated actions of the atomistic individuals that composed them, and the language he uses to describe the coherence of large public works projects echoes Adam Ferguson's explanation of the spontaneous evolution of individual societies in *An Essay on the History of Civil Society* (1767; ed. Fania Oz-Salzberger, 2007): "Every step and every movement of the multitude, even in what are termed enlightened ages, are made with equal blindness to the future; and nations stumble upon establishments, which are indeed the result of human action, but not the execution of any human design" (p. 119). According to Ferguson and other Scots historiographers of the eighteenth century such as David Hume, Adam Smith, and John Millar, a self-organizing process was at work in the historical development of human society: from skepticism to the invisible hand to the insensible gradualism of social evolution, the Scots saw the natural world in general, and social activity in particular, as a complex of hidden and infinitely complicated forces.

Historical writing in the eighteenth century was a malleable and porous genre, influenced by and often admitting a vast number of styles, forms, and subjects, and at the same time heavily influencing other genres and forms. Mark Salber Phillips states that in recent literary history, assumptions of "distinct and enduring formal characteristics beneath the fluctuations of literary history" and assumptions "about the unity and fixity of genres have been discarded in favor of approaches emphasizing precisely the opposite qualities of instability, mixture, and historical specificity" (*Society and Sentiment: Genres of Historical Writing in Britain, 1740–1820*, 2000, p. 20). These qualities apply not only to historical writing but also to many other literary forms, and these forms can consequently be seen emerging from historical writing to affect other genres: "history served as a kind of countergenre helping to define a cluster of related literatures," according to Phillips (p. 25). One can see this clustering effect at work both within the genre of historical writing and in history's relation to other forms that we now consider "literary," such as novels of realistic fiction, biography, journal and letter writing, and even journalism. This interplay can be extended to depictions of the various states of social organization in human society, as evidenced by historical and novelistic narratives that treat "phase transitions" between social atomism, customs and manners, and social institutions. In order to represent social complexity in the forms of historical and fictional narratives, the

forms had to adapt to their subject. While it was necessary for history writing to accommodate human social life in the form of globally interconnected dynamic systems, fictional narratives at the same moment began to address the individual's role within these larger systems identified by historiography. In this continuum, where it was posited that atomistic human behavior was somehow related to the emergence of social institutions, each form of writing actively searched for the invisible and insensible mechanisms responsible for these newly discovered relationships. In the interests of truth and factuality, this search was influenced by the natural sciences in the late-seventeenth century and throughout the eighteenth century. If historical and realistic fictional narratives were to present human social life as it existed in the world, they would need to represent the hitherto-unrepresentable: the hidden springs and movements that made it possible for human society to develop into the immensely complex machine that it had become in commercial society.

The development of a science of modeling emergent social structures signaled an evolutionary as opposed to a static vision of society; and while this evolutionary development was thought to take place gradually, the rapid social changes wrought by an increasingly commercial society forced history writing and realistic fiction to specialize in order to represent the new complexity observed in social patterns. New genres were emerging to replace those that were not equipped to apprehend the complexity of modern commercial society or provide accurate descriptions of historical movements. Histories of social organization written by Hume, Smith, Ferguson, Millar, and others appropriated, adapted, and revised many elements of previous historical forms; and more importantly, they performed functions intended to capture the complex, nonlinear social emergences of commercial society. Novels of realistic fiction also became increasingly engaged with narrative models that identified new modes of social emergence of the same types, as identified by Scottish histories of social organization. Eighteenth-century British novelists like Smollett were concerned with the complexity of historical representation: novels of realistic fiction, in order to fulfil their remit of representing true-to-life social relations in complex society, were continuously adapting throughout the eighteenth century. And just like the historians, novelists of realistic fiction such as Smollett, Henry Fielding, and Laurence Sterne were critical of the historiography of their time. Many novels of the period included the phrase "History of" in their titles, which signaled a turn to associate certain types of novels with the long-legitimated genre of history writing.

The remainder of this essay will look at Millar's *An Historical View of the English Government* (1787) and Smollett's *Roderick Random* (1748) and *Humphry Clinker* in order to discover the ways in which these narratives participate in the discourse of social organization and put forward a historiography that accounts for the intersecting scales of social action listed above. Specifically, Millar charts the ways in which cities gradually developed out of villages and towns to meet the material and economic needs of the developing commercial society, while Smollett points out some of the problems and potentialities of urban growth for the individual characters who inhabit his novels. Millar establishes the role of town and city as the center of fruitful exchanges of goods, ideas, and social behaviors that agglomerate and emerge into new and different types of social order, while Smollett is also concerned with the mass migration to Britain's cities and the emergent (dis)ordering caused by the piling up of unintended consequences produced by random social interaction in a bustling commercial society. Given the ways that Millar and other Scottish Enlightenment thinkers allow for the evolution of social institutions, we can read Smollett's novels as participating in the discourse of social organization by showing that an urban environment speeds up the cycle of the creation, maintenance, and decay of customs and manners through individual atomistic behavior, which makes social institutions develop and social evolution happen at much higher rates of speed than in the countryside.

Millar explains the unintended causes that created the social conditions which made possible the birth of the Scottish Enlightenment as a "great ferment excited over the whole nation" (*Historical View*, ed. Mark Salber Phillips and Dale R. Smith, 2006, p. 480). This passage points to the nonlinearity Millar espoused in his historical writing when attempting to represent social complexity. Specifically, social complexity had to be acknowledged as a force that creates types of historical change which cannot be explained through recourse to linear cause-and-effect relationships espoused by previous forms of historiography. Scottish thinkers used the hermeneutic of what we now call spontaneous order to explain human social progress and the consequent movement from simple to more complex social relations and institutions. Millar's "great ferment" is an example of this type of historical explanation, in that the history of the beginnings of the Scottish Enlightenment—itself the social movement responsible for the articulation of the theory of spontaneous order—is shown by Millar to have emerged unpredictably out of a set of unintended consequences. Millar provides a nonlinear explanation of the self-coordinated "boldness of activity" and "literary curiosity" with which the "common mass of people" effected their own emergence into a different social state from the "Roman Catholic superstition" that came before (pp. 480–81). This spontaneous ideological rupture in Millar's non-linear history signifies the process by which historical and fictional narrative structures adapted and evolved to describe the social orders emerging from social phase transitions.

Rarely if ever in Millar's work are progressive social developments attributed to the intention of one person or small groups in the top-down, "Great Legislator" style of historical narrative; instead, social organization happens through unplanned coordination at the local atomistic scale of social interaction. Millar's explanation of the coherence of modern British cities, for example, shows that through gradual local technological increases, or "the progress of the arts," along with the increasing complexity of the division of labor, the peasantry was able to

"acquire opulence" through their own "industry" (p. 237). These spontaneous emergences produced changes in the social order when the "artificers and labourers" subsequently "composed a separate order of men in the community," which then "grew up and were multiplied" and "became the chief part of the inhabitants in those villages where they resided" (p. 164). Over time these villages "were gradually enlarged into towns, of more or less extent according as their situation, or other circumstances, proved more favourable to manufactures" (p. 164). As villages gradually turned into towns, then into cities, the necessary communication and commerce between these entities led to increases in commercial exchange; and from these circumstances, "different places began to excel in manufacturing goods of different kinds;" and in order to effect the exchange of different goods among various geographical regions, "there arose, by degrees, a common *carrier*, upon whom this branch of business was frequently devolved" (p. 165). Thus, Millar traces the circumstances giving rise to the occupation of the "carrier," which evolves into that of the merchant in the commercial age. The concomitant emergence of the division of labor as a coordinating element of society and the rise of manufactures and their centralization in population centers—all of which happen gradually and none of which could have been organized or directed by foresight or planning—led to the spontaneous creation of countless occupations that supported the growing needs of the emerging industries. The agglomeration of these emergences as manifestations of social evolution happens nowhere in Britain more rapidly than in the burgeoning urban centers, and Millar shows that cities are the direct products of these emergences.

In an example of what economists now call "knowledge spillover," Millar's artificers and tradesmen, from their collection into towns, "derived an extreme facility in communicating their sentiments and opinions" (p. 487). The speed of communication in cities is an advantage to spontaneous emergence: "In a populous city, not only the discoveries and knowledge, but the feelings and passions of each individual are quickly and readily propagated over the whole" (p. 487). This is one of the most important passages in Millar's *Historical View* for thinking about how spontaneous order and phase transitions work in his historiography. The "feelings and passions" of "each individual" atomistically communicate the phase transition to "those around him," and each individual in the "common movements" of the group loses his own identity, "the sense of his own danger," and becomes part of the whole (pp. 487–88). The speed with which phase transitions happen in cities is important because not only knowledge, but also feelings and senses, pass from individual to individual "quickly and readily." By contrast, coordination networks in the agricultural countryside occur more slowly "from the limited nature of their undertakings, and from their dispersed and solitary residence," and they tend to "proceed with great caution and timidity, and therefore to advance very slowly in the knowledge of their profession" (p. 488). Millar is showing us here that the speed at which communication networks operate in a city is far more rapid than in the country, where people are less dependent on their neighbors than are city dwellers. Those who are scattered farther apart, often in isolated places not readily accessible to modern modes of transportation and technology, depend less on each other for their survival and thus have less need for cooperation in determining how the community's shared resources—clean water, public health resources, security—are maintained and distributed. When the members of a community live physically closer to each other, and when there are more of them clustered in one location, the "feelings and passions" of "each individual" travel faster between those individuals. An urban environment speeds up the rates at which social orders emerge and evolve as the physical environment more rapidly evolves. Thus, Millar is measuring the speed—the temporal rate—at which certain types of human coordination occur in specific places at specific times in order to represent many more causes for certain types of historical events than had been perceived with any previous historiographical methodology.

Although Smollett is now best known as a novelist, during his lifetime he wrote extensively in other formats and mediums. He wore many hats, including those of a historian, compiler, editor, and contributor to periodicals and ephemera. His involvement in compiling and editing—as well as writing for—the 7-volume *A Compendium of Authentic and Entertaining Voyages* (1756) is an indicator of his narrative methods. The subtitle of this work makes clear its expansive remit: "Digested in a Chronological Series. The Whole Exhibiting a Clear View of the Customs, Manners, Religion, Government, Commerce, and Natural History of Most Nations in the Known World." The organizing principles of the *Compendium* put it in line with the growing number of mid-eighteenth-century histories that focused on the history of a people's customs, manners, and commerce as worthy of relating, as opposed to the limited focus of traditional neoclassical histories. Smollett included his own personal eyewitness account of the battle of Cartagena, titled "An Account of the Expedition against Carthagene, in the West Indies, Besieged by the English in the Year 1741," in volume 5 of the *Compendium*. This tract reads in the standard military history style, with a presentation by a third-person narrator of the actions and events of each day of the campaign, given according to date in the form of annals. Only the actions of the British high officers are recounted, and the narratives of individual soldiers are not differentiated from the movements of their units, presented in the mode of battlefield strategy. This account, as well as Smollett's firsthand experience as a surgeon on naval ships, had been previously fictionalized as the voyage to the West Indies and the battle of Cartagena scenes in *Roderick Random*. These admixtures of historical event, eyewitness experience, and fictional representation signify the fluidity of the interplay between realistic fiction and historiography in the eighteenth century.

Novels like *Roderick Random* and *Humphry Clinker* feature incredibly fast-moving characters who seem to operate in the social calculus of the novels like the chaotic motions of atoms crashing into each other. These

models of seemingly random and unpredictable atomistic social interactions appear in Smollett's novels with more frequency than they had in those of previous generations of novelists such as Aphra Behn or Daniel Defoe. This would seem to indicate a response in novelistic form to the increasing speed and diversity of interactions propagated by commercial society. The heroes move through urban streetscapes filled to the brim with characters who engage in behaviors new to both the protagonist and to history, as well as through deep countryside solitude, where the characters participate in local folkways and cultural traditions that have persisted for hundreds of years. Everything and everybody in the world of these two novels is dynamic and moving, with some customs and institutions evolving faster or slower than others just as they do in the real world. The novels' characters travel through large swathes of this dynamic system—the calculus of the novel's world—and they interact with other travelers who are continually entering and leaving the lives of the protagonists, and who themselves are moving atoms in the system coming into contact with, liaising with, and breaking from other atoms. As we have seen in Millar, the urban environment produces an increase in the speed at which social interaction takes place, which then increases the speed with which customs and manners cohere and develop into social institutions.

Matthew Bramble is one of the benchmarks used in *Humphry Clinker* to measure the speed of social movement in urban centers. In his epistle from London, Bramble describes in the style of a social historian the historical conditions of modern commercial society and the mass migration to British cities that Millar explains in his *Historical View*. On the surface, Bramble the country squire seems to masquerade as a Juvenalian carper who attributes corruption to increases in luxury in the classical historical mode as he constantly (and hilariously) enumerates the depredations and degradations caused by city life. And like the proto-Romantic poets of his time who hearkened back to a state of pastoral (and national) harmony that never existed, he laments the depopulation of the farms and villages of the countryside as the "plough-boys, cowherds, and lower hinds" "desert their dirt and drudgery, and swarm up to London, in hopes of getting into service" (p. 100). As Bramble cannot begin to explain—or even perceive—the consequences of increasing social complexity, he takes refuge in a neoclassical historical convention that Ferguson also uses: "There are many causes that contribute to the daily increase of this enormous mass; but they may be all resolved into the grand source of luxury and corruption" (p. 100). While this simplistic causal explanation cannot account for the increasing social complexity of commercial society, in a sort of apophasis, the more Bramble tries to simplify its causes, the more he actually articulates the chaos inherent in the world around him. Disorder is visibly manifested in the necessary daily interaction of London's city dwellers and the exponentially proliferating sets of unintended consequences generated from the breakneck pace of social change caused by the mixture of the masses: "In short, there is no distinction or subordination left—The different departments of life are jumbled together—The hod-carrier, the low mechanic, the tapster, the publican, the shopkeeper, the pettifogger, the citizen, and courtier, all tread upon the kibes of one another" (p. 101). The speed at which the disordering proceeds astonishes and overwhelms Bramble: "they are seen everywhere rambling, riding, rolling, rushing, justling, mixing, bouncing, cackling, and crashing in one vile ferment of stupidity and corruption—All is tumult and hurry" (p. 101). Like Millar, Bramble associates the word "ferment" with unpredictable social change. Bramble's ever-present anxiety about the rapid pace of urban life and its effect on the social order is indicative, at the scale of the individual, of the stadial transition from an agricultural to a commercial society. This is a transition that can only be explained historically by depicting a change in the customs and manners of a people, which leads to the formation, maintenance, and eventual decline of large-scale social institutions over time. The novel, because of the smaller scale on which it operates, is able to show how these sorts of phase transitions take place on the ground.

The early eighteenth century *querelle* between the "Antients" and the "Moderns" was a discursive manifestation of both the Ancient idea of the "hidden springs" of the universe's organizational mechanisms—Aristotle's theories of matter and the cosmos, for instance—and the realization that Modern empirical scientific inquiry had uncovered more complexity, dynamism, and unpredictability in the natural world than the Ancient models could account for. The human experience in history was far more complex than most of the narrative models of the "Antients" could admit because the necessary introduction of social complexity into historical narrative had broken many of the moral, ethical, and rhetorical binaries and linearities by which neoclassical literary criticism operated. The reality of human history is messy, and the messiness of chaos is a common operating principle of the physical universe and its processes that cannot be described linearly; for that reason neither can the processes of human social organization. The increasing rapidity in the variety and multiplicity of social action in commercial society caused an increasing number of unintended consequences that classical historical and other traditional narrative models were ill-equipped to describe. If historians and novelists were to depict the reality of the natural world in their narratives, they would have to find new ways of describing the natural behavior of humans in society.

This article is digested from Michael C. Amrozowicz's 2021 doctoral dissertation titled "'The great ferment': Narratives of Social Organization for Commercial Society." Michael publishes on Adam Smith and Scottish historiography and is currently working on book projects regarding the scaling abilities of narrative in complex societies and the business of publishing and printing history writing in the mid-eighteenth century. He also works on James Boswell, Laurence Sterne, modernism, and Jeffrey Eugenides. He can be reached for questions and comments at universalangler@aol.com.

BOOKS IN REVIEW

Review Essays

The Foulest of Foul Papers
By Jack Lynch, Rutgers University, Newark

James Boswell's* Life of Johnson*: An Edition of the Original Manuscript in Four Volumes. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, and New Haven: Yale University Press. Vol. 1: 1709–1765. Edited by Marshall Waingrow, 1994. Vol. 2: 1766–1776. Edited by Bruce Redford, with Elizabeth Goldring, 1998. Vol. 3: 1776–1780. Edited by Thomas F. Bonnell, 2012. Vol. 4: 1780–1784. Edited by Thomas F. Bonnell, 2019. The Yale Editions of The Private Papers of James Boswell: Research Edition.

"Try Malahide Castle." The story of the discovery of James Boswell's papers—letters, journals, memoranda, drafts, proof sheets—has been told many times. A mysterious postcard with an illegible signature led Chauncey Brewster Tinker, then editing Boswell's letters, to Malahide Castle near Dublin. No one had any reason to expect even the smallest scrap of Boswelliana there, but a search ensued in 1926. The tens of thousands of pages yielded up by an ebony cabinet, a box of croquet implements, a hayloft, and a dusty mailbag in an attic, supplemented by another batch of discoveries at Fettercairn House in Scotland, are some of the greatest literary treasures unearthed in the twentieth century.

Boswell's journals, recounting both meetings with eighteenth-century luminaries and unwelcome visits from Signor Gonorrhea, were among the first of the papers to attract widespread notice. The most exciting of the Fettercairn discoveries, published in 1950 as *Boswell's London Journal*, includes the months around his first meeting with Johnson and became a surprise bestseller. But only now, seventy years after the *London Journal* and nearly a century after the manuscripts were first discovered, do we get to see the most important Boswell papers of all: the draft of *The Life of Samuel Johnson, LL.D.* Why should we want to see a draft? Johnson loved "to see great works in their seminal state, pregnant with latent possibilities of excellence," as he put it in his *Life of Milton*, and "to trace their gradual growth and expansion." The Boswell papers allow us to trace the "gradual growth and expansion" of one of the greatest works of Scottish literature, and one of the greatest biographies ever written.

This edition has been a long time coming. Marshall Waingrow established the procedures for the whole edition in the first volume, published in 1994. His was followed by a volume edited by Bruce Redford, with Elizabeth Goldring, in 1998, and Thomas F. Bonnell brought it home with volumes 3 (2012) and 4 (2019). The wonder, though, is not that it took so long but that it happened at all, for the manuscript discovered in the Malahide loft was no tidy fair copy. In the first volume Waingrow explains that it "consists of a main manuscript of more than a thousand leaves and a comparably large quantity of separate materials" (1:xxii). There were rough drafts filled with corrections, queries, insertions, deletions, interlineations, marginalia, rearrangements. There were scraps of paper on which Boswell took roughly contemporary memoranda of each day's business. There were mountains of "papers apart," with instructions to the long-suffering compositor on how to integrate them into the *Life*. It was, in short, a fabulously complex mess. Redford puts it pithily: "never were 'foul papers' fouler than these" (2:xv).

Despite the involvement of four editors over a quarter century, the methods laid out by Waingrow in the 1990s are applied consistently throughout the edition. Yet each volume has its own character, owing to the kinds of materials that survive for the various stages of Johnson's life. Volume 1 ends in 1765, just two years into Boswell's acquaintance with his subject, which means that Boswell was forced to depend on others for much of his information. This is reflected in the edition, which shows him working diligently to incorporate borrowed materials into his narrative. Throughout the edition the focus is on the manuscript, and when the compositor used printed material as copy or when the relevant leaves don't survive, the edition merely cites the published *Life* to save space. This makes volume 2 the shortest in the edition, only about two-thirds the length of the others. In volumes 3 and 4 Boswell was obliged to combine his own recollections, usually reshaped from contemporary memoranda, with letters to cover those periods when he and Johnson were apart.

There is a method for presenting copious messy evidence like this, but the fact that its name is usually given in French—*critique génétique*—reminds us that it has made little headway in Anglophone literary studies. Though the editors of this edition use the word *genetic* sparingly, it's the right term for the edition they have produced, since they show the *Life* not as a completed product but as a process running from its earliest written forms to printer's copy. What happened to it after that must be sought elsewhere. The compositors standardized Boswell's spelling and capitalization, altered his punctuation, and added italics, and Boswell made substantive revisions in the second and third London editions of the *Life*, but this edition does not attempt to document these variants. The annotations are focused resolutely on Boswell and his text, and make no attempt to see "through" Boswell to get to the real-life Johnson behind him.

Now that we have this edition, what can we do with it? Odd though it sounds, *reading* it isn't really an option. "Why, Sir," Johnson said, "if you were to read Richardson for the story, your impatience would be so much fretted that you would hang yourself." You would fare just as poorly if you were to read *An Edition of the Original Manuscript* for a coherent version of the *Life*. The profusion of sigla, variants, deletions, insertions, footnotes, endnotes, and appendices makes every sentence a headache-inducing challenge to a reader. This is not to fault the editors, since there is no way the complexities of the surviving documents could be presented any more efficiently.

Here, for example, is the famous meeting between Johnson and Boswell in Tom Davies's shop. Because the edition uses a few custom symbols not found in most typefaces (hooked virgules and carets), I have substituted the nearest easily available equivalents. I would apologize that the passage is so long, but the length is part of the point:

> I found that I had a very [perfect/exact>] perfect idea of Johnson's [appearance/figure>] figure, from a picture of him by [/Sir Joshua/>] Sir Joshua Reynolds in the attitude of sitting in his easy=chair /MS 208/ in deep meditation ^soon after he had published his Dictionary^ which [I believe *del*] was the first picture his friend did [of>] for him ^of which Sir Joshua has been so very good as to make me a present^ ^and from which an engraving has been made for this work^. [It has never been finished/produced, though I cannot but think/help thinking it is a striking likeness. *del*] Mr. Davies [named me>] mentioned my name and respectfully presented me to [the great Man>] him. I was much agitated, and recalling his prejudice against [Scotland and its natives/the scotch>] the scotch ^of which I had heard much^, I said to Davies 'Dont tell where I come from.'—'From Scotland' cried Davies ^roguishly^.—'Mr. Johnson said I [indeed I/I indeed>] I do indeed come from Scotland; but, I cannot help it.'—I am willing to flatter myself that I meant this as light pleasantry to soothe ^and conciliate^ him, and not as [abject fawning>] any humiliating abasement at the expence of my country. But however that might be, [it would have been as well that I had not made this speech/let it alone>] this speech was somewhat unlucky, for with [a quickness of wit he>] that quickness of wit for which he was so remarkable, he [turned>] seised the expression 'come from Scotland', which I used in the sense of being of that country, as if I had said that I had come away from it or left it, and [he replied/answered>] retorted—'That ^Sir^ I find is what /MS 209/ a very great many of your countrymen cannot help!' (1:269)

An editorial footnote on the word *retorted* explains: "Deleted memorandum (written with a different quill), 'You come from Scotland and cannot help it Sir. Qu. I beleive better not'. Apparently JB thought to begin SJ's retort with the sentence 'You…Sir.' (which is not in the journal) and then decided that it would be better without it." And if that's not enough, eighteen endnotes gloss these few sentences: "This addition was made before the preceding one"; for *light*, "Interlined, but perhaps in the same draft"; for *any*, "changed to 'an' in the second edition"; for *come*, "JB started to write 'left.'"

Few readers will have the fortitude to read all 1200 pages of this. The edition, therefore, does not replace the standard edition of the *Life*, edited by G. B. Hill and revised by L. F. Powell (1934–64). It does, however, supplement it brilliantly. In fact the two are designed to be used together: the four volumes of this edition correspond to the four volumes of Hill–Powell, and the Hill–Powell page numbers are provided as running heads throughout, making it easy to compare the two versions. (The page numbers of the first edition and the folio numbers of the manuscript are also provided on every page for those who want to do their own bibliographical investigation.)

If we cannot read it, what is it good for? Its immediate value is that it shows us Boswell at work. We learn that he was a compulsive second-guesser in his diction, and rarely went more than a few words without pausing to consider multiple possibilities. He hesitated between synonyms and tried out multiple constructions. And he reworked not only his own prose but what he presented as quotations from others, Johnson above all. Johnson is among the most quoted prose writers in the language, and many of his lapidary pronouncements seem as fixed and as inevitable as scripture. Boswell, though, was not reporting the words of the Great Cham verbatim but actively shaping what he said. In the published *Life*, to take one notorious example, Boswell borrowed David Hume's account of the young Johnson's frustrations backstage at Drury Lane with his former student David Garrick: "I'll come no more behind your scenes, David; for the silk stockings and white bosoms of your actresses excite my amorous propensities." But that's not what Johnson said, nor what Hume reported. In Hume's original, the "white bubbies of your actresses excite my genitals." But Boswell decided it was too indecent to come from the lips of the great moralist. So "bubbies" became "bosoms," and "excite my genitals" became "excite my sensual desires." But even that wasn't modest enough: a final revision turned "sensual desires" into "amorous propensities." The paradox here is that "amorous propensities" sounds like pure Johnsonese, Johnson at his most Johnsonian—and yet the words are wholly of Boswell's creation. In fact much of what we thought we knew as Johnson's is the product of Boswellian artistry.

In volume 4 Bonnell devotes particular attention to Boswell's delicate attempts "to distance his own work and his own vision of Johnson from the efforts and visions of others" (4:xxvii), showing how he fretted over the passages in which he was obliged to engage with the lives already published by Sir John Hawkins and Hester Piozzi. Hawkins, for instance, portrayed Johnson's fear of death as the result of "something of more than ordinary

criminality weighing upon his conscience," presumably something sexual. Boswell first wrote a passage excusing Johnson's behavior but then feared he was implicitly accusing him of hypocrisy. As Bonnell records, "in the most torturous section of the draft, he started and deleted, started and deleted again, and at last formulated a rhetorical question that granted the moral law but challenged the intensity of condemnation for this human failing: 'And why should the most delicious deviation from those laws which if once admitted are equally obligatory though not of equal importance be peculiarly branded as inferring duplicity?'" After all the back-and-forth, he finally deleted the whole passage (4:xvii, 307–11).

The new edition also illuminates a thousand dark corners in the *Life*. Boswell was hardly the most discreet writer, and notoriously revealed many private conversations the participants never expected to see in print. But he was prudent enough to conceal many identities under general character types like "a clergyman" or "a gentleman," prompting guessing games for more than two centuries. It turns out, though, that the names often appeared in the manuscript before Boswell thought better of it. This edition therefore lets us identify many figures who have long been anonymous. Boswell, for instance, feuded with Piozzi and disputed her account of an episode; he prints his side in the *Life* thus: "A friend, from whom I had the story, was present; and it was *not* at the house of a nobleman." The manuscript, though, identifies both the friend and the venue: "Sir Joshua Reynolds from whom I had the story was present. It was not at the house of a Nobleman but of Mr. Fitzmaurice" (4:259). Dozens of such attributions are new with this edition, and many hundreds of conjectures by previous editors are confirmed—and a few contradicted. The latest volume also settles a source of confusion about Johnson's death, for which Boswell himself was not present. He learned of the event in a letter from his brother David (T. D.), but Boswell's transcription error—"Mrs. Desmoulins" instead of "Mr. Desmoulins"—changed the *dramatis personae* for what could have been one of the *Life*'s greatest scenes but was instead rushed and incomplete. The error was discovered only in 2009, and now the evidence is clearly laid out for all to see.

There are more attractions. These volumes show us a professional writer at work, and they may be the most extensive such account we have for any eighteenth-century person of letters. For that reason they should interest those with no professional interest in Boswell or Johnson, but who study book history and print culture. Combined with another volume in the Yale Boswell Editions research series, *The Correspondence and Other Papers of James Boswell Relating to the Making of the* Life of Johnson*,* edited by Marshall Waingrow (1969; 2nd ed., 2001), they give us unrivaled insight into the genesis, development, and printing of a major work of literature. It's a biography, yes, but it's also what may be the most extensive set of instructions we have for an eighteenth-century print shop, with insertions, deletions, instructions to compositors to import material from other manuscript and print sources, and so on. Rather than transcribe documents into his own manuscript, for instance, Boswell often handed the documents themselves over to the compositor and told him what to do with them. Some of these instructions are complex: "Return now to p. 859 and proceed to p. 861 and take in ^*Met* &^ J.N. &c. as relative to his curiosity & attention to literature & so close 1782. / Then begin 1783" (4:120 n. 5), or "Take in all the paragraphs and passages that are marked with a pencil and make no breaks when a Dear Sir at the end occurs and say only Dear Sir &c." (4:277–78 n. 19). These directions must have tormented the poor compositors. There are several doctoral dissertations' worth of material here for those patient enough to follow Boswell's work from manuscript scrap to printed quarto.

Maybe most important, this edition finally gives us the materials for a new standard edition of the *Life* itself. It is long overdue. Hill–Powell is dated 1934–64, and we might be tempted to think 1964 wasn't *quite* so long ago for a scholarly edition. But its foundations were laid as long ago as the 1870s, when Hill's edition of the *Life* was begun. Powell made many corrections but preserved Hill's pagination, meaning substantial revisions had to be hidden in appendices. The four volumes of the *Life* appeared in 1934, followed by the *Journal of a Tour to the Hebrides* in 1950; the only thing published in 1964 was a new index. Hill and Powell deserve praise for their achievements, but their edition is showing its age. Hill was a Victorian man of letters, with vast erudition but a tendency to lose himself in digressions: his footnotes run to 300,000 words. Powell improved Hill's text, but he failed to take advantage of the "New Bibliography." He articulated no coherent theory of copy-text or emendations, nor did he collate the early editions (Boswell's revisions, he said, were "too extensive to be printed or recorded"). What's more, he was able to make only the most cursory use of the Boswell papers being discovered just as he was going to press.

Since Powell finished revising the *Life* we've had a (nearly) complete scholarly edition of Johnson's works, a complete trade edition of Boswell's journals, scholarly editions of some of Boswell's most important correspondences, a scholarly edition of Johnson's letters, a scholarly edition of *Thraliana*, ongoing editions of the letters and diaries of Frances Burney, and much else—all of which makes a new reading edition of the *Life* both possible and necessary. We'll have to wait for that new *Life*, but in the meantime this edition of the manuscript is essential for anyone working on Boswell or Johnson. We will have to rethink much of what we thought we knew about both of them. It should be a rule: no serious student should cite the *Life* without first consulting the corresponding text in this edition.

James Watt's Life and Legacy in Technology, Collaboration, Innovation

By Carla J. Mulford, Pennsylvania State University

David Philip Miller, ***James Watt, Chemist: Understanding the Origins of the Steam Age***. Science and Culture in the Nineteenth Century. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2016. Pp. x + 241.

David Philip Miller, ***The Life and Legend of James Watt: Collaboration, Natural Philosophy, and the Improvement of the Steam Engine***. Science and Culture in the Nineteenth Century. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2019. Pp. xix + 420.

Malcolm Dick and Caroline Archer-Parré, eds., ***James Watt, 1736–1819: Culture, Innovation, and Enlightenment***. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2020. Pp. xiv + 265.

James Watt has been the subject of significant scholarly attention across the last two decades. Richard L. Hills's three-volume biography, *James Watt* (2002, 2005, 2006), offered valuable new details about Watt's professional life and work. Ben Marsden's *Watt's Perfect Engine* (2004) engagingly showed general audiences how Watt's iconic stature was constructed by partners (notably Matthew Boulton) intent on squeezing out the competition, which, in effect, prevented innovation. And Christine Macleod, in *Heroes of Invention: Technology, Liberalism, and British Identity, 1750–1914* (2007), revealed the social and political drama behind the construction of "great men" of science and industry during Victoria's reign, a time when "Britain went 'statue mad'" (p. 4).

The scholarly study of Watt's life is complicated by Watt's and his son's legacy building during the nineteenth century, by Britain's effort to instaurate men of technology, and by generations of historians' claims, driven by understandings of thermodynamics (for instance), that Watt was a "founder" of more modern principles. David Philip Miller's scholarship has helped demystify the storyline about the "heroic Watt," showing Watt's rich collaborations with Boulton, Thomas Beddoes, Joseph Priestley, and several others, along with the scientific calculus behind most of Watt's enterprises. As Macleod and Miller have shown, Watt became the subject of hero-worship that manifested itself in a significant amount of statuary, artistic and printed images, and textbooks. As Malcolm Dick and Caroline Archer-Parré suggest in the introduction to *James Watt, 1736–1819*, the key to understanding the reality behind the myth of the man is archival research in newly centralized papers in Birmingham and elsewhere. For Miller, as for Dick and Archer-Parré, distinguishing between the memorialization given Watt and the reality of Watt's experience reveals a world often intentionally hidden from public view. Dick and Archer-Parré argue that the goal of separating image-creation from reality "does not deny Watt's individual importance as a man of the Enlightenment and Industrial Revolution, but it encourages us to explore, unlock, and interpret the historical record contained in archives, libraries, and museums, instead of relying on the partiality" of public stature-creation (p. 2). The three books under review do just this: because of the authors' compelling and exhaustive investigations in archives and in the history of science, these volumes collectively enable us to understand the cultural background in which Watt circulated and the relative merit of Watt's accomplishments when compared to others in the wide field of endeavor sometimes called the mechanical and industrial enlightenments.

Miller's *James Watt, Chemist*, a 2016 reissue of a 2009 book, exemplifies how detective work by a historian of science can yield new interpretations about the impact of scientific discoveries in the realm of technology. Miller details the specifics of Watt's steam engine innovations to show how Watt's understanding of chemistry drove his understanding of "the ecology of steam" and thus the improvements he made to existing steam engine designs. Miller's study helps break down the "heroic Watt" legacy, showing that although Watt was marketed as a great genius, he relied on teams of people to further scientific inquiry. The study is broken into two parts. The first, "Representations," examines the contested interpretations of Watt from his day to our own. Miller shows how the "mechanical" Watt came to outshine the "chemical" Watt during the nineteenth century. As Miller frames it, the "central element in this process was the 'water controversy' concerning whether Watt, [Henry] Cavendish, or [Antoine] Lavoisier should be recognized as the discoverer of the compound nature of water" (p. 33). "Chemical" Watt flourished privately, but as his theoretical model (phlogiston theory) proved archaic, his work in chemistry was discounted. As Watt's reputation as a chemist reached its demise, his name was drawn more favorably into the "mechanical" camp. He became an "engineer," in effect—but not just *any* engineer. Miller shows how in the early nineteenth century Watt "negotiate[d] the ambiguous status that 'engineer' then brought with it" by drawing attention to his "knowledge of natural law and his own experiments on steam" and calling himself a "philosophical engineer" (p. 59). Ultimately, by characterizing himself, late in life, "as a 'philosophical engineer,' as a 'profound engineer' and as an 'engineering scientist,'" Watt ensured that his designation as a "superficial chemist" would be "confirmed and entrenched" (p. 82), hidden in order to produce a different legacy of success. In effect, "the realities of Watt's chemical work and understandings were obscured in the nineteenth century by his own narratives of his invention [of the steam engine], and by the 'water controversy'" (p. 85).

The second part of Miller's book, "Realities," explores in carefully laid out detail what is known about Watt's chemical analyses, apprenticeship with Joseph Black, and later work with Joseph Priestley and others. Per-

haps the most illuminating part of the book is the chapter on "The Steam Engine as Chemistry," where Miller reconstructs "the conceptual world" in which Watt and his ideas circulated, along with the "ecology of steam"—"the broader chemical cosmology, embracing meteorology and geology"—as it was understood by Watt and his contemporaries (p. 125). Miller shows that Watt was not the proto-thermodynamics conceptualizer he was taken for in the nineteenth century. Watt laid the groundwork for thermodynamics, but Miller clearly shows that in the context of Watt's intellectual world, it is incorrect to attribute to Watt the foundations of thermodynamic analysis. Importantly, Miller acknowledges early on that his exhaustive study is interpretive: "I am aware that the realities that I offer in the second part of the book are simply my representations of the realities as I see and reconstruct them" (p. 8). A hallmark of Miller's work here and across the years relates to this interpretive self-awareness.

Miller's biography, *The Life and Legend of James Watt*, picks up on and enhances several of the themes in the *Chemist* book while adding perspectives not found elsewhere in Miller's scholarship or indeed in any other biography of Watt. Miller's is interpretive biography at its best. Conscious of history's constructions, Miller asks penetrating questions, exhaustively pursues historically self-conscious answers, and helpfully develops a narrative arc around thematic pivot points. (On interpretive biography, see Norman K. Denzin, *Interpretive Biography*, [1989, 2011].) Miller says that his central goal is to answer three questions: "Who was Watt; Who did Watt become; Who is Watt?" (p. xiii). But the book is rich with interpretive detail that goes well beyond the scope of these questions.

The biography is developed in rough chronological order, underpinned by a thematic approach occurring in several movements. The opening movement (chaps. 1 and 2) takes readers to Watt's youth and early endeavors as an instrument maker and mercantile shopworker in Greenock, Glasgow, and London. The second movement takes us through Watt's move to, and stay in, Birmingham, "the pivot around which Watt's life story turned" (p. xi). In chapter 3 Miller examines in significant technical and economic detail the partnership between Watt and Boulton, showing the range of their concerns in technology, business, and invention—first with pumping machines designed for mining in Cornwall, then with inventions associated with smaller engine adaptation for machinery (so that they could gain market share in the marketplace of rotative engine machinery), and then with the question of high-pressure steam engines associated later on with locomotives. In chapters 3 and 4 Miller takes up Watt's work in natural philosophy and experimentation on the relationship and chemistry of water and heat, the improvement of steam engine efficiency (to prevent a waste of steam), and collaborations with other natural philosophers of higher and lower social status. Watt took a personal interest in the potential therapeutic value of airs, which led to his work with Beddoes on a pneumatic machine. Like Hills, Miller considers Watt's work with Beddoes—whose "democratic" politics and shift to Lavoisier's theory Watt did not agree with—as a personal interest driven by the illness (tuberculosis) of his daughter Jessy (pp. 145–46).

After establishing the family, scientific, and business underpinnings of Watt's career, Miller is free to explore several key aspects of Watt's life. Breaking down the "heroic Watt" idea publicly marketed by the firm of Boulton and Watt, Miller studies in chapter 5 the people surrounding Watt throughout his career, a group affably called "Team Watt," who deserved much more credit than they were given at the time. The men working for and with Watt acquiesced, in light of "Watt's hypochrondria and occasional lack of self-confidence," in having the credit for their work go to Watt, because "encouraging Watt's ego was part of what being a member of Team Watt meant" (p. 168). Watt's ego was likely also assuaged by the number of people who marched with him to Chancery to defend his engine patent against perceived infringements made by different companies seeking to challenge the dominance of the Boulton and Watt steam engine. As Miller explains, "Watt had framed the specification in quite abstract terms as a statement of principles of the improved engine" (p. 198). As legal challenges continued and the proceeding was prolonged across several years, Watt was "in a state of almost perpetual anxiety" (p. 201)—so much so that he used the situation and his continued experimentation as an excuse not to go to Scotland to be a support for his wife Annie, whose father, James McGrigor (or McGregor), was dying. He advised her to "submit to the will of providence," about which Miller concludes that "emotional sensitivity was something that Watt simply did not understand and was incapable of feigning" (pp. 201–02).

Watt achieved immense wealth, Miller shows in chapter 6, and he retired to spend these "Fruits of Success" and nurture his fame. He placed his money into properties (landed estates along the Welsh border, along with other substantial investments) and travel. He built a mansion (Heathfield Hall), developed immense gardens, and continued to work on machines, particularly a sculpture machine, designed "to make faithful copies, either at the same or reduced size, of sculpted materials" (p. 227). The effort at reproductive technology was much like that from the years 1775–80, when Watt invented a copying machine (pp. 95ff.) and cultivated an interest in creating mechanical pictures. The purpose was pragmatic, either to assist business (as with the copying machine) or to develop commodities for the increasing consumer market. As Miller explains, "Watt had a long-standing interest in the production of portraits in the form of plaster casts from moulds of the sort commercialized by his friend Wedgwood in his portrait medallions. . . . As in the case of Wedgwood, this interest in the reproduction of relief images and three-dimensional representations was not a matter of idle curiosity but of real market value as the consumption of such objects expanded significantly in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries" (p. 227). Watt in retirement, Miller shows, became better liked and more genial, even a bit of a party person (p. 230). Watt's enduring legacy is the subject of chapter 7, a legacy crafted by Watt and his son James. As Miller's book shows, "money

was long Watt's main measure of success," but he was also "always concerned, if often behind a cloak of diffidence, with reputation and fame" (p 233). While his enemies, competitors, and "disgruntled employees" in the steam business conceived of Watt as a "ruthless, unprincipled monopolist," Miller argues that such "countercurrents were in themselves a sign of the fame" that Watt had achieved (p. 233).

Miller's is a careful, erudite study of Watt, with whom he has spent over twenty years, exploring archives, personal letters, business letters and ledgers, plans, notebooks, pamphlets, nineteenth-century commentaries, statuary, and twentieth-century scholarship. The insights into family dynamics are illuminating, as are the commentaries on Watt's situation with his second wife and his growing family (and losses of family members). By focusing on Watt's Scottish youth, including his family's Presbyterianism, their work ethic and sense of accounting for their time, and their ideology of "improvement," Miller works hard to provide a rich backdrop and understanding of what some of us might otherwise characterize as brusque coldness, covetousness, emotional fragility, even obsession (especially over money and reputation). An example of Watt's character appears in a letter Watt wrote to Jean Hyacinthe Magellan regarding Joseph Black's lack of interest in having his experiments on latent heat publicized. "Every man who is obliged to live by his profession," Watt wrote, "ought to keep the secrets of it to himself so far as is consistent with the use of them: It is only People of Independ[en]t fortunes who have the right to give away their Inventions without attempting to turn them to their own advantage" (quoted, p. 162). Watt's consistent lack of interest in creating opportunities for others to participate in larger social improvement is palpable. Miller makes an effort to reveal and to explain Watt's attitudes, but Watt does not come across here (as elsewhere) as a very likable person. That Miller has spent the better part of his professional career studying Watt and producing such an informed biography reveals a discipline and dispassionate patience that this scholar of Benjamin Franklin (who abhorred patents and frequently published his experiments for everyone's benefit) would likely not have mustered.

The collection of essays edited by Dick and Archer-Parré is masterfully crafted in both quality of contents and of the book as a physical object. The ten chapters complement and add to Miller's themes. Indeed, each chapter seems to assist in fleshing out (sometimes quite differently) the storyline of Watt's family life and his career. Fiona Tait provides readers with a most useful catalog and finding aid to the Watt family papers available in Birmingham, along with some topic suggestions for research in social and cultural history (chap. 10). Given the plethora of studies of Watt's scientific and engineering work, the study of Watt's family life helps to recuperate an otherwise relatively unknown area of inquiry. Several chapters attend to Watt's family circumstances. Kate Croft offers a compelling analysis of Watt's domestic circumstances in her essay on Margaret Miller Watt and Ann McGregor Watt, his two wives (chap. 3). As Croft points out, Watt's relations with men have dominated discussions of his accomplishments, yet his wives performed service essential to the creativity of their husband: they "manag[ed] his depression, serv[ed] as a communication link, provid[ed] a safe space for worries and concerns, and offer[ed] a degree of intellectual capital" not otherwise available to Watt (p. 82). Similarly new insights into the family background are available in several other essays, but most notably in Stephen Mullen's brilliantly insightful essay (chap. 2), which draws attention to the participation of the Watt family in the trafficking and use of enslaved labor in the Caribbean. As Mullen carefully shows, for the first thirty years of the nineteenth century Caribbean planters were the main overseas customers of the Boulton-Watt steam engine, "a new technology that powered sugar cane rollers and allowed planters to remain competitive toward the end of Caribbean slavery" (p. 39). Watt was intricately involved in this aspect of the business, which gives a new insight into the wealth he amassed as a result of his steam engine. Mullen details how James and his brother John "took advantage of a legal ambiguity that allowed merchants to offer enslaved persons—usually young male children—for sale. The Watt family papers reveal how this worked in practice" (p. 45). These perspectives—on the women in Watt's life and the trafficking and use of humans resulting from the family's trade in the Caribbean—offer enormously useful insight into the fabric making up Watt's everyday activities and social assumptions.

Watt's social and political assumptions appear in other chapters. Peter M. Jones hones in on the "peculiarly Scottish brand of Calvinism" (p. 37) that influenced Watt's youth but that—in Jones's view—gradually gave way to the "commercial dynamism" and social experience of living in Glasgow (pp. 23–24). Larry Stewart offers an interesting analysis of Watt's political and social anxieties, particularly his deep concern about the unleashing of mobs taking place in France and the potential for mob activity in British industrial towns. In Stewart's view, Watt likely had much in common with Edmund Burke, who famously expressed the anxieties of the era, the "great age of riot" (chap. 4). In letters about mob activities in Birmingham and Manchester, Watt expressed concern about the arrival in Britain of the "Daemons who have long distracted france" (quoted, p. 101). Anxious about a downturn in trade, Watt "carefully hid his engagement with the established government of Pitt and company" (p. 107).

Across the years, scholars have noted the irony of Watt's engagement with Thomas Beddoes, who had clear sympathetic ties to radical democratic circles. Frank A. J. L. James provides a helpfully detailed yet focused study of the private relationships that emerged to found and fund the Medical Pneumatic Institution of Bristol, a collaborative effort of the Watt family, Beddoes, Davies Giddy, and Humphry Davy (chap. 5). James reveals how "numerous contingencies, both global and local, . . . propelled Davy from provincial obscurity to metropolitan fame" (p. 133). Watt's concerns with science and mechanical devices preoccupy the other contributors, including a

study by Kristen Schranz on Watt's affiliations with the chemists Joseph Black and James Keir (chap. 6) and a commentary by Miller on Watt's natural philosophy and its relationship to his business enterprises (chap. 7). Nina Baker provides insight into Watt's work with musical instruments (chap. 9), and Ben Russell offers a fascinating interpretive object analysis of Watt's workshop in the Science Museum, London (chap. 8). Taken together, the essays in this volume enable us to examine the Enlightenment as the production of a series of contingencies, a shared experience of laborers, enslaved and free, of domestic workers, of Calvinist and other believers as well as dissenters. It's an exemplary collection, as beautifully presented as it is helpfully informative.

2019 was the bicentenary of Watt's death. As these three volumes demonstrate, Watt's interests and skills far surpassed his reputation as a steam engineer. Watt's family life, personality, and legacy, as well as the science behind Watt's inventions all deserve the attention they have received here. And as these studies suggest, all of these topics also deserve further investigation.

Out of the Shadow of Adam Smith: David Hume and Sir James Steuart as Enlightenment Economists

By Tatsuya Sakamoto, Waseda University

Margaret Schabas and Carl Wennerlind, ***A Philosopher's Economist: Hume and the Rise of Capitalism***. Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 2020. Pp. xv + 316.

José M. Menudo ed., ***The Economic Thought of Sir James Steuart: First Economist of the Scottish Enlightenment***. London: Routledge, 2020. Pp. xvii + 262.

These two books discuss the generally neglected significances in the history of economics of two eighteenth-century Scots, David Hume and Sir James Steuart. This relative neglect has been caused by the recognition of Adam Smith as the "true" father of modern economic science. This way of understanding the rise and progress of economic science in eighteenth-century Britain has dominated not only the view of professional scholars but also that of the general public by being widely propagated through textbooks and mass media. As a result, a conventional way of determining the true importance of Hume and Steuart as economists has been to gauge their distance from Smith. The general consensus widely shared among scholars is that Hume came closer to Smith than Steuart. Hence the equally stereotypical view that Hume was arguably a proto-Smithian classical economist, whereas Steuart was the most accomplished figure representing "mercantilism" but fell short of being a true precursor of Smith.

Margaret Schabas and Carl Wennerlind's *A Philosopher's Economist: Hume and the Rise of Capitalism* is a well-organized, sharply focused, richly erudite, and beautifully narrated monograph on Hume's economic thought—the product of many years of close academic collaboration between the two scholars. Though jointly authored, the book's storytelling is so fluent and rigorous that it reads as if written by one author. As the authors proudly declare in the introduction, their book is "the first comprehensive study, in the English language, of Hume's economics" (p. 16). Eugene Rotwein's introduction to his collection of Hume's economic writings, first published in 1955, has long been the single best monograph on Hume's economic thought. Schabas and Wennerlind intend to supersede Rotwein and clearly succeed in doing so. They recognize the fact that all the full-scale studies of Hume's economics in the past were written by German, French, Italian and Japanese scholars. English-speaking scholars with the notable exception of Rotwein tended to focus on particular technical points of Hume's economics in isolation from other aspects of Hume's economic thought in general and his philosophy as a whole. This tendency, which is at least as old as Joseph Schumpeter, is now strengthened by "some scholars" who regard Hume as "a progenitor, for example, of formal modeling, game theory, or rational choice theory" (p. 18).

Against all these currents, Schabas and Wennerlind "prefer to treat Hume in the context of eighteenth-century economics and philosophy and, for the most part, not impose contemporary analytical tools on his work" (p. 18). They apply the method of historical reconstruction and philosophical synthesis throughout the seven chapters of the book. This is to some degree consistent with Rotwein, who presented Hume's "political economy" as doubly founded on his "economic psychology" and "economic philosophy." However, Schabas and Wennerlind's treatment is greatly upgraded and enriched by fully digesting the fruits of the vast amount of recent Hume scholarship. The authors distinguish their approach from that in James Harris's *Hume: An Intellectual Biography* (2015), which views Hume's economic discourses as the work of an essayist who responded *ad hoc* to economic issues from time to time. They attempt instead to present Hume's economics as an organic part of Hume's intellectual universe in the age of the proto–Industrial Revolution: "Our aim is to canvass Hume's economics in conjunction with his writings on philosophy and history and to foreground the position that economics serves as a unifying thread in Hume's oeuvre" (p. 23). In this regard, their effective use of noneconomic essays and the *Early Memoranda* throughout the volume is powerful because both sets of works originated in the earliest stages of Hume's

intellectual life. On the controversial point of the *Memoranda*'s dating, Schabas and Wennerlind state, after giving due weight to various scholars' arguments, including Sakamoto's and Harris's, "it is highly probable that the bulk of the economic observations were registered after 1738" (p. 246 n. 23).

Chapter 1, "'A Rising Reputation': Hume's Lifelong Pursuit of Economics" gives a concise but full survey of Hume's intellectual and social life. Schabas and Wennerlind draw on past works by Harris, Ernest Mossner, Ian Simpson Ross, Roger Emerson, Emma Rothschild, and others but always add new insights for clarifying Hume's stature as an economic thinker. "It is our ambition to highlight the sense in which economic ideas and policies pervaded Hume's entire adult life, in his publications and correspondence as well as his actions," they write (p. 30). Of great interest are Hume's early education in science at the University of Edinburgh, his experience in Bristol of commercial transactions for colonial trade, probable contacts with French economic literature (Jean-François Melon, Richard Cantillon, and others) in La Flèche, and many other later episodes and experiences as a public figure in London, Paris, and other European cities.

Chapter 2, "'A Cautious Observation of Human Life': Hume on the Science of Economics," discusses the methodological foundations of Hume's economics. Criticizing the stereotypical view of Hume as a Newtonian philosopher who made practical applications of Newtonian mathematical science to moral and social sciences, Schabas and Wennerlind focus on the non-Newtonian character of Hume's probabilistic, quantitative, and statistical inferences that were systematically employed in his economic writings. Hume's economics was the product of the historical world he inhabited, marked by the rise of the modern market economy and capitalism. Hume's philosophical skepticism, doubting Newtonian determinism, was more than compensated for by his strong belief in the social and economic regularity and growing stability of the world in which he lived. "Hume's insights into methodology and application of these findings are a critical part of his overarching plan to forge a science of economics" (p. 88).

In chapter 3, "'A More Virtuous Age': Hume on Property and Commerce," Schabas and Wennerlind discuss how Hume's early views of human nature, self-love, sympathy, and convention in the *Treatise of Human Nature* were steadily developed in conjunction with his views of the origin, nature, and workings of modern capitalism. After providing a reliable summary of Hume's accounts of justice, property, government, and monetary institutions as a series of historical necessities, the book introduces the issue of enclosure, as treated in the *History of England*. Dismissing Thomas More's appeal to "sheep eating men" as "mere hyperbole," Hume "strongly supported . . . the harsh measures necessary for their execution" (p. 109). As Schabas and Wennerlind argue, Hume's endorsement of Tudor enclosures provided him with the historical justification of capitalism in the making in his own times.

Chapter 4, "'That Indissoluble Chain of Industry, Knowledge, and Humanity': Hume on Economic and Moral Improvement," is the authors' version of Hume's celebrated triad. Here, as elsewhere, Schabas and Wennerlind make extensive use of Hume's writings other than economic essays, including parts of the *History of England*. While endorsing the established views offered by Christopher Berry and others, they delve deep into the details of historical contexts and ramifications of the triad. They explain the precise sense in which the 1752 title of the essay "Of Luxury" was changed to "Of Refinement in the Arts" in order to argue that the classical conflict between self-interest and sociability was finally resolved by Hume's triad by using prior discussions by Melon, John Locke, Bernard Mandeville, Joseph Addison, and others. This was also endorsed by Hume's discovery of "the middle ranks" as the engine of industry, labor, and even martial spirit as the ultimate sources of commercial sociability. "In conclusion, Hume offered one of the most penetrating analyses of the mechanisms by which commercial societies channel human proclivities to promote wealth and virtue" (p. 140).

I find it useful to treat chapters 5 and 6 together as one consistent argument. They are respectively titled "'Little Yellow or White Pieces': Hume on Money and Banking" and "'A Prayer for France': Hume on International Trade and Public Finance." The large number of pages devoted to these chapters indicate the vital importance attached by Schabas and Wennerlind to the subject of money and "the perils" of public debt. Hume's discussions of monetary issues are the other side of the "real" issues of industry, trade, division of labor, capital accumulation, economic growth, and international trade. As such, the two chapters discuss the core elements of Hume's economics. Consequently, the narratives here are extremely dense and complicated, to the point of being difficult to follow for some readers. The following comments are unavoidably selective. The key conflict has always been where to place Hume's monetary theory, the quantity theory, and the specie-flow mechanism in particular, between mercantilist and Smithian classical positions. Schabas and Wennerlind present fair and impartial treatments of the relevant issues by drawing on past studies by John Maynard Keynes, Friedrich Hayek, Istvan Hont, Emma Rothschild, and others and successfully provide a theoretical and historical synthesis between neutrality and non-neutrality of monetary forces in capitalist economy. Hume's controversies with Robert Wallace on paper money and with Josiah Tucker on Britain's economic superiority and hegemony in the foreseeable future are reinterpreted on the basis of Hume's lifelong interest in securing Britain's sustainable growth in global capitalism. As the authors hold, Hume's idea of a perfect commonwealth in Britain is separated from the ancient republican myth and recast into the ideal of a purely modern commercial republic which, in spite of its structural instability, is "better suited to safeguard and to govern commercial societies" (p. 206).

As for the topic of greatest interest to many of us, Schabas and Wennerlind discuss the nature and ambi-

guity of Hume's "reprehensible comments about people of African descent" (p. 193) and reinterpret them in an attempt to strike a fair balance. Considering Hume's early experience as a merchant in Bristol, at the center of the sugar and slave trade, and his later personal connections in these respects, his racist remark, maintained till his death, is not to be taken as careless or inadvertent. However, Hume was a staunch critic of institutional slavery of any kind as "a violation of human rights and integrity." The annoying problem here is the historical reality Hume lived, in which both the slave trade and antislavery movements commonly originated from the growth of modern global capitalism. "The racist views held by Hume were far from uncommon during the eighteenth century. His position on these matters serves as a potent reminder that the Enlightenment arguments for liberty and progress did not apply in the same way to all the peoples of the world" (p. 194).

Chapter 7, "'Our Most Excellent Friend': Hume's Imprint on Economics," provides a comprehensive overview of Hume's legacy in the history of economics. It strikingly reveals how Hume's economics has wholly or partially been succeeded, digested, and transformed to this day through crisscrossing influences and repercussions on nearly all great economists over the past 250 years. Hume's profound influences on Smith, John Stuart Mill, Keynes, and Hayek are well known. Schabas and Wennerlind further explore meticulous details of history and bibliography to show, for instance, Smith's influence on Hume's *Political Discourses* in the making, David Ricardo's appreciation of Hume's monetary theory, and the continuing legacies impacting many later economists. They pinpoint a profound influence on Keynes. Hume and Keynes certainly shared the same "liberal" value or idea of human life as the spiritual support of modern civilized society. "In short, Hume's promotion of literature, theater, and new social mores blends seamlessly into Keynes's strong appeal to cultivate the arts, such as Keynes himself enjoyed with the Bloomsbury circle and his wife, the ballerina Lydia Lopokova" (p. 235). Finally, the thirty-two-page bibliography, covering both primary and secondary sources, is tremendously useful. In short, Schabas and Wennerlind have presented us with an outstanding study of Hume's economics for specialists and general readers alike. Without doubt, the book will soon establish itself as a modern classic in this genre and will maintain that status for the foreseeable future.

José M. Menudo's volume is a collection of fifteen papers originally presented at a conference on Sir James Steuart organized by the editor in 2017 to celebrate 250 years since the publication of his major work, *An Inquiry into the Principles of Political Oeconomy* (1767). The location of the conference in Seville strongly suggests the book's central perspective on Steuart as a Scottish exile who spent many years outside Great Britain, the center of classical economics. Perhaps for this reason, with the exception of Christopher Berry from Glasgow and Aida Ramos from Dallas, the sixteen contributors to this volume are from institutions in non-English-speaking countries (Colombia, Brazil, France, Italy, Spain, Turkey, and Japan). Menudo's volume is therefore not as focused and not of as evenly high quality as Schabas and Wennerlind's monograph. Still, of its kind, the volume is well organized and fairly successful as more than a mere collection of conference papers. The volume is divided into three parts, each with five chapters. The editor ambitiously declares, "This book overturns the myth of the 'advocate of mercantilism' and proposes different approaches to the analysis of Steuart's oeuvre within the context of the writings of other 18th-century authors" (p. xiv).

Part I, "A Society without Invisible Hands," collects chapters written by historians of political thought. Christopher Berry discusses Steuart's idea of public good. After three versions of public good (Aristotelian, Machiavellian and Smithian), he proposes to situate Steuart's version as the fourth. It is closest to Smith but significantly different from it, because for Steuart the realization of Smith's invisible hand requires an "artful" and "helping hand" of the state or politician. Matari Pierre Manigat discusses Steuart's contribution to "sociogenesis" of the modern state in relation to his interest in "the spirit of the people." Simona Pisanelli discusses Steuart's ambivalent view of modern slavery in comparison with Montesquieu's complete rejection of it. Aida Ramos's highly original paper explores the importance of Scottish legal education as the origin of Steuart's idea of "the spirit of the people" and its reflection on his economic thinking. Francis Clavé compares Steuart's and Smith's notions of political economy and describes Steuart's statesman as a legislator who must create a framework of free market society that is not so different from Smith's similar ideas.

Part II, "Money, Prices, and Production," is a collection by economic historians focusing on Steuart's theoretical analysis of protocapitalism prior to Smith. Jean Cartelier compares John Law and Steuart as representing an "alternative approach" to later established classical theories of money and trade. Ghislain Deleplace provides a masterly comparative analysis of Steuart's and Ricardo's monetary theories and regards the two as "squabbling bedfellows, sharing an approach to money at variance with the quantity theory inherited from Hume" (p. 122). Nesrine Bentemessek and Rebeca Gomez Betancourt appraises Steuart's approach to the liquidity and solvency of public debt as distinctively modern by "an avant-garde author of the late 18th century." Shigeki Tomo from Japan argues on possible but hidden theoretical connections between Steuart and Keynes in their criticism of the quantity theory of money. Alexander Tobon's highly technical analysis of Steuart's theory of prices and profit reveals the profoundly advanced and modern character of Steuart's theory.

Part III, "Readers and Readings of James Steuart," presents the most historically focused group of papers. Eyüp Özveren compares both Steuart and Smith as "post-mercantilist economists" and inquiries about the reason why only Steuart faded away from the mainstream of modern economics. He concludes, however, "as the Smithian Vice became increasingly a target for criticism by a variety of heterodox approaches, the tables started turning in

favour of Steuart" (p. 182). Yutaka Furuya, from Japan, is highly original on the way in which Steuart's theory of public finance was created under a nearly decisive influence of Charles Davenant. Mauricio C. Coutinho argues against the conventional view of Steuart as a classical mercantilist and reveals "the sophistication of his monetary economics" with a definite bearing on his approach to international monetary relations. Gilles Campagnolo explores the nature of influences between Steuart, Hegel, and Paul Chamley. The final chapter by Cecilia Carnino highlights Giovanni Tamassia and the early Italian reception of Steuart and points out "The primacy ascribed to the evaluation of local circumstances with respect to defining abstract economic law" (p. 254).

As is clear by now, these two books are of quite different kinds and formats. Yet they deliver a common message: both Hume and Steuart must be understood on their own terms, and not in relation to Smith, or by their relative distance, theoretical or historical, from the *Wealth of Nations*. Both books start from the same equally passionate belief that their "idols" must be situated in their respective historical contexts and backgrounds, and consequently interpreted on the basis of their distinctive, un-Smithian intentions and perspectives. Both books also remind us of the special contributions made to Hume and Steuart studies by non-English-speaking scholars. Schabas and Wennerlind are clearly aware of this, and Menudo's volume makes the point even more forcefully. One of the most frequently cited scholars of Steuart in Menudo's book is Noboru Kobayashi (1916–2010) from Japan, along with Samar Ranjan Sen (1916–1987) and Andrew Skinner (1935–2011). I suspect there is a historical reason for this. Hume and Steuart have been situated somewhere between non-Smithian, anti-Smithian, and proto-Smithian, and Smith has consistently been viewed as the classical starting point for the entire history of modern economics. As the object of admiration and jealousy, and the source of an inferiority complex in others, Smith has been shared by non-English-speaking scholars of western intellectual history of various kinds who are active within and without Great Britain and North America. The common Scottish identity of the three "British" economists must certainly be a paradoxical proof of this reminder. Both of these books make us realize that the real Smith was not so "Smithian" as generally imagined, and much closer to Hume and Steuart as an economic thinker in several fundamental respects.

Practical Ethics and Self-Love in Eighteenth-Century Moral Philosophy
By Eugene Heath, State University of New York at New Paltz

Colin Heydt, ***Moral Philosophy in Eighteenth-Century Britain: God, Self, and Other*.** Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018. Pp viii + 289.

Christian Maurer, ***Self-love, Egoism and the Selfish Hypothesis: Key Debates from Eighteenth-Century British Moral Philosophy*.** Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2019. Pp. ix + 230.

What do we owe to others? To self? To God? Can we even act morally if we cannot see beyond the self? Questions such as these would seem to draw attention to assumptions about human nature—our natural capacities to know, feel, and act beyond the ever-present "I." Yet for many of us today, these concerns also have a certain peculiarity, for we have come to shift our gaze from human nature to social structures and individual possibilities. We take the opening queries as relevant to individuals rather than to us as human beings. In this way, perhaps, our own viewpoint hardly extends beyond ourselves and our concerns. However, into the eighteenth century the human capacity to attain knowledge or to live ethically remained of great consequence. These concerns acquired their significance, in large part, from the renewal, by Protestant reformers (and Catholic Jansenists in France), of Augustine's interpretation of the Genesis narrative of the fall of humanity. Given the weaknesses, if not depravity, of human nature, what remains of human possibility? Various thinkers, among them professors of moral philosophy (and related subjects) in Scottish universities, came to reflect on what we might know and what we could do—our relations and obligations to God, to the good of others, and to our own selves. In the two excellent books under review, we rediscover eighteenth-century responses to these questions and comprehend more lucidly ideas and perspectives that had enjoyed but a surface familiarity.

In *Moral Philosophy in Eighteenth-Century Britain*, Colin Heydt focuses on "practical ethics" and its relation to natural law, thereby developing further the pathbreaking scholarship of Knud Haakonssen in *Natural Law and Moral Philosophy: From Grotius to the Scottish Enlightenment* (1996). Unlike theoretical debates on, say, reason and sentiment in morals, practical ethics focuses on topics such as marriage, suicide, or duties to God or community. In eighteenth-century England and Scotland, academic philosophers, influenced by Samuel Pufendorf's natural law approach in *On the Law of Nature and Nations* (1672) and *On the Duty of Man and Citizen* (1673), came to utilize a uniform framework to consider questions of everyday practice: duties to God, self, and others. Hovering over such considerations would be the question of whether human intention could extend beyond self, a possibility that receives examination in Christian Maurer's, *Self-Love, Egoism and the Selfish Hypothesis*. Ranging over a variety of thinkers, Maurer parses the idea of self-love into five distinct usages, explains that the selfish thesis was gradually vanquished, and develops an account of how, over the course of the century, a notion

associated with a fallen and corrupt humanity achieved a rehabilitation of sorts. Although each author draws, in part, from previously published articles, their books move forward in a unified manner, providing breadth, depth, and detail.

Heydt's book explores how the "default position" on practical questions (p. 5), as promulgated in universities and textbooks, upheld as foundational the idea of duty, not that of rights or virtue. Divided into four parts, the book opens with an introduction in which Heydt sets forth a trove of evidence—thinkers, texts, books, and pamphlets—to show that Pufendorf's general perspective not only acquired prominence but was carried forward in Scotland to significant effect by Gershom Carmichael. Part I is devoted to foundational concepts. The first chapter addresses salient features of Pufendorf's approach: the priority of duty and the rejection of any *summum bonum* to which we have the knowledge and capacity to orient ourselves. As Heydt points out in the second chapter, the natural law tradition utilized a *vocabulary* of virtue without intending anything akin to Aristotelian virtue, with its orientation of feeling and action to an overarching good. That good was lost with the sins of Adam and Eve. In the case of less determinate ("imperfect") duties such as benevolence, there remained some room for the cultivation of interior sentiment; even so, for the natural law practical ethics tradition, "virtues are simply dispositions to do one's duty" (p. 43), as illustrated by examples from Carmichael, James Beattie, and Dugald Stewart. Some thinkers, such as the third Earl of Shaftesbury, still advocated theories of self-cultivation, with virtue oriented to a substantive end. And in Heydt's estimate, Frances Hutcheson, who succeeded Carmichael in the Glasgow moral philosophy chair, sought to reconcile this sort of virtue with Pufendorf's duties. It should come as no surprise that David Hume proved an outlier: he rejected the divine as the basis of obligation, asserted the primacy of virtue without endorsing a *summum bonum,* and characterized morality less as a set of laws than "a spontaneously arising system…[to] enable social cooperation and self-regulation" (p. 60). In chapter 3 Heydt focuses on the relations between moral duties and rights. For some, such as John Witherspoon and Thomas Reid, rights and duties always correlate. For others, such as Adam Smith, the duty of benevolence links to no correlative right on the part of another to receive benevolent action. Some Calvinists characterized God as having rights or claims for which the human being bears obligations (debts), but other thinkers, such as Carmichael, held only that we have a duty of reverence to God. On the other hand, most thinkers justified rights in terms of duties, but Heydt points out that Smith justified rights via our natural responses to certain classes of harms, a view that allows for historical variation.

In Part II, a pair of chapters examine our knowledge of and obligations to God. Chapter 4 describes the extent to which duties to God could be apprehended through natural reason or through scripture. John Locke and others (such as Shaftesbury, Hutcheson, David Fordyce, and Adam Ferguson) defended a role for revelation, but others opted for a secularized view. Chapter 5 pivots to the secular perspectives of Hume and Smith. Hume not only attacked the "monkish virtues" but omitted piety from his theory of morals, an absence, Heydt points out, noted by Presbyterian moderates such as Thomas Reid and Hugh Blair. Heydt turns to consider whether "the God of natural religion is essential" to Smith's theory of morals (p. 112), concluding that a notion of God plays neither an explanatory role (via Providential design) nor a justificatory role (via moral authority) in Smith's theory. According to Heydt, Smith offers a naturalized version of conscience, fails to invoke God in his account of rights, and "omits piety" from the virtues set forth in Part VI of the *Theory of Moral Sentiments* (p. 127). These considerations are plausible, but the omission of piety in Smith's work seems less key. Perhaps, as Heydt asserts, we must "make sense of this omission" (p. 127), but piety is not the only virtue omitted in Part VI of the *Theory of Moral Sentiments.* At the least, Smith's attitude toward the person of piety, the religious individual, seems different from that of Hume. Smith seems to comprehend, in a way that Hume did not, how "mankind are generally disposed to place great confidence in the probity of those who seem deeply impressed with religious sentiments" (*TMS,* III.5.13).

Part III devotes two chapters to relations to self, confronting first, in chapter 6, the topic of self-harm, via suicide or enslavement. Locke defended the view, widespread, that not only are duties to oneself mediated through God but self-ownership constitutes no grant of complete dominion, merely a right to exclude others from certain actions. As for suicide, some contended that a feature of our humanity argued against self-harm. For example, Carmichael saw a duty against self-harm as derivative of how we bear an image of God. For most thinkers—Hume is again an exception—God has placed us in a "bounded moral universe" (p. 157). In chapter 7 Heydt takes up the question of pessimism or optimism regarding human nature and the possibility of self-cultivation, a theme Christian Maurer also broaches. Heydt classifies Shaftesbury, Hutcheson, Samuel Clarke, and Ferguson as optimists, with Pufendorf, Thomas Hobbes, the French moralists (e.g., Blaise Pascal and La Rochefoucauld) as pessimists, along with Bernard Mandeville and even Hume. The categorizations seem to be based on the extent to which human nature allows or encourages moral improvement, a crucial question within the culture of Protestantism. However, some readers may worry that these categories, or their constituents, exhibit some loose fit: Adam Ferguson *is* an optimist, but there is another sense in which he recognizes the human capacity, individual and collective, for failure.

Part IV takes up our relations to others, whether as individuals or as members of a family or state. In chapter 8 Heydt focuses on widely held views of natural rights—to life, liberty, and reputation—in relation to patriarchal marriage, as well as slavery. The rights theories of the eighteenth century seemed to mold easily with pa-

triarchal notions and institutions of subordination. The acceptance of the "natural subordination of women" (p. 196) meant that political society was constituted by men as the heads of families, a tenet defended by Carmichael as well as Reid. As for slavery, it was common to hold that such a practice was justified for a captive who fought for an unjust cause. In general, it was not so much that slavery was intrinsically wrong as it was wrong for various consequential reasons, economic and moral. Chapter 9 explores views on marriage and family, focusing chiefly on polygamy. Pufendorf argued that monogamy is preferable, though polygamy, if compatible with the end of marriage (propagation), is permissible by natural law. Heydt notes that natural law criticisms of polygamy, which increased as the century wore on, sometimes invoked the equality of men and women.

The tenth and final chapter takes up political jurisprudence. In the universities, the practical ethics literature was overwhelmingly Whig in orientation (p. 229), consistently defending a right to resist the sovereign, and focused on political jurisprudence. However, a consideration of republican or civic humanist concerns (e.g., a citizens' militia or the temptations of luxury) was found less in this academic setting than in "the broader, public discussion" (p. 238). Perhaps this is the reason that some of us have found so "little trace" of civic humanist ideas in the moral philosophy texts of Adam Ferguson (p. 240). A second notable aspect of this chapter is Heydt's observation that over the course of the eighteenth century, with the emergence of impersonal processes of society and economy, the idea of governing via political jurisprudence became less appropriate, as exemplified by Smith's "break" from the traditions of Pufendorf (p. 245). Heydt has discerned in the evolution of practical ethics the changing facets of governing that impressed Michel Foucault in his lectures at the Collège de France in the last years of the 1970s.

Heydt's book displays impressive range. In a work of such encyclopedic scope, there is a tendency to draw "fault lines" (p. 159), as noted above in the case of the optimists and pessimists. And on occasion, a reader may pause to ask whether this thinker is part of a practical ethics tradition or merely shares some feature of it. These quibbles aside, this work succeeds in many ways. It opens new ways of understanding the moral thought of the eighteenth century, contextualizes the work of particular thinkers (e.g. Hutcheson, Hume, Smith), and provides another reminder of the enduring influence of Pufendorf and Locke. In addition, Heydt introduces specific lines of thought regarding Smith's account of rights, and, in that context, he discusses the work of John Bruce, professor of logic at Edinburgh, 1778–92, who may have been influenced by Smith. Heydt's distinction between the contents of academic and political conversations provides new guidance for assessing the civic humanist interpretation of eighteenth-century politics. Heydt's excellent book manifests breadth, clarity, and understanding, not to mention an occasional bit of wit. His accounts and analyses also remind us how many contributors to the discussion were Scots, whether university professors who bore responsibility for practical moral instruction or Moderate ministers who sought to encourage a mode of conduct reflective of religious observance yet relevant to participation in a wider society.

For thinkers such as these, Scottish or not, a specific human attitude, that of self-love, might prove a challenge to a genuinely moral life. Across the centuries, two views of self-love stand in opposition. Aristotle regarded self-love (*philautia*) as an attachment to the higher aspect of the self—one's reason (*Nicomachean Ethics*, IX.8). However, this positive notion of self-love is set aside by Augustine—"the holy man," as John Calvin refers to him (*Institutes*, II.iii.8)—who portrayed self-love, emblematic of fallen humanity, as a subjective and overwhelming affection that turns one from God (*City of God*, XIV.28). From the seventeenth into the eighteenth century the notion of self-love intrudes into both theoretical and practical discussions, often with only the vaguest conceptual introduction.

Into these relatively unexplored realms steps Christian Maurer. Like Colin Heydt, he shows great intellectual compass as well as a willingness to engage with thinkers who are often ignored. In *Self-Love, Egoism and the Selfish Hypothesis,* Maurer handles nimbly the somewhat elusive theme of self-love, as well as a corollary topic, the selfish hypothesis, understood to mean that all motives reflect some form of self-love. The first and last of the eight chapters offer an introduction and conclusion, while the others are devoted to one or more philosophers. The introduction distinguishes five conceptions of self-love: egoistic or self-interested desire (as employed by Hutcheson); love of praise (Mandeville); due pride or self-esteem (Smith); excessive pride or *amour-propre* (Mandeville, again); and respect of self (Butler). Maurer affirms, rightly, that scholars often misread self-love as mere egoism, or self-interested desire.

Chapter 2 turns to the third Earl of Shaftesbury, who rejected the selfish hypothesis as well as any notion of a fallen human nature. Maurer explains carefully Shaftesbury's account of kinds and degrees of affections, noting that Shaftesbury allowed a positive conception of "self-love" even though he utilized the term only occasionally. Since what Shaftesbury calls private or self affections "ultimately aim at some kind of benefit for the agent," these are "best understood in the broad sense of self-love as egoistic desire" (pp. 42–43). However, since these affections may include, in Shaftesbury's words, "love of life, resentment of injury" along with "desire of… conveniences" (quoted on p. 42), it is not easy to conclude with Maurer that these desires are egoistic or self-loving, at least not without the worry that the concept of "self-love" has broadened too widely.

In chapter 3 Maurer turns to Mandeville, chiefly his *Fable of the Bees*, explaining that he focused less on egoistic desire than on *amour-propre,* an Augustinian notion. In Mandeville's nomenclature, *amour-propre* is "self-liking" (with "self-love" referring to a self-preserving form of egoism). Self-liking involves both a comparative

evaluation of self as superior to others and a love of praise. Maurer delineates well the role of self-liking in the development of cooperation and distinguishes between praise for the qualities of human beings (as compared, say, to animals) and praise for the qualities of particular individuals (as compared to other persons). An important feature of this chapter is Maurer's deft discussion of whether Mandeville may have sincerely believed that morality is, in fact, self-denying. It is often assumed that Mandeville was a thoroughgoing moral skeptic, but Maurer makes the case that a belief in self-denying moral virtue is not incompatible with a theory of the construction of *social* virtue.

Chapter 4 examines how Francis Hutcheson, known for his attacks on the selfish hypothesis, nonetheless seems to allow, *pace* Adam Smith's interpretation of Hutcheson, a positive form of self-love. According to Maurer's analysis, under specific conditions an act motivated by calm, reflective self-love may be regarded positively: not only must the act be consistent with or necessary for the good of the whole, but its omission would harm the community. These conditions may show that self-love has instrumental value, but they hardly show a positive view of self-love itself. At the close of the chapter, Maurer offers an illuminating portrayal of how Alexander Forbes, Lord Pitsligo's *Essays Moral and Philosophical* (1734) attached an Augustinian view of self-love to a Hutchesonian account of virtue.

Chapter 5 revisits the chief elements of Joseph Butler's moral outlook, with its division of particular and general principles. Apparently rejecting an Augustinian view, Butler depicts self-love as a second-order general principle that guides and approves first order motivating principles, including benevolence. In this way, says Maurer, self-love involves a *respect* for the self. Maurer's discussion moves well, and it is true that Butler develops a view of self-love as aligning, in general, with conscience. However, it is also true that Butler still discerns a negative side: self-love, he also notes, is oriented to "that self we are all so fond of" (*Sermon* 10.3). In this way, even self-love may go awry: it is, says Butler "that partial, that false self-love" (*Sermon* 9.20) which may enlarge "what is amiss in others" even as it "lessens everything amiss in ourselves" (*Sermon* 9.22).

The portrayal of Archibald Campbell in chapter 6 discloses a thinker long ignored. A student of John Simson, who was twice charged with heresy, Campbell would himself come under examination by the Church of Scotland. After appointment in 1731 to the divinity chair at the University of St. Andrews, Campbell argued, in *An Enquiry into the Original of Moral Virtue* (1733), that an egoistic self-love was the motive of all action. Such a fact would not, says Maurer, yield a "pessimistic view of human nature" (p. 145). For Campbell, self-love has an outward orientation: it not only motivates our desire to be with others but seeks their esteem, the motive of virtue. In turn, virtue is nothing other than the conformity of conduct with the self-love of other agents, a position that Maurer describes, interestingly, as an early formulation of consequentialism.

In chapter 7 Maurer pivots to Hume and Smith, with additional brief analyses of John Gay, David Hartley, Thomas Reid, and Dugald Stewart. After noting that by midcentury the selfish hypothesis was hardly debated, Maurer explores how Hume, aware of the vagueness of terms such as "self-love" and "pride," sought to separate self-love from *amour-propre* and situate it as self-esteem or due pride. According to Maurer, Smith too sought to rehabilitate self-love as self-esteem. Maurer contends that in *The Theory of Moral Sentiments* Smith makes two signal contributions: he argues for a positive understanding of self-love (both as egoistic and as self-esteem), and he distinguishes due pride from mere vanity. It is not entirely clear that Smith conceives of self-love as simply egoistic, even though he has a positive view of some kinds of *self-interested* action, as in his view of prudence or of constrained ambition. Nor is it obvious that due pride or self-esteem is, for Smith, a form of self-love. One would prefer, in this discussion, a more explicit engagement with the way in which Smith also portrays self-love as the source of moral blindness and misrepresentation, characterizations that not only recall the Augustinian depictions of self-love launched by French moralists, such as La Rochefoucauld, but render any program of rehabilitation more difficult.

That said, Maurer has produced an admirable book that explores a neglected topic without sacrifice of detail or verve. The examinations of overlooked figures such as Archibald Campbell and Alexander Forbes are welcome; the discussions of Hutcheson and Smith challenge received views; and the chapters on Mandeville and Campbell are particularly strong. It could be that the various forms of self-love, aptly distinguished by Maurer, might emerge from the same propensity, an affection for self. It was this affection that Augustine took to be the epitome of our (fallen) nature. Perhaps such an affection, like others that we have, generates multiple variations that must be channeled, thwarted, guided, or cultivated. A consideration of self-love returns us to the question of human nature in all of its complexity and possibility.

That complexity emerges, as both these books recognize, within a Protestant culture alert to questions of human knowledge and moral capacity. The two books also emphasize the notable contributions of Scottish thinkers. In the case of practical ethics, some of their prominence stems, as noted previously, from the influence of Gershom Carmichael as well as from the responsibility of instructors at Scottish universities to teach morals. More generally, the Scots mentioned in these books were either reared on or exposed more generally to a rhetoric of human fallibility and weakness. They, as well as others, were keenly aware of the questions raised by a fallen humanity: can one know one's duty? and can one fulfill it? Perhaps the Scots, more than others, were also mindful of the way in which circumstance and history might affect the approaches to these questions. If, as these books convey, their responses, and those of others, suggest real differences, then that may be an indication of the complexity of human nature, if not of human fallibility itself.

OTHER REVIEWS

Nigel Leask, ***Stepping Westward: Writing the Highland Tour, c. 1720–1830***. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020. Pp. xiv + 368.

Stepping Westward is, in the author's words, "the first book of its kind dedicated to the literature of the Scottish Highland tour 1720–1830" (p. 6). It is a bold claim, given the extent to which the representation of the Highlands by travelers, artists, poets, and novelists has been covered in works such as Martin Rackwitz's *Travels to Terra Incognita: The Scottish Highlands and Hebrides in Early Modern Travellers' Accounts, c. 1699 to 1800* (2007), Silke Stroh's *Gaelic Scotland in the Colonial Imagination: Anglophone Writing from 1600 to 1900* (2016), Peter Womack's *Improvement and Romance: Constructing the Myth of the Highlands* (1989), and various works by Charles Withers, among others. In this respect, the author might be said to echo some of his subjects who sought to emphasize the uncharted nature of the territory they explored and the novelty of their accounts.

That said, Leask does provide a close reading of numerous texts, yielding insight into a period in which the Highlands underwent considerable social and economic transformation, and as a corollary, became subject for prodigious surveillance and representation. "The Highland tour" is broadly defined for these purposes, but this is justified by a convincing argument for the permeability of various genres which all provide itinerant narratives and descriptions of the region. The book explores the intertextuality of different accounts, supported by extensive bibliographic details, to demonstrate how the discursive topography of successive travelers influenced the journeys and perceptions of those that followed, with the literary works of James Macpherson and Walter Scott being particularly important in this regard.

The book's chapters move chronologically through just over a century of Highland tourism. They begin with Edmund Burt's *Letters from a Gentleman in the North of Scotland* (1754), written when he was stationed in Inverness as a rent-collector and agent of General Wade. This account and that of "a volunteer," an English soldier who had served at Culloden, demonstrate the importance of military operations in stimulating travel accounts, and the overlap between martial surveillance and narrative description. The influence of Burt's *Letters* on future travelers and the legacy of the region's militarization is highlighted in subsequent chapters, which describe the increase in civilian tours from the post-Jacobite era onward.

Leask provides a fascinating discussion of antiquarians' interest in the Roman occupation of Scotland, describing how they extended "their imaginary mapping of the ancient Roman empire onto contemporary Scottish topography, underwriting its 're-conquest' by eighteenth-century British soldiers, surveyors, and tourists" (p. 69). This is followed by an analysis of the significant impact of Macpherson's Ossian poems on levels of Highland tourism, and the region's place names. This phase, characterized by an interest in the picturesque, saw a familiar series of authors venture north (and westward from Edinburgh or Glasgow, as alluded to in the book's title). These included Thomas Pennant and Samuel Johnson, "the two giants of the Highland Tour" (p. 170), as well as John Stoddart, Sarah Murray, and the Wordsworths. Then came Scott's literary reinvention of the Highlands, which, like Macpherson's Ossian a half-century earlier, inspired a tourist boom, but also, Leask argues, had an enduring influence on perceptions of Gaelic culture, including those of Queen Victoria, Karl Marx, and Friedrich Engels.

The final chapter focuses on responses to Scott's works—primarily *The Lady of the Lake* (1810), *The Lord of the Isles* (1815), *Waverley* (1814), and *Rob Roy* (1817)—in the decade following their publication. This includes the writing of geologist John MacCulloch, who articulated a racialized view of Highland society that was to become increasingly common, distinguishing between, in his view, inferior Celts and those descended from Gothic Norse stock. Ironically, there is a sense of having come full circle from Burt's recommendations for "civilizing" the region. While he was engaged in road building and MacCulloch witnessed the birth of steamboat travel, their work demonstrates the persistence of a chauvinistic attitude toward the *Gàidealtachd*.

The book includes some Gaelic sources, which provide a counterpoint to the perspective of supercilious outsiders, particularly Dr. Johnson, who regarded the language as primarily oral, and, unlike English, unsuited to expression in writing. This is one of several instances where the book seems to have a contemporary resonance, in this case with debates about Gaelic signage for place names in Scotland, which also indicate that this issue is still contested and emotive. It is also interesting to observe that perennial travelers' complaint—the existence of other travelers—within these accounts. MacCulloch lamented that Scott's literary successes had fostered an industry: "as Rob Roy now blusters at Covent-garden and the Lyceum, and as Aberfoyle is gone to Wapping, so Wapping and the Strand must also come to Aberfoyle" (p. 290). Dorothy Wordsworth made a similar complaint but showed greater self-awareness when confessing to "a frustrated sense of being inescapably entangled in a troubling pursuit" (p. 194). This goes to the heart of a fundamental issue explored in the book: the (in)ability of observers to transcend both their surroundings and their touristic gaze, in order to become faithful witnesses. Burt noted that a "general view" would not be possible ''unless one could be supposed to be placed High above the Mountain in the air" (p. 57). The problem—as described by Ina Ferris in an article, cited by Leask, on "Mobile Words: Romantic Travel Writing and Print Anxiety (*MLQ*, 1999)—is that "travellers may cross the terrain, but they do not cross into it" (p. 219).

Leask sometimes resembles a tour guide himself, reminding readers of their textual itinerary with narrative pointers to previous or forthcoming discussion with a frequency that can become intrusive, particularly when occurring twice in the same sentence. Attentive editing might also have addressed a quotation from Burt which is

cited in successive paragraphs, the various dates given for the completion of the Military Survey of Scotland, and a reference to "Flora Mcleod" that should be "MacDonald."

This is, however, an interesting and insightful book which contributes new perspectives to a well-studied topic. In doing so, it covers a substantial range of sources, including many captivating illustrations, which help transport the reader's imagination to the landscape under discussion. As debates about the Highlands' relationship with tourism, and the region's continued perception in some quarters as a wilderness, are particularly pertinent in a time of restricted travel, this book provides a valuable historical and literary perspective.

Alastair Noble, University of Edinburgh

Rob Donn MacKay, ***100 Songs of Rob Donn MacKay / 100 Òran le Rob Donn MacAoidh***. Edited by Ellen L. Beard. Isle of Skye: Taigh na Teud Music Publishers, 2018. Pp. 212.

Rob Donn MacAoidh (Robert MacKay, 1714–78)—son of a small tenant farmer and resident in Sutherland for most of his life—was among the most prolific Scottish Gaelic bards of the eighteenth century, leaving to posterity over 220 poems and songs. His work provides a lucid window on the daily life of his relatively small Gaelic-speaking community in the parish of Durness, part of the larger Dùthaich MhicAoidh (MacKay Country). Rob Donn's community—friends, family, neighbors—was a living repository of a rich Gaelic oral tradition comprising songs, poems, and stories. In this community he found much that was worthy of comment, whether through praise or satire. Rob Donn's overwhelming focus on the local, however, should not be interpreted as insularity, disconnectedness, nor any of the other well-worn stereotypes often ascribed to the eighteenth-century Highlands and its inhabitants, stereotypes that are only now being systematically interrogated.

Thanks largely to the scholarship of Ellen L. Beard, we now have a much clearer picture of Rob Donn and his world. He was not unaccustomed to travel beyond the Highland line, attending cattle fairs in Falkirk, Crieff, and even Carlisle in northern England. Although scholars once assumed that he was an illiterate monoglot Gaelic speaker, his poetry reveals that he valued formal education and literacy and attended school long enough to begin learning his letters (pp. vii, 47, 90–91, 98). Rob Donn's favorite target of abuse may have been Iain Thapaidh, the master at the local school run by the Society in Scotland for Propagating Christian Knowledge, but his invective focused not on Iain's role as a bilingual teacher but rather on his questionable character and conduct as a member of the community (pp. 139–44). Indeed, in one response to Iain Thapaidh ("Freagradh do Iain Thapaidh") Rob Donn lamented that Iain's more advanced education gave him an unfair advantage in their satire contest, since Rob could not hope to have a readership: "Fhir a shaothraich dheanamh aoire, / Cha robh saoil fir céill' ort, / Coimeas t' aoire ris na daoine / Bh' anns an t-saoghal leughant'" – "Man who laboured to make a satire, / You did not think like a man of sense, / Comparing your satire to the people / Who were in the world of readers" (p. 143).

Rob Donn was well versed in the political and ideological struggles of his day. Although the authorities in MacKay Country were Hanoverian, he wrote several songs that were explicitly Jacobite in sympathy (pp. 47–53). "Do Phrionnsa Teàrlach" (To Prince Charles) welcomed Prince Charles Edward Stewart to Scotland, declaring: "Tha m' ath-chuing' ris an / Tì sin, Aig a bheil gach nì ri òrdachadh, / Gun teàrn e on cheilg ac' thu / 'S gun cuir e 'n seilbh do chòrach thu" – "'tis my prayer to Him above, / Who has the ordering of all things, / That he preserve you from their treachery / And restore you to your rightful inheritance" (pp. 47–49). Other poems were deeply critical of the government (pp. 54–57). "Na Casagan Dubha" (The Black Cassocks) criticized post-Culloden policy measures, particularly the Disclothing Act of 1747 which penalized loyalist clans like the MacKays as well as those who aligned with the Jacobites: "Ma gheibh do nàmhaid 's do charaid / An aon pheanas an Albainn, / 'S iad a dh'èirich nad aghaidh / Rinn an roghainn a b' fheàrr dhiubh" – "If your enemy and your friend / Receive the same punishment in Scotland, / Those who rose against you / Made the better choice" (p. 55).

While mainly focusing on local events, Rob Donn's poetry has direct resonance with wider historical events, trends, and processes affecting the Highlands as a whole during his lifetime. Thanks to his poetry and his candor, it is clearer than ever that the distorting paradigms that continue to blight Highland history must be dispensed with; that on the verge of the great transformation which would come to be known as the Highland Clearances, the inhabitants of the Highlands were, in fact, well connected, mobile, adaptable, and increasingly engaged and educated.

Following Beard's 2015 Edinburgh University doctoral thesis, "Rob Donn MacKay: Finding the Music in the Songs," this fascinating and important volume serves as both sourcebook and songbook, and will be of great relevance to scholars and singers alike. The first published edition of MacKay's songs to appear since 1899, it contains expertly edited, complete Gaelic texts alongside English translations (many of them new and original) for one hundred poems, making the text an important contribution in its own right. However, as Colm Ó Baoill wrote in his book about another Gaelic songwriter, *Màiri nighean Alasdair Ruaidh: Song-maker of Skye and Berneray* (2014): "The words should not be judged without their tune: if we do not know the tune we do not know the whole artefact."—a quotation which Beard cites in the very first sentence of her dissertation ("Rob Donn MacKay," p. 8). For each of the one hundred poems in the volume under review, the author has also identified the accompanying tunes (comprising seventy-eight distinct melodies, thirty of which Rob Donn may have composed himself), set in staff notation. As the first full-length musical study of any eighteenth-century Scottish Gaelic poet, this book will be of great interest not only to performers and music teachers but also to social historians, Gaelic scholars, High-

land communities, and heritage groups. It will encourage all modern audiences to come to a deeper appreciation of the poet, not just as a commentator in his community but also as a musician, an entertainer, and a key contributor to the wider soundscapes of the eighteenth-century *Gàidhealtachd*.

Jamie Kelly, University of Glasgow

Wilson McLeod and Michael Newton, eds., ***The Highest Apple (An Ubhal as Àirde): An Anthology of Scottish Gaelic Literature***. London: Francis Boutle, 2019. Pp. 813.

Virginia Blankenhorn, ***Tradition, Transmission, Transformation: Essays on Scottish Gaelic Poetry and Song***. Oxford: Peter Lang, 2018. Pp. xx + 525.

Taken together, these new collections by senior American scholars provide an excellent introduction to Gaelic poetry and song, including but not limited to the eighteenth century. Both are accessible to the non-Gaelic reader, as all explanatory text is in English and all poems and songs fully translated. The coverage is comprehensive, from the Middle Ages to the present, but the long eighteenth century plays a central role. In the words of Wilson McLeod and Michael Newton, while the "period between 1600 and 1800 saw the breaking of traditional Gaelic society . . . the eighteenth century is usually understood as a golden age in Gaelic literature." In that largely oral culture, poets and songmakers (often nonliterate themselves) were the social media of the day, commenting on everything from Jacobite risings to the latest illegitimate pregnancy condemned by the kirk session.

The Highest Apple is arranged by period, and each section includes a brief introduction, several primary sources setting the historical stage, and a short preface to each literary item. For instance, "Risings, Repression and Assimilation 1600–1800" begins with a few nasty remarks by James VI, followed by excerpts from Alexander Macdonald, James Macpherson, Samuel Johnson, and others. The poetry itself is intended to be a representative sample of canonical poets and genres, as well as anonymous texts—waulking songs (women's work songs), *puirt-à-beul* (mouth music), and traditional proverbs—collected from oral tradition in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The material is a treasure trove for social historians, including the views of everyone from bilingual, university-educated ministers to nonliterate farm servants of both genders.

This superb collection breaks new ground in Gaelic publishing in at least two ways: it is the first one-volume bilingual anthology covering all periods of Scottish Gaelic literature, and it is the first anthology to include not just poetry but also excerpts from other genres, such as folk tales, short stories, and drama. This breadth, and the quality of the selections and contextualization provided by the editors, make it an ideal choice as an introductory textbook for Gaelic literature (in translation or not).

Virginia Blankenhorn analyzes aspects of the same tradition from the standpoint of a historical ethnomusicologist with a deep knowledge of Scottish Gaelic and Irish poetry, music, and song. Her book is a series of eight essays (most previously published), some comparative and others structured as case studies. Chapters 1 and 2, grouped under the rubric "Tradition," are large-scale synchronic analyses, the former comparing the structure of Irish and Scottish Gaelic verse and the latter proposing a new classification of Scottish Gaelic song. Because her Scottish samples are drawn largely from twentieth-century fieldwork in the Hebrides and Cape Breton, they tend to underrepresent the eighteenth century, as well as songs of known authorship and songs from the Scottish mainland, where oral transmission was in decline before the advent of sound recording. That said, her classification system is the best yet devised, although it omits one of my favorite genres, the *brosnachadh* (incitement), of which stirring examples can be found in *The Highest Apple* ranging from the Battle of Harlaw in 1411 to the Forty-Five to more recent calls for the revitalization of Gaelic (unfortunately a perennial topic).

The remaining chapters are narrower in focus. Chapters 3 and 4 discuss, respectively, the experimental reconstruction of musical performance practices for late medieval syllabic verse and seventeenth-century strophic verse with stanzas of uneven length. Chapters 5 and 6 address aspects of women's lament poetry in the Gaelic world, a case study of the heartbreaking 1570 lament for "Griogal Chridhe" (the poet's MacGregor husband executed by her own Campbell father), and a broader comparative study of Scottish and Irish Gaelic laments, including a number from the eighteenth century. Chapter 7 traces the history of "MacCrimmon's Lament", the eighteenth-century *pìobaireachd* composed by a piper killed at the Rout of Moy in 1746, with its later accretions of second sight, English words by Walter Scott, and recurring shifts between Gaelic and English, bagpipe and song, and oral and written transmission. Finally, chapter 8 presents an insightful discussion of the controversial early twentieth-century song collector, arranger, and singer Marjory Kennedy-Fraser. As Blankenhorn shows, Kennedy-Fraser was repeatedly criticized for things she did not do (such as inventing saccharine English words actually penned by her collaborator Kenneth MacLeod), and failing to do things she never claimed to do (such as making verbatim transcriptions and recordings of Gaelic words and melodies). These disputes over cultural appropriation and authenticity echo the Ossian controversy of the eighteenth century and continue today for Gaelic and other minority languages and cultures.

I highly recommend both these books. Read or skim *The Highest Apple* first; then dip into Blankenhorn if your interests run to music, poetic structure, or oral transmission.

Ellen L. Beard, Independent Scholar

Gerald Bär, in collaboration with Howard Gaskill, eds., ***Orality, Ossian and Translation***. Berlin: Peter Lang, 2020. Passagem: Estudos em Ciências Culturais. Pp. 197.

This latest contribution to the burgeoning field of Ossian scholarship comprises eleven essays, with a short preface and postscript. While four of the best essays are reprints, there is also some good new material. Six of the essays focus on Ossian, while the others address James Hogg as folklorist (by the late Landeg White, dedicatee of the volume); Native American oral tradition; post-independence South Asian fiction; and a comparative study of storytelling over four thousand years in Portugal and China. Gerald Bär's preface disavows any "common theoretical starting point, [or] an overall conceptual framework" to the collection, while underlining recurring themes of "orality, translation and transmediation" (p. 12). Because the result is a mixed bag, my review will focus on the essays specifically addressing Ossian, which are most likely to interest readers of this periodical.

First up is Fiona Stafford's "Dr. Johnson and the Ruffian" (first published in 1989 in *Notes and Queries*), which presents new evidence in the dispute between Samuel Johnson and James Macpherson, reheated by the former's frontal attack in *Journey to the Western Islands of Scotland* (1775). Stafford addresses two letters written by Johnson's publisher William Strahan to Macpherson in January 1775, in response to the latter's request that Johnson "soften [or alternatively "cancel"] his expressions concerning me." Strahan's first letter shows his concern to placate the irascible Highlander by mediating with Johnson on his behalf; evidently with some success, as the second letter reports Johnson's pledge to remove "exceptionable Words . . . in all future editions" (the first edition having already gone to press). Unfortunately, the material circumstances surrounding the publication of Johnson's *Journey* obviated any such possibility, as the second edition appeared almost simultaneously with the first. Despite Johnson's stated willingness to meet Macpherson halfway, it was too late to make the necessary changes, and the offending passages appeared unaltered. This further infuriated Macpherson, whose subsequent accusation that Johnson was "an infamous liar and traducer" now had some warrant. In the remainder of her short essay, Stafford casts doubt on the subsequent story about Macpherson threatening to physically assault the aged doctor (eliciting his famous retort "I will not desist from detecting what I think a cheat, from any fear of the menaces of a Ruffian") (p. 17).

One of the circumstances cited in Strahan's second letter to Macpherson of 18 January 1775, which he believed might mitigate Johnson's harsh judgments on Ossian, was that he could vouch for the fact that Macpherson had in fact deposited "the originals of *Fingal*" in Thomas Becket's bookshop for public inspection. This is the subject of Howard Gaskill's important essay, "What Did James Macpherson Really Leave on Display at His Publisher's Shop in 1762?" Gaskill tackles the received opinion (as it was in 1990, when this essay was published in *Scottish Gaelic Studies)* that the Gaelic "originals" Macpherson left in Becket's shop included nineteen old Gaelic manuscripts, partly to disprove Johnson's remarks about the lack of a Gaelic literary heritage. Navigating with a sure hand through a complex body of evidence, he argues that Macpherson would never have risked his reputation in trying to pass off such manuscripts as the originals of his "English" Ossian in London, where they might have been viewed by some "curious (and literate) Irishman" (p. 33) versed in his native language, and identified for what they were. Instead, he proposes that by "originals" Macpherson meant his own Gaelic transcripts of Ossianic verse, much of it oral material gathered during his 1760–61 fieldwork in the *Gàidhealtachd*, and worked up with the help of his more Gaelic-literate cousin Lachlan Macpherson of Strathmashie and others.

Arguing that the "English" Ossian was partly based on such Gaelic transcriptions, Gaskill concludes that "a considerable part of a Gaelic *Fingal* was probably in existence by the early months of 1762, and that it was this . . . which would have been exhibited in Becket's shop" (p. 49). But to display the manuscript "originals," and to publish them to satisfy skeptics were two quite different things: in this connection he notes Malcolm Laing's description of "Macpherson's Earse version" seen in Edinburgh, "filled with interlineations, alterations, and additions of an author correcting his own productions" (p. 38). Gaskill ends with a dismissive quotation from Dr. Johnson to the effect that the manuscripts displayed by Becket "were of [Macpherson's] own framing," commenting that "even if he did not mean it, the good Doctor was as usual right" (p. 50). In a short "Postscript" to the book, Gaskill enlists a work by another Macpherson skeptic to support his interpretation: Trevor-Roper's posthumously published *Invention of Scotland* (2008) also argued that parts of the English Ossian were translated from a prefabricated Gaelic version. "Yet our views on the values of Macpherson's achievement could not be more different," Gaskill tactfully concludes (p. 192).

Ossian also lies at the heart of several of the collection's new essays. Gauti Kristmannsson considers the poems in relation to the translation of "low" into "high" culture, and the emergence of national epic. Sebastian Mitchell's thoughtful "Ossian and Orality" explores the poems' sonic resonance as represented in the visual medium by Alexander Runciman, J. M. W. Turner, and Calvin Colvin, as well as in the typographical screen prints of contemporary Glasgow poet Tom Leonard. Gerald Bär opens the portal to the transnational section of the book with an interesting (although rather unfocused) essay on gender, translation, and national epic in German and Portuguese renderings of Ossian. One section discusses the consequences of J. M. R. Lenz's judgment, in *Ossian for Ladies* (1775), that it "is not suitable for (female) beginners," which did not deter German women translators like Charlotte von Lengefeld and Karoline von Günderrode, both of whom played an important role in mediating Ossian in Germany. A section on Portugal discusses the Marquesa de Alorna, translator of both the *Iliad* and parts of

Ossian, and proposes that Maria Prata's translation of the first Portuguese edition of *Fingal* (1867) was inspired by Pietro Antonio Coppola's musical setting of the poem, performed by Clara Novello. The importance of the musical Ossian is also the subject of James Porter's excellent chapter on Alexandre Levy's symphonic poem *Comala* (1890), an excerpt from Porter's book *Beyond Fingal's Cave: Ossian in the Musical Imagination* (2019) [see the following review]. Finally, opening up a rich vein for postcolonial romantic studies, Thiago Cass discusses Ossianic voices in the nineteenth-century Brazilian writer José de Alencar's "Indianist" novels, adapted to represent (in Alencar's words) "the mysterious voices of our forests and woods" (p. 110) in establishing a national indigeneity, following in the footsteps of James Fenimore Cooper and others. Although this collection is heterogeneous, its making Stafford's and Gaskill's classic essays available to a wider readership, while opening up new avenues in Ossian scholarship, render it a thoroughly worthwhile publication.

Nigel Leask, University of Glasgow

James Porter, ***Beyond Fingal's Cave: Ossian in the Musical Imagination***. Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2019. Pp. xxi + 424.

Authoritative and imaginative, *Beyond Fingal's Cave* leads ongoing discussions about the significance of James Macpherson's Ossian in new directions. In recent years scholars led by Fiona Stafford and Howard Gaskill have reassessed international responses to Macpherson's Ossian. Porter goes one specific step further, comprehensively profiling Macpherson's enduring musical impact from the eighteenth century to the present day.

Musicians appreciated certain qualities in Macpherson's Ossianic re-imaginings: their "gentle melancholy," "the loneliness of the artist," and "the dramatic opposition of characters…their qualities of bravery, justice, and wisdom (male)…forebearance, kindness and liberality (female)." Equally, "the background of a wild, untamed Nature" foregrounded the appeal of Ossian, as it allowed the emergence of "last of the bards…invariably portrayed as bearing a harp" (p. 4). Certain episodes held special appeal for composers: "Fingal," "Berrathon," "Comala," "Dar-thula," and the story of "Colma" in "The Songs of Selma;" sometimes with plot revisions, changing tragic to happy endings.

Four phases are explored: "Proto-Romanticism" (1780–1815), "Romanticism" (1815–1880), "Late Romanticism" (1880–1918), and 1918 to the present. Diverse composers, song-makers, and librettists are considered, working in various forms: "monodramas, operas, cantatas, pieces for solo instrument, symphonic poems." Many are "obscure but at times astounding in their originality and inclusiveness" (p. 1). Porter examines librettos and lyrics in German, Italian, French, Czech, and Portuguese and suggests that, despite differences, there are common cultural sensibilities. Musical responses, in this respect, parallel and even surpass their literary counterparts.

Detailed and ambitious case studies include considerations of François-Hippolyte Barthélémon's *Oithóna* (1768); William Bach's "Colma" (1791); Harriet Wainewright's *Comàla* (1792); and Le Sueur's *Oissan, ou les Bardes* (1804). There are ballets, such as choreographer Antonio Landini's *Oscar e Malvina* (1801), with music by Pietro Romani; pieces exploring themes from the poems, including Pietro Generali's *Gaulo ed Oitona* (1813); and significant compositions like Friedrich William Rust's "Colma" (1780). Ossian-Lieder by John Rudolf Zumsteeg (using Goethe's translation of the "Songs of Selma") are examined alongside Johann Friedrich Reichardt's *Kolma's Klage* (1804) and Schubert's work, influenced by Reichardt. Erik Chisholm's *Night Song of the Bards* (1944–51) is examined alongside Jean Guilou's *Ballade Ossianique, No.2: Les Chants de Selma* (1971, rev. 2005) and James Macmillan's *The Death of Oscar* (2013), in a superb section on Modernity and Modernisms. An afterword draws attention to the impact of Ossian on vernacular music, from Daniel Dow's fiddle piece "Ossian's Hall," to bands like Ossian, Planxty, and the Chieftans, who recorded pieces from *Oscar and Malvina* (1791). Four appendices include materials from three key interpreters of Ossian along with a "Provisional List of Musical Compositions Based on the Poems of Ossian"—over three hundred in all.

The rich allusiveness of Porter's discussion, its detail and cosmopolitanism, is at times demanding of the reader. This is mitigated in three ways. One is the inclusion of brief biographical sketches of the composers, many unfamiliar, along with considerations of how work evolved through various performances—from events in Venice, at carnival time, to concert-hall performances across Napoleonic and post-Napoleonic Europe—in singular historical contexts. Alongside this is the depth of illustration, with samples of scores and settings. These facilitate the tracking of decisions around choices of key, instrumentation, performance possibilities, and staging. A third helpful thread is the concept of transmediation: "the process by which an agent (the composer) adapts a plot as evidenced in a poetic text or its translation to a musical form, attempting at the same time to crystallize the import or meaning through devices of tonal shaping, color, texture, and, occasionally, motifs or topics extraneous to the style." Through transmediation, a composer creates "referential meanings beyond the musical score." There are three sub-types: *convergent,* "in which a song or cantata, chiefly, remains closely bound to the poem and its narrative;" *divergent,* "whereby an opera or parody departs, sometimes sharply, from the original, affecting the nature of the musical genre and setting;" and lastly, *symbolic,* "in which the work is purely instrumental and becomes thereby a meditation on the original poem." This last category can be connected to the first two (pp. 7–8).

It is hard to isolate one particular example from so many, but mentioning the more familiar may be helpful. In his substantial section on Mendelssohn's well-known work of 1832, Porter notes the use of "unusual melod-

ic and harmonic devices as well as clarity of instrumental color" work to create an "Ossianic seascape." Mendelssohn builds "a memorable procession of dovetailed tonal frescoes, the opening theme in B minor and its many repetitions capturing the swell of the sea and salty air, while later in the work trumpets recall the ghostly clamor of ancient battles . . . in the poems" (p. 113). Technical analysis is a huge strength throughout and, with Mendelssohn, Porter explains his exposition of key themes: "the first theme, pervasive and almost obsessive throughout, is pentatonic, dividing the plagal octave (F♯s in the key of B minor) with six notes that give off an 'unfinished' air by ending on the dominant note of F♯; even the magical flute solo in the final parts, which evaporates into the salt air, is pentatonic, a gesture towards a thumbprint of native Scottish melody" (p. 118). The "narrative" aspect strongly appealed to audiences in the Romantic period, even if their impressionistic responses were not something Mendelssohn admired: "What the music I love expresses to me," he wrote, "are thoughts not too *indefinite* for words, but rather too *definite*" (p. 119).

Whereas the impact of Ossian on Mendelsshohn (and his audiences' understanding) is obvious, Porter enters less well-charted territory in his discussion of Macpherson's impact on Beethoven's "Eroica": 'the "heroic quality of the . . . first movement . . . and its association with Napoleon (himself a famed devotee of Ossian)" shows the value of exploring Ossian's impact on Beethoven. Moreover, "the names Beethoven passed along to his publisher as his favorites—Goethe, Schiller, Ossian, and Homer . . . suggest a residue of . . . memory and signification" (p. 106). A line of influence, too, can be traced back to Herder and to Goethe (the latter, possibly, through Beethoven's teacher Christian Gottlob Neefe), who observed in 1772, "Ossian has displaced Homer in my heart" (p. 108).

By bringing discussions of the music into a wider context in this way, *Beyond Fingal's Cave* shows exactly why the impact of Macpherson's Ossian transcends genre, period, nation, and performance styles. This book is a scholarly tour de force, erudite and analytically fearless. It is a splendid addition to the growing body of scholarship on Ossian, offering suggestions for further significant research.

Valentina Bold, Independent Scholar

Alan Montgomery, ***Classical Caledonia: Roman History and Myth in Eighteenth-Century Scotland.*** Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2020. Pp. v + 225.

Historically, Scotland's resistance to foreign invaders has inspired a patriotic tradition rooted in concepts of liberty, unbroken monarchial lineage, and the idea of an ancient Celtic civilization that shrugged off incursions by stronger external enemies. In the eighteenth century, however, the Enlightenment produced a competing—if equally patriotic—tradition that attempted to rewrite Scotland's obscure origins as Roman and not Celtic. In *Classical Caledonia*, Alan Montgomery explores how a sometimes factious school of antiquaries attempted to discover evidence of an expanded Roman conquest in Scotland. While traditional historiography held that the Romans never conquered north of the Antonine Wall, different schools emerged within antiquarian circles that tried to reinvent aspects of the Scottish landscape as Roman, with some going as far as to argue that Rome had indeed conquered all of Scotland.

Montgomery presents an exhaustive and nuanced study of the origins, methodologies, and motivations behind Romanist scholars in the eighteenth century. These antiquarian endeavors range from the misguided to the outright spurious, yet such examples provide a fascinating case study into the disputed origins of Scottish national identity. Montgomery calls his work "a study in historical failure" (p. 194), since these Romanist accounts failed to take root beyond their time, but the movement attracted a wide range of characters, including some notable names such as Sir Robert Sibbald and William Stukeley. No single theory unified these Romanist scholars, and indeed, many of these antiquaries dissented over the interpretation of artifacts, textual sources, and archaeological sites.

The book establishes the foundation of these theories in chapter 1 through the work of Sibbald, who sought to inject "Roman civility" into the ancient Scottish past by reimagining southern Scotland as "dotted with Roman towns, ports and forts containing public buildings and monuments, all symbols of an unmistakably classical Caledonia" (p. 16). Sibbald's efforts often yielded specious theories, such as that Latin influenced the development of Gaelic or that Bronze Age ruins originated from Roman invasions.

One the most valuable aspects of this text is the manner in which it traces the genealogy of ideas through generations of antiquaries, most directly in chapters 2 and 3 but followed throughout the monograph. Many of Sibbald's spiritual successors, such as Sir John Clerk, held more pragmatic views of Roman Scotland. Clerk's attempts to find evidence of Roman influence north of the Antonine Wall ended in disappointment. Most interesting about Clerk is his patronage of a young Alexander Gordon, author of the *Itinerarium Septentrionale* (1726), described as "chaotic, belligerent, possibly dishonest, and certainly inclined towards patriotic anti-Roman bombast" (p. 42). While Clerk attempted and failed to uncover evidence of Roman influence, Gordon utilized his antiquarian research as a platform to warn Scots not to hand up their nation to a Modern Rome (which Montgomery suggests could be a byword for either the Roman Catholic Church or England).

Chapter 4 broaches how English antiquarians, such as Stukeley and John Horsley, investigated a potentially Roman Scotland by way of their research into the occupation of Britain. Stukeley's *An Account of a Roman Temple, and Other Antiquities, Near Graham's Dike in Scotland* (1720) suggested that a rounded stone ruin known

as 'Arthur's O'on' in Stenhousemuir was a Roman temple. Stukeley reached such conclusions without ever visiting Scotland. Horsley's *Britannia Romana* (1732) contained one of the most precise surveys of Roman legion sites in Scotland.

The book also gives attention to lesser-studied figures throughout its chapters. Father Thomas Innes, for example, disrupted the conviction of an unbroken Scottish monarchical lineage and disputed the long-held notion of an unmixed, pure Scottish race, yet sought to prove the antiquity of Christianity in Scotland. Military historians Robert Melville and William Roy appropriated the narrative of a Roman conquest of Scotland to reinforce Hanoverian ideology. Chapter 8 presents a nuanced overview of the Ossianic debate with a focus on a particular instance of Roman influence in James Macpherson's *Fingal*, but the chapter is most interesting for its breakdown of Charles Bertram's forged *De Situ Britanniae* (1757), a supposed account by a Roman general, claimed to be found in a manuscript composed by a real fourteenth-century monk known as Richard of Cirencester.

Chapters do not follow a unified pattern; some focus exclusively on particular antiquaries, others center on debates such as Hanoverian interpretations of early Britain, and some feature specific objects or texts, such as Tacitus's *Agricola*. Chapters also highlight the competing methodologies in antiquarian circles, including primitive onomastic study, material history and early archaeology, hermeneutic textual analysis, and military history. Each chapter is broken into short and digestible sections that help the reader parse through the sometimes-muddled lines of antiquarian debate.

Classical Caledonia thus is a worthwhile addition to historiographical discourse of the Enlightenment, providing an excellent examination of antiquarian practices and critically challenging the motivations behind antiquarian work. Furthermore, it demonstrates once again the fractured state of Scottish identity in the eighteenth century by exploring a school of thought that—while not the dominant paradigm of its day—still maintained some influence within historical discourse.

Anne Fertig, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

Mark C. Wallace and Jane Rendall, eds., ***Association and Enlightenment: Scottish Clubs and Societies, 1700–1830***. ECSSS Studies in Eighteenth-Century Scotland. Lewisburg, PA: Bucknell University Press, 2020. Pp. vi + 270.

As the editors of *Association and Enlightenment* acknowledge, interest in the eighteenth-century Scottish associational world has long ceased to be a matter of mainly antiquarian curiosity, and there is now a substantial body of scholarship on the subject. If others have sketched the general outline, Mark C. Wallace and Jane Rendall's collection provides important coloring and shading. As a whole, it adds to our growing appreciation of the distinct features and history of eighteenth-century Scottish sociability. The showcased research reflects careful consideration of exactly where gaps in the scholarship remain and makes a deliberate effort to fill them. At the same time, the contributors amply demonstrate that there is still room for many fresh insights into the theory and practice of Scottish sociability in the eighteenth century and into understudied clubs and societies relevant to our broader understanding of the culture of the period.

In a lengthy introduction, the editors set out the following overarching purpose: "to construct an approach that both complicates the history of Enlightenment Scotland and acknowledges the importance of wider patterns of associationalism in the Anglophone world" (p. 5). They go on to provide their own history of Scottish clubs and societies, starting in the seventeenth century, against the backdrop of the Scientific Revolution, the rise of commercial capitalism, Jacobitism, and the reaction against Restoration manners. They continue forward to the period of "expansion and complexity," when Scotland developed a history that "was distinctive" and "without parallel elsewhere in the United Kingdom" (pp. 8, 13), with separate discussion of the membership and organization of Scottish clubs and societies and the proliferation of fictional representations of associational life in contemporary periodical culture. Finally, they describe the loose organization of the volume, with Part I centered on "the broader theory and practice of association," Part II on "the participation of professional men in the clubs and societies of Edinburgh, Glasgow, and Aberdeen," Part III on "connections between literary worlds and Scottish clubs and societies," and Part IV on "issues of gender" (pp. 22–23).

David Allan's chapter makes an appropriate start by highlighting both the debt of eighteenth-century Scottish sociability to English theorists of sociability and politeness (particularly Joseph Addison and the Earl of Shaftesbury) and the unique contributions of Scottish thinkers such as Francis Hutcheson. From this promising beginning, contributors range widely, from the Scottish provinces to the cities and across many different kinds of associations, including the professional, the political, and the purely convivial, as well as those focused on "literary investigation and scientific and economic inquiry" (p. 86). From Bob Harris's interest in the "patterns of sociability and associational habits in provincial Scottish urban society between the beginning of the eighteenth century and circa 1830" (p. 49), the book turns to two chapters demonstrating the intertwining of associational and professional life. Jacqueline Jenkinson highlights the function of clubs in helping to advance Scottish medicine. Ralph McLean explores the impact of Glasgow clubs and societies and the opportunities they presented for various professionals to mingle together, in the process exchanging ideas and information that often contributed to the development of Scottish Enlightenment thought.

Part III contains the most varied and colorful chapters, like the Scottish clubs and societies themselves. James J. Caudle examines the habits of a sociability that James Boswell formed through a particular convivial culture indulged in by the members of the Edinburgh Soaping Club—habits he sought, not always successfully, to break later in life. Challenging longstanding perspectives on Robert Burns, Corey E. Andrews chronicles Burns's growing disillusionment with the Freemasons, whom he came to regard as less egalitarian than they purported to be. While the collection cannot avoid devoting considerable space to elite male associations, reflecting the reality of the period itself (as is pointed out more than once), the contributors extend their scope wherever they can. Martyn J. Powell notes the manifestation of class- and gender-related anxieties in the fictional clubs and societies represented in Irish and Scottish newspapers, and Rhona Brown devotes her chapter to Edinburgh's "democratic" and "bohemian" Cape Club. In Part IV, Rosalind Carr addresses the same problem with a different strategy, drawing on perspectives from gender studies in order to scrutinize the role of club life in the formation of Scottish manhood, underscoring the importance of this aspect of associational life particularly for men who remained bachelors, including David Hume and Adam Smith. In the final chapter, Jane Rendall looks at the growth of female associational activity quite late in the period, coinciding with the rise in female philanthropy, not exclusively linked evangelicalism but reflective of a number of women increasingly knowledgeable regarding economic issues. At the same time, she notes persistent resistance, even at this juncture, to the establishment of female and female-friendly associations.

A challenge that is impossible for the volume to escape entirely concerns the ephemerality of eighteenth-century associational life and the difficulty of conveying a strong sense of the experience of Scottish club and society life when firsthand accounts are absent. Some chapters, such as Caudle's on Boswell, stand out in the vividness of their detail, in this instance supplied by a wealth of correspondence and other literary evidence. Other chapters, notably Bob Harris's, are by necessity highly speculative, given the dearth of information—although Harris demonstrates considerable ingenuity in making the best of surviving records. It is perhaps this challenge that encourages some contributors to resort a little too much to facts and figures, sometimes obscuring the overarching narrative, although the inclusion of such information enhances the book's great value as a scholarly resource. There is also some inevitable repetition and duplication, as different authors, in situating their projects, return more than once to the history of scholarship on eighteenth-century sociability (with recurring tributes to the work of Davis D. McElroy, Roger L. Emerson, and Peter Clark, among others).

If there is any gap in this otherwise impressive coverage, or, at least, a point of further possible development from this collection, it may be in the contextualization of Scottish associational life within the wider eighteenth-century world. England constitutes a recurring reference point, and Ireland receives notable attention as well. However, the book leaves the reader without much of a sense of how Scottish associational life fits into the global eighteenth century—some idea of which could perhaps be gained by considering additional perspectives from those who belonged to the Scottish diaspora and others with a perspective on associational life both in Scotland and farther-flung parts of the globe. That said, this group of scholars very ably redress some of the imbalance in previous accounts of British sociability, where extending the scope of study beyond the borders of England has too often been, at best, an afterthought.

Kathryn Ready, University of Winnipeg

Craig Lamont, ***The Cultural Memory of Georgian Glasgow***. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2021. Pp. xii + 246.

When I first saw the title of this book, I was instantly intrigued. "Georgian Glasgow" has always been a major scholarly concern of mine. That concern manifested itself back in 1995, when Richard Sher and I edited a collection of essays titled *The Glasgow Enlightenment*, which aimed to correct the conventional assumption that the Scottish Enlightenment of the long eighteenth century was purely an Edinburgh affair. Now, over twenty-five years later, Craig Lamont makes the same point. But I was wrong to assume that his book would be focused on confirming and reinforcing the fact of Glasgow's important role in the Scottish Enlightenment. I should have paid more attention to the words "Cultural Memory" in the title, because the central concern of this book is to explain how and why Glasgow's achievements in the Georgian period have never subsequently become part of the city's public consciousness. Why has the city's self-definition never involved celebration of its flourishing pre-Victorian social, economic, artistic, and intellectual status? Why has Georgian Glasgow remained a kind of blinkered and neglected historical vacuum? To find answers to such questions, Lamont, a researcher in Glasgow University's Scottish literature team, makes use above all of the relatively recent emergence of the concept of cultural memory.

What does it mean? In the introduction Lamont writes that "cultural memory is crucial in telling the story of Georgian Glasgow. To offer a definition: cultural memory is the shared understanding or interpretation of any one thing built up over several generations. The extant Georgian architecture of Glasgow, such as the Trades Hall, and the street names that commemorate people from that time (i.e. Glassford Street, Ingram Street) all feed in to the cultural memory of Georgian Glasgow. It might be helpful to think in terms of 'images' or 'scenes' woven into the great tapestry of that cultural memory" (p. 5). The author goes on to describe the origins of memory studies, citing the work of Maurice Halbwachs, the French philosopher and sociologist who devised the concept of the col-

lective memory, and even more relevantly, the pioneering German literary scholar Aleida Assmann, while also recognizing that 'the growth of memory studies in academia has accelerated since the new millennium' (p. 6). He returns to such theorizing from time to time, but I'm not sure it is particularly helpful. More useful is a comment such as this from the opening of chapter 3: "We have seen some of the ways Glasgow inspired a culture of Enlightenment which transformed the Georgian period. But to comprehend the full extent to which we have *remembered* the Glasgow Enlightenment, we have to consider the extant institutions, monuments, and other markers that have shaped cultural memory" (p. 63). The "other markers" include statues, poetry and fiction, paintings, exhibitions, and forgotten historical realities.

To my mind, the "institution" that turns out to be of prime importance is Glasgow University. Throughout the Georgian period it occupied a seventeenth-century Old College site in the city's High Street, with an elegant façade and Professor's Court, built in 1722. But its relocation in 1870 to its lofty site on Gilmorehill in Glasgow's West End, with its spectacular main building designed by Sir Gilbert Scott, proved to be the death knell of Georgian Glasgow. The grand new building incorporated the Old College's Lion and Unicorn staircase, and parts of the old façade were also preserved, but with the demolition of the college of Adam Smith, Joseph Black, and John Millar, somehow even its memory was lost through that act of vandalism. Still more ironically, in recent times, as far as the outside world is concerned, Glasgow's defining image besides the university is the huge, 175-feet high cantilever Finnieston Crane in Clydeside, built in 1932 and now unused. Both icons look back only as far as the city's Victorian identity.

A second marker contributing to the demise of Georgian Glasgow relates to the area of poetry and fiction. Eighteenth-century Glasgow produced little or nothing in the way of memorable writing. The only enduring descriptions of the city in the Georgian period were the work of outsiders: Daniel Defoe's famous account in his *Tour through the Whole Island of Great Britain* (1724), where Glasgow is described as "the cleanest and beautifullist, and best built city in Britain, London excepted," and London-based Tobias Smollett's equally flattering description of Glasgow as "the pride of Scotland" in *The Expedition of Humphry Clinker* (1771). Of the twelve statues in George Square, the municipal heart of the Victorian city, only five, including Robert Burns, Thomas Campbell, and—towering in the middle above all the rest—Sir Walter Scott, relate to the Georgian period. Lamont argues that examining these, and all the other aspects and markers of cultural memory that he mentions, is the only way to understand how Georgian Glasgow, despite all its achievements, has largely been omitted from the traditional story of the city. However, while Lamont's analysis is in the end persuasive, it has to be said that the extraordinary wide range of material relevant to the cultural memory concept sometimes detracts from the coherence of the work.

The book consists of four sections: Part I Georgian Glasgow, Part II Remembering the Glasgow Enlightenment, Part III Empire and the Displacement of Memory, and Part IV Commemorating Glasgow as the "Second City." Part I provides the reader with a quick run-through of Glasgow's transformation in the long eighteenth century, from a small religious town of under 17,000 people to a teeming, flourishing metropolis of 100,000 by 1811 and twice that number by 1831. Part II is the section of the book most in line with my misguided original expectations. In other words, it is a potted history of Glasgow's major contribution to the Scottish Enlightenment, describing the role of the university and such major figures as James Watt, Joseph Black, Adam Smith, John Millar, William Cullen, John Anderson, and Thomas Reid. Particularly valuable here is the emphasis Lamont places on the work of Robert and Andrew Foulis, printers to the university, both in terms of the books they published and, perhaps even more importantly, their establishment in the grounds of the university in 1753 the Academy of Fine Arts, which for over twenty years provided training in painting and sculpture as well as drawing and engraving. Yet as he explains, "the venture remains almost extinct in Glasgow's public imagination" (p. 43).

Part III moves into the fashionable area of what is called "trauma memory." Lamont suggests that as recently as 1950 Glasgow's pedestrians would have no memory of the origins of the names of Virginia Street and Jamaica Street, the city's "most tangible links to plantation slavery" (p. 89). But recently things have changed and "a new wave of academic and public engagement with Scotland's links to slavery has been gaining momentum" (p. 88). This section is Lamont's contribution to that momentum, providing both a detailed account of Glasgow's involvement in transatlantic slavery and an analysis of the views on slavery of the city's leading Enlightenment figures. (To my mind they come out quite well.) Part IV focuses on the end of the Georgian period and its displacement by the vision of Victorian Glasgow, which remains its dominant self-history today: Glasgow the Second City of the Empire, the workshop of the world, the industrial powerhouse famed above all for its shipbuilding and engineering. By examining the city's series of Great Exhibitions or World's Fairs between 1888 and 1938, Lamont demonstrates just how far Georgian Glasgow had been lost sight of and eliminated. It was not until 2014, when Glasgow hosted the Commonwealth Games, that Kelvingrove Art gallery ran a major exhibition called "How Glasgow Flourished: 1714–1837," which made a deliberate attempt to remind the public that Glasgow did have a pre-Victorian history. Even then the exhibition's organizers felt that to use "Georgian Glasgow" in the title would have worked against its popular success. The author was part of the team creating that event. With this book he has provided the definitive account of why it was so badly needed.

Andrew Hook, University of Glasgow

Editor's note: An abbreviated version of this review was published in the *Scottish Review* on 17 February 2021.

Sandro Jung, ***The Publishing and Marketing of Illustrated Literature in Scotland, 1760–1825***. Bethlehem, PA: Lehigh University Press, 2018. Pp. xxxix + 225.

This valuable study has much to offer scholars interested in the history of the book trade in Scotland, the promotion of a national literary identity, and the use of engravings to embellish late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century British books. In hopes of "mapping book illustrations as comprehensively as possible for the chosen temporal window" (p. xxvi), Sandro Jung examines Scottish publishers and their investment in illustrative plates, calculated risks that weighed the production costs of the engravings against their potential value as an enticement to buyers. Jung's book itself brings together a large number of illustrations, "an archive of printed visual culture with which . . . Scottish book-buying readers would have been familiar but which very few scholars will ever have encountered in one place" (p. xxvi).

A wider British context is inescapable because the economics of supply and demand in Scotland were influenced by the scope and magnitude of London publishing. Scottish booksellers carved out regional markets for their imprints, while often, from afar, negotiating alliances with partners in the London trade. Where strategically advantageous, they incorporated illustrations designed to evoke the plates of recognized London brands, associating their imprints with the success of such products; but where a distinctive look setting their product apart was deemed more effective, their path marked a "demonstrable departure from the models of illustration used in the South" (p. xix). From the outset, then, Jung stipulates that the Scottish market, keenly alert to this dynamic, is best understood as having been "in dialogue with that of England and specifically London" (p. xix). That dialogue eventuated in legal tussles with London, too, at times, as revealed in chapters 3 and 4, on Glasgow and Edinburgh, respectively. But Jung's interests in chapters 1 and 2 revolve around Perth.

The Morisons of Perth—Robert Morison junior, under the imprint "R. Morison & Son," followed by son James—distinguished themselves with more than eighty illustrated editions of literary texts, by means of which they "facilitated the inscription of Scottish print culture with a visual poetics that affected the production of a canon of cultural, especially Scottish, classics" (p. 2). Their series "The Scotish Poets" in the late 1780s embodied that project literally, in opposition to versions of a broader national canon articulated from 1765 onward in multivolume collections of poetry with *English*, *British*, or *Great Britain* in their titles. What the sets of illustrations in this and other Morison editions achieved was a parallel thrust or assertion of national identity in "formal alignment with John Bell's London series of the British Poets" (p. 44). Beyond the branding devices that unified the relatively ancient canon embodied in "The Scotish Poets," the Morisons and other booksellers tried various formats with the other Scottish classics that Jung focuses on in chapter 1, "Staples of the Industry" (per his title), namely James Thomson, James Macpherson, and Allan Ramsay. The costs of a "monumentalizing" quarto edition of Thomson's *Seasons* were such that the Morisons, having set a subscription fee of one guinea, quickly realized their mistake and, while offering access to that price "for a very few weeks," advertised that it would speedily be "advanced to at least One Guinea and a Half" in view of the lavish expense of the illustrations, designed and engraved by "two of the most eminent [artists] in their profession in London" (p. 16). These engravings, delivered in wrappers with installments of the poem, were of a size and quality to be enjoyed as furniture prints if the owner chose not to bind them into the book.

The Morisons' standing as "the foremost publishers of illustrated editions of literature in Scotland" (p. 96) is argued further in chapter 2, where Jung explores other projects, chief among them a series of literary anthologies issued from 1794 to 1797 with shifting titles, but ultimately grouped together under the collective title *The General Magazine*. This periodical format, Jung concludes, was devised to recycle existing plates once the Morisons "realized that the cost to produce their engraved illustrations posed a danger to the continued existence of the firm" (p. 96). In this light table 2.3, "Illustrations in the numbers of *The General Magazine*," repays close attention (p. 81). In the "Subject Illustrated" column one notices, among many titles by several authors, a striking number by Oliver Goldsmith: *She Stoops to Conquer*, in *The Caledonian Bee* (1795); "The Deserted Village," in *Elegant Extracts* (1796); *Citizen of the World*, in *The Hive* (1796; 4 plates out of the 5 therein); "Edwin and Angelina" and *Citizen of the World* (again), in *Miscellaneous Epitome of Entertainment* (1796; 2 plates for each work, comprising 4 out of the 7 in that number); and *The Good-Natured Man*, in *The Cabinet* (1797; its frontispiece). Except for *She Stoops to Conquer*, illustrations of all these titles are mentioned in chapter 1 as having figured in "Morison's Edition of Goldsmith's Miscellaneous Works, in 7 vols. 8vo." (1791–92), several of them designed by the renowned artist David Allan (pp. 13–15).

Evidently these were among the recycled plates, yet I note them here in detail to underscore the inadequacy of the index in this work. Not one of these titles appears in the "Works Illustrated" portion of the index under Goldsmith's name, only *Miscellaneous Works* and *The Vicar of Wakefield* (both, alas, imperfectly indexed themselves); nor does the entry for David Allan under "Illustrators" record this mention of him (not the lone oversight in his case either). Spot checks of Jung's text reveal widespread omissions, while the tables and the figures (references to which in the text are sometimes imprecise) are largely absent from the index. As a result, the rich veins of ore in this study require diligent prospecting on the part of the reader.

Jung's attention to Glasgow in chapter 3 is dominated by the work of Robert Chapman, and later the partnership Chapman & Lang, who printed books for others in the trade—Richard Scott, James Imray, Brash & Reid,

Cameron & Murdoch, and Stewart & Meikle—but eventually published illustrated works under their own imprint. In so doing, they contributed to "the rapid growth, diversification, and multifarious marketing" of a "visual culture" in Glasgow that included not only illustrated books, but topographical engravings and furniture prints as well (p. 102). This "fashion for printed visual culture that came to shape not only a book's physical makeup but its producers' marketable reputation as bookseller-publishers as well" (p. 103) was not a question of sheer output, for Chapman & Lang's ventures into illustrated literature comprised relatively few titles. Yet their commitment to high production standards was notable, culminating in "an exclusive, elite medium" with their final Chapman & Lang imprint, a four-volume edition of *Don Quixote* (1803; pp. 129–30). Here they overextended themselves, Jung surmises, for the project in the end seems not to have been financially viable.

In terms of organization, the book's strengths and drawbacks can be summarized by reference to chapter 4, "From Oliver & Co. to Oliver & Boyd: Associative-Adapting vs. Dissociative Illustration Models." Fifteen subheadings within the chapter enable Jung to concentrate on divers undertakings of this Edinburgh firm separately: on the poets Robert Burns, Allan Ramsay, and William Cowper; on works like William Falconer's *Shipwreck*, Thomson's *Seasons*, John Home's *Douglas*, and Hector Macneill's *Scotland's Skaith*; on novels like *The Man of Feeling, The Sorrows of Werther*, and *Robinson Crusoe*; on song and music collections; on the firm's efforts to diversify their publications, or on a specific venture like their "New English Theatre;" on their use of designs from the series produced by the London bookseller Charles Cooke; and on the plates they purchased when the Morison stock of more than 300 copperplates went up for sale in 1800. By spotlighting titles and projects, Jung is able to introduce related examples in turn from his collection of illustrated imprints, examples that supply appropriate context and informative comparisons. Yet in giving such specimens their due—relating title, publisher, place of publication, illustrations, designers, engravers, price point, and marketing phraseology from advertisements—Jung digresses momentarily from the point otherwise being pursued. Comprehensiveness (a stated goal of the study) is in tension with coherence. With shifts of topic between subheadings in addition to such shifts within them, the argument of the chapter itself can fade from view. Also, given that earlier and later items enter the picture in succession, it is difficult to follow the evolving business strategies when "Oliver & Co." became "Oliver & Boyd," and thereafter as the firm adjusted its practices to changing market pressures. For the thread of chronology to be rescued, periodic backtracking (with inevitable repetition) is necessary.

This drawback is the inverse to the virtue of Jung's ambition, as an unequalled scholar-collector in this field, to do justice to a significant archive, and it is clear (as he vouches) that "physical examination of copies of all illustrated titles introduced in this book" is his criterion of inclusion (p. xxvi). He draws in books and booksellers from an array of cities besides those already noted: Aberdeen, Ayr, Cupar, Dunbar/Haddington, Dundee, Kirkaldy, Leith, Montrose, Paisley, and St. Andrews in Scotland; and Alnwick, Carlisle, and Gainsborough in England. Where the material survives in boards or wrappers (an ephemeral state, usually discarded upon binding, a perfect example of which is shown in figure 1.6, the front of volume 3 of 'The Scotish Poets'), Jung culls invaluable information from their printed covers, as well as from advertisements tracked down by his assiduous searches for handbills, prospectuses, and newspaper notices. Advertising copy is the consumer-facing counterpart to marketing strategy; its phrasing and positioning of the product offer clues to corroborate whatever understanding of an imprint one can otherwise obtain from its material form alone. From the *Glasgow Courier*, for instance, Jung turns up a gem that eluded me in my own research, an explicit statement of objective by Cameron & Murdoch in their design of a particular project: "The present Edition of Ossian's Poems will form an elegant companion to Cooke's Edition of the British Poets, as it is printed and embellished on a plan precisely similar" (p. 35).

Many readers of Jung's study will be familiar with the techniques for producing book illustrations in this era, and will understand references to, say, aquatints or stipple engravings. Such familiarity helps, but is not a prerequisite. All readers will learn about factors like plate deterioration and the attendant costs of refurbishment that had to be taken into account alongside the investments in original commissions or the purchase of existing plates. And all readers can appreciate the visual feast of reproductions—of stately subjects, of humble scenes, and everything in between. The roughly eighty figures include portraits and topographical prints along with scores of literary scenes. The majority of the figures are full-page reproductions, enabling one to appreciate in detail a fascinating aspect of what Jung terms "the afterlife of illustrations" (p. 80). Pairings of identical subjects afford examples of upscale originals and downscale copies (a highly-finished furniture print beside a lesser-quality copperplate); of downgrades in medium (from copperplate to wood engraving); of expedience (when the engraver in copying chose not to use a mirror, thus reversing the orientation of the image); and of varying levels of skill (some copyists nearing exactitude, others showing a more modest competency, and one improving on a rather sketchy original). Occasionally the same plate was actually reused after changing hands, duly retouched to alter the publisher's name. Other modes of "afterlife" apart from identical copies included images being freely adapted or the same subject being newly depicted.

While many figures elicit such pleasures of comparison—the above summary is a catalogue of delights—the rest of Jung's impressive trove invites a more instinctual aesthetic pleasure. Facilitated by his "recovery of barely known illustrations" (p. xxvi), one can imagine experiencing the engravings (scholarly detachment aside) through the eyes of the original purchasers of the books. And that is equally a tribute to the publishers.

Thomas F. Bonnell, Saint Mary's College

Adam Fox, ***The Press and The People: Cheap Print and Society in Scotland, 1500–1785***. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020. Pp. xv + 449.

Recent years have seen a rapid growth of new research into Scottish print and reading history. Yet cheap print has been largely overlooked, meaning that much research into Scottish book and reading history has drawn conclusions from more costly books. This book tackles that gap head on, presenting a detailed and wide-ranging survey of cheap print and its readership in Scotland between the sixteenth and late eighteenth centuries. As well as examining the availability of print and its variety, the book aims to explore what the many and varied types of cheap print reveal about Scottish culture and society in this period.

The opening half of the book sets out the historical context of printing, publishing, and bookselling in Scotland in order to explain the availability of cheap print over time. There is often a tricky balancing act in this portion, establishing the essential framework while at the same time adequately covering issues specific to cheap print. The approach taken uses contextualization. In other words, the book seeks to depict the overall picture of growth in Scottish printing and bookselling into which cheap print fitted, and asks what we know of cheap print's development, specifically within this framework? Unsurprisingly, and justifiably, the Edinburgh print trade—so central to the growth of early Scottish publishing—is examined in detail, including its particularly rich surviving evidence. But the picture more widely across the country is also explored, in other cities and towns as well as in rural areas.

In this way, the book establishes the existence of a literate Scottish public together with a long tradition of low-cost popular print. The latter point requires the book to frequently address the key issue of the mass of lost cheap print, and how what survives has skewed past scholarship of Scottish print and reading history. Generally, lost print is handled deftly by the author, using evidence especially of production from printers, which is uniquely informative regarding what was produced and in what quantities, much now lost. This category of evidence has been underused by past Scottish print historians. Though there is sometimes a tendency in this part of the book to over-cover areas primarily concerned with wealthier consumers, there are at the same time good sections that focus on cheap print. Examples include the chapmen and street literature chapters, discussing respectively the way cheap print was transported throughout Scotland and how thoroughly it permeated Scottish society.

The second half of the book moves away from focusing on the availability of cheap print in order to examine in detail the different types of cheap print in early modern Scotland. Here the focus is reassuringly and unquestionably on cheap print throughout. Successive chapters look in detail at handbills and placards, gallows and other dying speeches, ballads and songs, almanacs and prognostications, and little pamphlets and story books. Throughout, the book makes clear just how widely these texts were being read by Scots at all levels of society. Once again the book must contend with the relative lack of survival of cheap print, but the author makes good use of informative surviving examples to explore cheap print over time. Indeed, the sheer quantity of examples discussed in this half of the book is extremely impressive and helpful for the reader. The book nicely reproduces many examples of cheap print visually, allowing readers to see for themselves what these works looked like, including their format and content.

One section that I particularly enjoyed in this half of the book was the chapter on handbills and placards. This chapter makes it clear how widespread print was around people in much of Scotland during this time, especially in towns. The main work of many printers was not printing the more valuable books which have survived and are more frequently studied, but rather printing handbills and placards, broadsides, advertisements, notices, and other printed material for businesses, and publications for civic authorities. Here and elsewhere the author effectively uses Paul Sandby's sketches of Edinburgh everyday life in the 1740s and 1750s, which sometimes include cheap print. I was constantly impressed by the enormous variety of cheap print to which Scots had access, so different from the view from traditional Scottish book and reading history, including my own writings on this subject. Scottish cheap print included a mass of fiction, much involving traditional Scottish elements such as the supernatural. As a musician, I also appreciated the coverage of musical cheap print, including sheet music and ballads and songs that reused well-known tunes.

A key aim of the second half of the book is to explore what cheap print tells us about early modern Scottish society and culture. This is perhaps most successful in the chapters providing insight into people's mindsets and beliefs. The chapter on gallows speeches and other dying words printed in cheap print reveals a ghoulish taste for executions and death which might shock modern readers, alongside a highly moralistic and religious attitude. Likewise, there is a recurring theme of ideas and print being transmitted between England and Scotland, reflecting shared cultural ideas. At the same time, strong Scotland-specific elements are also discussed, such as a growing taste for tales written in vernacular Scots.

On the downside, a number of sections in this latter half of the book are more descriptive and perhaps less analytical than they could have been, even if the numerous examples presented tell valuable stories in themselves. Yet this is only a minor criticism in what is otherwise a compelling work. The book's overall contribution is immense, presenting a radically original picture of print material that Scots had access to and were reading in this period, and showing how widespread print was in Scottish life. The sheer quantity of examples discussed is astonishing. This book deserves to be read by anyone interested in Scottish print, reading, or cultural history in the sixteenth, seventeenth, or eighteenth centuries.

Vivienne Dunstan, University of Dundee

Martin Fitzpatrick, Emma Macleod, and Anthony Page, eds., ***The Wodrow–Kenrick Correspondence, 1750–1810. Volume 1: 1750–1783***. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020. Pp. xii + 547.

One of the treasures to be found in Dr. Williams's Library in London is the cache of 279 letters between the Scottish Moderate clergyman James Wodrow and his friend, the Welsh-born Unitarian tutor-turned-banker James Kenrick. After studying together at the University of Glasgow, the pair began to correspond in 1750, and they continued to do so on an irregular basis until Wodrow's death in 1810. As well as conveying news about themselves and their circle of friends, their letters initially focused on theological matters. But over the course of their long friendship the scope of their correspondence broadened to include remarks on what they had been reading, gossip from the republic of letters, and reflections on current local, national, and global events (with the war in America featuring prominently in volume 1). Given that this voluminous collection of letters is such a rich source of evidence for the study of the religious, political, and cultural history of Britain during the second half of the eighteenth century, it is surprising that the correspondence has been so little used by students of the period. Hopefully, the historical significance of the Wodrow–Kenrick letters will now be fully appreciated, thanks to the publication of this handsomely produced and copiously annotated edition of the correspondence, which will run to four volumes when complete.

The Wodrow–Kenrick correspondence from the years 1750–1783 is of considerable historical interest, not least because their letters serve as a chastening reminder of how little we know about the connections between Scottish clergymen and academics and the communities of Dissenters in England. A pioneering article by Peter Jones, "The Polite Academy and the Presbyterians, 1720–1770" (in *New Perspectives on the Politics and Culture of Early Modern Scotland*, ed. John Dwyer et al., 1982), pointed to the formative influence of English Dissenters on those who promoted Enlightenment within the Scottish universities. Unfortunately, no one has since built on Jones's scholarship. Consequently, our knowledge of the interactions between the Scots and Dissenters south of the Tweed remains sketchy, despite the importance of the subject. This edition of the Wodrow–Kenrick letters will now serve as a starting point for the study of these interactions.

The correspondence also functions as a useful corrective to the late Roy Porter's John Bullish view of the "British" (read "English") Enlightenment. Samuel Kenrick would have had no truck with Porter's conflation of the English and Scottish Enlightenments. Writing from his home in Worcestershire to his friend in October 1783, Kenrick proclaims that Wodrow lives "in an enlightened nation" and proceeds to enumerate the differences between the "genius & temper" of the Scots and the English (pp. 489–92). While Kenrick's perception of these differences may have been rooted in his experience as a Welshman who had been a student and tutor in Glasgow and its environs, the fact that he was acutely aware of the somewhat different configurations of life and Enlightenment in Scotlland and England is telling.

Equally revealing are Kenrick's comments about Scotland's "enlightened age." Not surprisingly, he regards Glasgow as a hotbed of Enlightenment, while also admiring the writings of Aberdonians such as John Gregory, James Dunbar, and, especially, "the amicable, the elegant, the spirited" James Beattie (pp. 483–84). Wodrow shares his friend's enthusiasm for Beattie and respects the work of George Campbell and Alexander Gerard. The thinker who figures most prominently in this volume, however, is their revered professor, Francis Hutcheson, whom Kenrick refers to as "our amiable High-priest in philosophy" (p. 276; cf. p. 307). Both men were fiercely loyal to Hutcheson, who was for them the exemplar of Enlightenment. Nevertheless, in the context of the war with America, they disagreed sharply over Hutcheson's political legacy. In passages which bring to mind Caroline Robbins's *The Eighteenth-Century Commonwealthman* (1959), Kenrick extols Hutcheson for teaching the "principles of civil & religious liberty" that had inspired the American colonists to fight for their independence (p. 351). Wodrow demurs. While declaring his adherence to those Hutchesonian principles, he insists that they had been perverted by the opponents of the British government. But even though they could not agree on the implications of Hutcheson's political principles, their grounding in Hutcheson's moral theory prompted shared reservations regarding the ideas of David Hume and Adam Smith. Like many of their contemporaries, they saw Hume as propagating a pernicious blend of skepticism and deism which according to Wodrow had gained converts in Edinburgh and the east of Scotland (pp. 291–93). Moreover, a reading of *The Theory of Moral Sentiments* leads Wodrow to comment that while Smith's "Morals seem to be pure," the moral principles informing the book were "at the bottom the same" as those of Hume, namely, "licentious" (p. 247). Like Kenrick's friend Joseph Priestley, therefore, the two combined anti-Trinitarianism with a robust opposition to irreligion, whether it be overt as in Hume or covert as in Smith.

The letters are scrupulously transcribed and comprehensively annotated. The extensive editorial apparatus in volume 1 includes a general introduction to the correspondence as a whole, an introduction to the volume, an explanation of the editorial conventions used in the transcriptions, lists of the letters and the persons mentioned therein, and a thorough index. Inevitably, there are some minor errors: Hutcheson, for example, is said to have been a professor of theology, rather than moral philosophy, at Glasgow (p. 17). My only substantive criticism concerns the presentation of the letters. In the transcriptions, I find the unexpanded contractions and the use of an elaborate system of brackets to indicate deletions, insertions, and the like unnecessarily distracting. A transcription can be accurate without being a literal reproduction and, in my view, readers are better served by texts which are not

festooned by contractions and editorial symbols. But this issue is partly a matter of taste, and my reservations about the editorial conventions in no way lessen my admiration for what is otherwise a magnificent scholarly achievement.

Paul Wood, University of Victoria

Alexander Murdoch, ***Making the Union Work: Scotland, 1651–1763***. London and New York: Routledge, 2020. Pp. ix + 194.

It has been forty years since Alex Murdoch published "*The People Above": Politics and Administration in Mid-Eighteenth Century Scotland* (1980). Since then, he has had a distinguished career both in service to the profession and in making significant contributions to various fields of study: the Union, Scotland's politics and government, Scotland's identity, and the Scottish diaspora. Prior to 1980 there was virtually no serious scholarship on eighteenth-century Scottish political history, apart from P. W. J. Riley's *English Ministers and Scotland, 1707–27* (1964); John M. Simpson's seminal essay "Who Steered the Gravy Train, 1707–1766," in N. T. Phillipson and Rosalind Mitchison's collection, *Scotland in the Age of Improvement* (1970); and a handful of articles on parliamentary elections at the constituency level. When Murdoch published "*The People Above*," he was at the forefront of a movement that would transform eighteenth-century Scottish historical studies, virtually creating a new field of study. *Making the Union Work: Scotland, 1651–1763* synthesizes a now large body of scholarly work that shapes our understanding of union before 1763. Like Murdoch, others were forging new ground on how politics and government worked after 1707 (Richard Scott, John Shaw, Ronald Sunter), but there is much else a synthesis must account for. There is work on the Scottish economy (Christopher Whatley, Philipp Rössner, Julian Hoppitt), the rise of Jacobite studies (Bruce Lenman, Daniel Szechi, Allan Maciness), the emergence of a British Isles perspective (Alvin Jackson), the role of religion (Jeffrey Stephen), the intersection between union and culture (Nicholas Phillipson, Roger Emerson, Richard Sher), and the relevance of the seventeenth century for understanding the Union (Julian Goodare, Gillian MacIntosh, Allan Kennedy). The contributions of all these scholars and more find a place in this account, as Murdoch attempts to understand what the Union meant for Scotland.

That does not mean *Making the Union Work* is a survey; the book's title, its chronological breadth, its structure, and even the introduction should not mislead one into thinking that it provides a narrative overview of Scotland's early history of union with England. The author divides the period 1651 to 1763 into eight chronologically arranged chapters. Sandwiched between two of the latter periods is a chapter on the Scottish economy that covers the whole of the century. The book assumes a general knowledge of key events that would be basic to an introductory work: the Cromwellian conquest, the Covenanter risings, the Monmouth–Argyll rebellion of 1685, Darien, the 1704–1707 struggle in Scotland's Parliament over the question of Union, the 'Fifteen, the 'Forty-Five, and more. Furthermore, the work is little concerned with how or why major political events happened. One instance of this, the making of the Union treaty, is barely accorded two paragraphs. One needs to know a basic narrative to benefit from reading this book.

If *Making the Union Work* is not a narrative overview, neither does it argue a thesis. What holds it together are themes that recur in almost every chapter: how union took shape and how it was perceived and managed by key players both Scottish and English, the role of the house of Argyll in this history, the evolution of the Scottish economy and whether the Union brought economic benefits to Scotland, and the way intellectuals responded to issues arising from Scotland's relationship with England. Woven into the middle chapters is another thread, the nature of Jacobitism. In all of these, Murdoch engages the full range of existing historiography as he reflects upon issues. For example, did the Union resurrect the Cromwellian system, with England governing Scotland as an occupier? Did the Union deliver on the hopes of those who supported it in 1705–1707 and voted for the Union treaty? Did the generality of eighteenth-century Scots actually accept the Union and believe in its benefits, as an older historiography taught us to believe? The author does not always resolve the issues he raises, but he frames them in intriguing ways. An example is his discussion of the new tax regime imposed on Scotland after 1707, which considers whether it strengthened the appeal of a Jacobite revanche.

If this book is one historian's way of assimilating and integrating the research of a generation, it is also in part recantation. While he once confidently described Scotland as semi-independent after adoption of the Union treaty (e.g., "Scottish Sovereignty in the Eighteenth Century," in *The Challenge to Westminster*, ed. H. T. Dickinson and Michael Lynch, 2000), Murdoch now demurs. Additionally, *Making the Union Work* is not devoid of original contributions, as in its treatment of the Argathelians (the house of Argyll and its adherents). Perhaps Murdoch makes too much of them when he generalizes about their role, but when describing them at work, he does so deftly. While drawing on the research of others, he forges new ground. His treatments of both Robert Walpole and the Earl of Ilay (later third Duke of Argyll) in the aftermath of the 1725 malt tax crisis do much to rehabilitate both men. Here they appear statesmen-like for pursuing policies intended to reconcile Scots to the Union. This approach challenges the historiographical commonplace that venality drove the Scottish political system, and the contempt that accompanies such a view. Although there are passages in which Murdoch seems to share in the common disdain, he demonstrates nonetheless that governing entailed serious policy choices that could affect the well-being of both Scotland and the British polity as a whole.

One matter of usage cannot be overlooked: the text repeatedly refers to the "UK" government, a jarring anachronism. On a more substantive note, one might wish from this book a clearer narrative line or a closely argued thesis. Rather, we get a commentary that is continually thought-provoking, especially in the post-1707 chapters. A notable strength is the adept use of primary sources, usually executed with uncommon effect. The bibliography is the place to start for anyone beginning advanced study of Scotland's political history from 1651 to 1763.

Eric Wehrli, Canterbury School

Jessica Hanser, ***Mr. Smith Goes to China: Three Scots in the Making of Britain's Global Empire*.** New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2019. Pp. xii + 240.

The title of this excellent debut monograph by Jessica Hanser refers to three eighteenth-century Scottish private traders all named George Smith: George Smith of Madras (c. 1730–91), George Smith of Canton (c. 1746–1808), and George Smith of Bombay (1737–90). The term "private trader" refers here to those merchants who were not affiliated formally with the East India Company (EIC), which held a de jure monopoly on trade with Asia for more than two centuries. In practice, of course, the EIC found it very difficult if not impossible to enforce its monopoly in maritime Asia and particularly in Canton (modern-day Guangzhou). Indeed, ironically, the EIC and the British state came in significant ways to rely on these interlopers because of their crucial role in financing the complex and lucrative trade between Britain, India, and China in the second half of the eighteenth century. But this book is much more than merely a collective biography of three enterprising and globe-trotting Scotsmen in the Georgian era, although even the successful disambiguation of the three is itself a significant feat of historical detective work and testament to the author's careful scholarship. As Hanser contends in the preface, "By placing private traders at the center of the story, this book turns the seemingly dry materials of ledger sheets into a compelling historical narrative that fundamentally alters our understanding of Britain's empire and global trade on the eve of the industrial revolution" (p. x). This is an ambitious and striking claim, but it is one that I believe is ultimately justified.

Mr. Smith Goes to China is self-consciously and explicitly a *global* microhistory. It can be situated, then, in the vein of narratives written by distinguished historians such as Linda Colley, Emma Rothschild, and Jonathan Spence. Like these acknowledged role models, Hanser uses individuals and families to trace linkages and networks that spanned the globe. This is a remarkable achievement for a first book. The archival research unquestionably substantiates the claim to being truly global history: manuscripts are cited from collections in Australia, Denmark, Sweden, Taiwan, the Netherlands, and the United States, as well as England and Scotland.

We know a great deal about the early modern European joint stock monopoly companies that transformed the world order between the seventeenth and nineteenth centuries, and in particular the EIC and the Dutch East India Company (VOC). "Most studies on European commerce and imperialism in maritime Asia have taken the various East India companies formed by the British and Europeans as subjects," Hanser notes at the outset (p. ix). Her book has a different focus in its forensic examination of the careers of these Scottish private traders. Its six chapters, accompanied by a brief preface, a cogent introduction, and an engaging epilogue, weave together a compelling narrative that enables the author to address crucial debates in world history about "migration, global finance, social mobility, cross-cultural trade, diplomacy, and imperial expansion" (p. 167).

Readers of *Eighteenth-Century Scotland* will no doubt be drawn to Hanser's claim that "The George Smiths also reveal the significant role Scots and Scottish economic thought played in Britain's China trade" (p. 7). We certainly learn a lot about the innovative and influential role of Scots in financing the Canton-based trade that linked Britain, India, and China during the long eighteenth century. The detailed discussion of the credit/debt financing system is a major historiographical contribution to our understanding of Sino-British relations in the era preceding the Opium Wars of the mid-nineteenth century. There is attention to Scottish economic thought, and in particular an "ideology of free trade" associated here with Adam Smith (p. 125), quoting the Australian historian Alan Frost, mainly in the context of the political and diplomatic strategies of Henry Dundas as de facto chief of Britain's policies on South and East Asia (the "East Indies") under Prime Minister William Pitt the Younger.

While there is undoubtedly a great deal to admire and digest in this rich and rewarding book, there are inevitably some areas that might be strengthened or at least developed more fully. It is unfortunate that the author does not engage with the work of major intellectual historians of political economy and the Scottish Enlightenment, such as Nicholas Phillipson, John Robertson, and Donald Winch. A model that places ideas at the heart of what Smith called "the project of an empire" (covering an overlapping period) might be Martha McLaren's seminal study *British India and British Scotland* (2001) or a 2018 article by Minakshi Menon in *The Journal of Scottish Historical Studies* on Scottish natural history and statistical surveys of south India (specifically the region around Madras or modern-day Chennai, Tamil Nadu). Similarly, while the book highlights the significant connections between George Smith of Madras and Edmund Burke, which helped to shape Burke's view of India and its role in British imperial politics, it is unfortunate that the author does not engage with Richard Bourke's superb *Empire and Revolution: The Political Life of Edmund Burke* (2015).

This is an impressive and highly original work of historical scholarship at its best. Combining stimulating insights with a fluent narrative, it should appeal to a wide audience in academia and beyond. Certainly, specialists

in eighteenth-century Scottish studies will find this a very valuable contribution to our field. It enlarges and enhances our understanding of the genuinely global and multifaceted impacts of Scots in this era. Methodologically, this monograph may be of greatest interest to economic and financial historians, as well as social historians. As Hanser argues in her concluding epilogue, "the British empire was made at the micro-economic level through countless financial exchanges in the port cities of maritime Asia" (p. 168). Through these often-risky transactions (two of the three George Smiths went bankrupt), the global economic, military, and geopolitical order was transformed. The aggressive attempts by Scottish businessmen in the wake of financial crises to "demand a stronger intercession on the part of the British state in order to impose the terms of economic exchange upon their Chinese trading partners" (p. 102) left a contentious legacy that reverberates in our present world, especially in light of China's determined pursuit of the title phrase in Orville Schell and John Delury's *Wealth and Power: China's Long March to the Twenty-First Century* (2013). The scope of Hanser's book makes it a work that also offers much to diplomatic, political, intellectual, and cultural historians. In geographical terms, *Mr. Smith Goes to China* should be of interest to South Asianists and East Asianists, as well as to those working on European or Western history. Finally, it is worth noting that the commendable clarity and accessibility of the prose will make it an excellent text for undergraduate as well as postgraduate classes.

Paul Tonks, Yonsei University

Julian Goodare and Martha McGill, eds., ***The Supernatural in Early Modern Scotland***. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2020. Pp. xi + 257.

In 1730 Robert Wodrow reported that Yorkshire gravediggers, unearthing a human skull, went rigid with fright when the skull began moving. Relieved to find a toad inside, they also discovered an embedded nail. Inquiries eventually led to revelation of murder. The animal "certainly lodged there in Providence" satisfied Wodrow that God worked through secondary causes to achieve a special fulfillment of divine justice.

These convictions about natural phenomena, a divinely instituted moral order, and God's finely grained interventions in human affairs were not limited to orthodox Presbyterians. This new collection of essays testifies to a diversity of early modern belief about the world beyond the human senses. The collection challenges explanations of the "desacralization of the world," a key part of the "secularization thesis." Following several predecessors—Euan Cameron's *Enchanted Europe: Superstition, Reason, and Religion 1250–1750* (2010), Lizanne Henderson's *Witchcraft and Folk Belief in the Age of Enlightenment Scotland, 1670–1740* (2016), and McGill's own *Ghosts in Enlightenment Scotland* (2018)—Goodare and McGill address revised explanations of early modern trust in the supernatural. The editors carefully follow how key terms changed in the centuries since, such as supernatural, belief, and knowledge. They recall early modern natural philosophy's tense, but fruitful, relationship with theology, including God's role in secondary causes as well as special providence.

Chapters are arranged more or less chronologically. Several essays treat witchcraft testimony primarily as reflections on encounters with the spirit world. For Goodare, the accused exhibit emotional relationships with a supernatural entity, including visionaries and their spirit guides. In one of the more remarkable testimonies, Barbara Bowndie reported in 1643 that ninety-nine beings of some kind danced in the Moanes fields of Orkney. Liv Helene Willumsen carefully scans Bowndie's testimony. Did she observe the supernatural, have a vision, or something else? Willumsen diagnoses the push and pull of an oral/pastoral/poetic with ecclesiastical/juridical/witchcraft fear.

Several essays also treat the supernatural serving political crises. Witchcraft testimony recalled trances, in which Georgie Blears finds an "invisible polity," carefully moving back and forth from recent neurobiological explanations of altered states of consciousness to cultural studies and sociological analysis. Claims about second sight were effectively non-shamanistic trances. In some cases Scots recalled flight in spirit (echoing evidence from Carlo Ginzburg's *The Night Battles*). Trances did not require spirit visitation. Uniquely, such seers reported a degree of control over the experience. Many of these cases fall between the stools of our modern impulse to categorize.

Michael B. Riordan's readings of prophecy reflect shifting political perspectives into the mid-nineteenth century. In *The Whole Prophesie* (1603), Scotland dominated predictions for a monarchy unifying the island's peoples and their destinies. Prophets and their heirs coordinated forecasts to ideological commitments, adapting biblical exegesis to unstable circumstances.

Michelle D. Brook sifts through post-Reformation sermons for trusting the presence and intervention of God and Christ. Agitated by threats of diabolical attack, pastors minimized common conjectures about spiritual forces. If the natural order could operate without supernatural intervention, preachers worried about diminished trust in Christ's supernatural intervention. Some then wrestled the word "natural" back from material, physical laws to its resonance with "fallen nature." Most concentrated on the struggle of the divine and the diabolical in everyday life, agreeing that souls and communities were battlefields for a cosmic, supernatural contest between God and the devil.

No less than pastors, Scottish academics ruminated on the supernatural. McGill explains the changes in belief in angels and angelic action, from potentially threatening cosmic powers serving mysterious divine justice to

messengers of otherworldly ecstasy, increasingly less aligned to orthodox Christian theology. Jane Ridder-Patrick demonstrates that advances in seventeenth-century astronomy and physics did not diminish interest in astrology, which continued to be part of natural philosophy courses in Scottish universities. Allied to natural philosophy, astrologers kept an eye on special providences as signs of divine judgment. Yet there were skeptics during the early modern period, including George Buchanan, and by the last quarter of the seventeenth century astrology had diminishing returns as an academic subject.

Still, expressions of trust in divine providence endured. McGill and Alasdair Raffe survey a range of Scottish providential belief, enduring well into the eighteenth century. Moderates and evangelicals made similar claims about divine providence, perhaps complicating Thomas Ahnert's argument in *The Moral Culture of the Scottish Enlightenment, 1690–1805* (2014) about distinctive philosophical differences between them. If anything, the newly reformed natural philosophy suggested God was even more invested in a complex natural order. How did these subtle revisions of providential theology suggest divine ordering of human nature, put to use in historical studies and the nascent human sciences?

Accommodating natural philosophy to providence marked the history of one of the most distinctively Scottish depictions of the supernatural: second sight. Domhnall Uilleam Stiùbhart offers a formidable revision of the phenomenon's "invention" associated with Scotland's Highlands. Early on Scottish pastors, alarmed by lay testimony of spiritual encounters, aggressively recast folk belief as satanic influence. But in a later era fear over spreading infidelity recast second sight as empirical evidence of the supernatural. Martin Martin was only one, late participant. Throughout, Stiùbhart is keen to show how belief in second sight was sensitive to theological and political tensions haunting early modern Scots.

Scottish humanists were keenly aware of extra-Christian sources about the supernatural. Janet Hadley Williams carefully plucks out supernatural elements in Older Scots "eldrich" poems about the "other-worldly" or uncanny. Their remarkable flights of fantasy might suggest satirical reactions to the early Reformation, perhaps employing the supernatural for purely literary purposes. More than a century later, Enlightenment Scots turned to pagan sources on the supernatural. Felicity Loughlin discusses how deists and moderate Presbyterians mined pagan sources for evidence of the "severe limits of the religious powers of human reason" (p. 211), which made divine intervention by revelation essential. Loughlin follows Ahnert's argument that Moderate "heterodox" Church of Scotland pastors were theologically quite distinct from their orthodox evangelical colleagues. Yet it is possible to read Loughlin's argument as a challenge to the claim that "heterodoxy" accurately depicts Moderates like William Robertson or Hugh Blair.

Political reveries on the end of Scottish independence also interest Hamish Mathison. Complementing Riordan, he reads Lord Belhaven and Robert Burns at either ends of the century, with Allan Ramsay bearing up the center. Metaphors of sight, of the eye, and the providence of God comprehend a world as complex politically as in nature. Had the supernatural become a metaphor for confusion? Mathison nicely echoes Williams from the volume's beginning, in which poetic fantasies express civic anxieties. But following the Union of 1707 Scotland's status as a "nation" was perhaps as eldritch-like as other spiritual beliefs.

Many of these chapters concentrate on trial documents for witchcraft accusations or published accounts of the experience and danger of sorcery. Innovative readings of testimony move the spotlight from intolerance to cultural archeology, challenging our temptation, especially in popular cultural depictions of early modern supernatural belief (as in the television series *Outlander*), to consider Scotland's people dominated by fear and repression. As several chapters suggest, Scottish accounts of the supernatural also expressed hope.

From a skeptical perspective like David Hume's, persistent belief in the supernatural genuflected to the stubborn power of superstitious, moralistic, narrow piety. But compelling evidence from neuroscience and cognitive psychology to explain "confirmation bias" explains struggles to accept alternative, complex, rationalistic explanations of spiritual affairs. In his cooler moments Hume alluded to persistent, seemingly "natural" belief. But scholars now read this less as ignorant refusal and more as slow but earnest efforts at accommodating religious allegiance to the supernatural to a more "modern" account of the world. Stiùbhart's conclusions about the survival of popular belief in the face of theological consensus recall Carlo Ginzburg's argument in *The Cheese and the Worms*. These essays are like barometric readings: Scots responding to rapid changes in their modernizing world. A particular kind of radically secular Enlightenment, most recently promoted by Anthony Pagden, Margaret Jacobs, and especially Jonathan Israel, struggles to accommodate that paradigm to the evidence and arguments presented here. Wodrow's toad seems less bizarre, and less alien, than we might comfortably admit.

Mike Kugler, Northwestern College

The History of Scottish Theology, Volume II: The Early Enlightenment to the Late Victorian Era. Edited by David Fergusson and Mark W. Elliott. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019. Pp. xv + 446.

To provide a complete and up-to-date survey of Scottish theology in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, including its practitioners, arguments, context, and historical influences, is a near Sisyphean task. *The History of Scottish Theology, Volume II: The Early Enlightenment to the Late Victorian Era* is a collection of essays that address a wide range of interests, including explorations of individual figures and their publications, wider debates

over theology and philosophy, the influences of dissenting movements and religious revivals, and the function of Scottish theology in the Scottish diaspora. The series as a whole, spanning the years from the Middle Ages to the early twenty-first century, is meant to provide a "synoptic view of Scottish theology" in context, not just a typical overview of great theological works and figures (series introduction in vol. 1, p. 1). Since this collection is the second of three volumes in the series, it does not include the series introduction or conclusion; yet there are shared themes among the essays that provide a sense of cohesion.

One of the themes that emerges from this collection is the use of and responses to theology and the Enlightenment in the Scottish diaspora. This includes transatlantic connections, academic ties with colleges in Europe, and Irish interpretations of Scottish Presbyterianism. By tracing the outcomes of correspondence between American minister Jonathan Edwards and Scottish ministers, such as John Erksine, Jonathan Yeager shows how figures in the Church of Scotland looked to Edwards for guidance regarding public displays of evangelical conversion. Through their reciprocal relationships that grew out of sincere and long-term correspondence, even after his death, Edwards left behind a legacy that benefited from increased publishing and promotion in Scotland. Similarly, James Foster's essay on literate piety compares the lives of John Witherspoon and James McCosh. Despite dying a century apart, both men were leaders of the Evangelical party in the Scottish church; both became presidents of the College of New Jersey (later Princeton University); and both attempted to combine aspects of the Scottish Enlightenment with Calvinism. Both these chapters address the differences between the reception of Scottish theology in North America and Scotland as well as the similarities in religious movements between the two countries.

Tom McInally takes a different approach in his piece on Scots colleges in Europe, focusing on the tradition of Scottish Catholics studying and working abroad and their reactions to changes in religious tolerance over time in Scotland. Raymond McCluskey also discusses Catholicism but does so by dissecting the works of George Hay and John Geddes as representative of the eighteenth-century Catholic Enlightenment. Religious dissent is a thread throughout the essays, recurring often in relation to arguments concerning the Westminster Confession of Faith and the Marrow Controversy. David Bebbington addresses both issues in his essay on dissenting theology between 1720 and the 1840s, tracing a large variety of religious factions, both Presbyterian and non-Presbyterian, that emerged in this period. Further delving into dissent and its religious and political ramifications, Rowan Strong details the development of a separate theological identity for Episcopalians from the Glorious Revolution to the turn of the twentieth century. Strong highlights how indistinguishable Episcopalians and Jacobites were in the early eighteenth century and how this circumstance contributed to Episcopalians' dwindling numbers by 1800. Episcopalian theology was not just aligned with Jacobitism; it was deeply intertwined with it, to the point of Jacobitism being "one of the core beliefs of Scottish Episcopalianism," while Jacobitism itself possessed aspects of theology in its approach to the sacred nature of the monarchy (pp. 273–74).

The volume is not organized into sections or arranged thematically, but it does follow a general chronological order based on the time periods that the authors discuss. This arrangement gives the impression that the essays are not meant to be read all at once, but they do provide an expansive view of the Enlightenment and Victorian eras when looked at as a whole. The volume is a successful repository of theological analysis and historical context that readers will be able to revisit as their interests change. One of the ways this works in the collection's favor is by balancing essays that explore a vast expanse of time with others that focus on a specific person or movement over a short period. For instance, Ian Campbell's chapter, "Scottish Literature in a Time of Change," describes how Scottish literary works reacted to religious change from the early nineteenth century, with examples ranging from Sir Walter Scott's *The Heart of Midlothian* to more recent works, such as George Mackay Brown's *A Time to Keep* (1969). There are also essays that use a long chronology to offer insight into less-studied theological exchanges. In one of the few chapters that focuses on women, Anne Macleod Hill provides a rare look at Gaelic women's use of theology in evangelical song in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Gaelic poets not only conveyed biblical teachings but often simultaneously questioned authority and shaped their community's ethics through their music.

This hefty volume offers a total of twenty-nine chapters. Some highlight the theological contributions of specific figures, while others compare entire religious movements, or connections between Enlightenment thinkers like David Hume with eighteenth-century theology. In his essay, Iain Whyte traces theological arguments, or sometimes the lack thereof, against slavery from the mid-eighteenth to the mid-nineteenth century. More contributions that deal with the relationship between theology and race or theology and state power would have added further nuance to this already extensive tome. Despite the focus of this review on the eighteenth century, many of the contributors offer insightful analyses of the nineteenth century, and in some cases beyond. This collection conveys the main themes that characterized Scottish theology in these eras, and in doing so from such a comprehensive viewpoint, also delves into how theology caused controversies, shaped people's lives, and created persistent cultural effects. With such a variety of perspectives, this volume offers something for anyone interested in Scottish theology from the early Enlightenment through the Victorian era.

Bonnie Soper, Stony Brook University

Donald J. Newman, ed., ***Boswell and the Press: Essays on the Ephemeral Writing of James Boswell***. Lewisburg, PA: Bucknell University Press, 2021. Pp. x + 182.

Dane Love, ed., ***Boswell Collections Vol. 5***. Auchinleck: Carn Publishing Ltd. for The Boswell Society, 2019. Pp. 134. Available from Imperial Books.

It is safe to say that most modern readers first encounter James Boswell in one of two ways: either as a biographer or a diarist. Less commonly, one might first read *An Account of Corsica* (1768), which garnered Boswell a modicum of fame at the time. But almost nobody comes to Boswell by way of his pseudonymous *Hypochondriack* or *Rampager* papers, which, like the rest of Boswell's writing for the periodical press, are seldom read except by specialists. Through his ephemeral writing and a canny understanding of the publishing industry, however, Boswell was able to reach thousands of readers through the most popular newspapers in London. He published in nearly all the leading newspapers and magazines in London and Edinburgh between the late 1760s and his death in 1795, writing in most of the forms available to him in the constantly evolving publishing ecosystem of the time. Donald J. Newman's *Boswell and the Press* reminds us that Boswell in the press was a poet, comic wit, linguist, polite essayist, journalist, hard news and crime reporter, and political pamphleteer—all extremely important parts of his public and private self-image, and all aspects of his authorial dynamism that have not traditionally been attributed to Boswell the biographer and diarist.

Boswell's prolific output is on parade in *Boswell and the Press*. Newman's introductory essay "Boswell's Ephemeral Writing: An Overview" sets the stage for the eight chapters that follow by sketching the newly developed periodical industry and its readership in the eighteenth century, which would become the fertile ground for Boswell's "nearly two dozen pamphlets, an as-yet unsettled number of broadsides, and more than 600 pieces in periodicals, the bulk of which appeared in newspapers" (p. 1). The second essay in the volume, "Anonymity and the Press" by Paul Tankard, is the perfect follow-up to Newman's historical contextualization of Boswell's publication trajectory because the climate in which Boswell was publishing his ephemera determined how he could publish certain types of writing: out of those more than six hundred periodical pieces, "only thirty-four items are signed with his own name. The rest are anonymous or pseudonymous" (p. 32). Tankard's essay situates Boswell's naming strategies within the complex norms and conventions of authorship and public media in eighteenth-century Britain.

Among the highlights of this thoroughly enjoyable collection are James J. Caudle's first-time publication and translation of Boswell's prospectus for a periodical paper written in the Scots language; Terry Seymour's reproduction, bibliographical history, and recounting of the events surrounding the production of Boswell's poem "Verses in the Character of a Corsican" for David Garrick's 1769 Shakespeare Jubilee Ball and the ballad "William Pitt, the Grocer of London" for the Lord Mayor's dinner in 1790; and Celia Barnes's reading of one of Boswell's first published poems, *The Cub, at New-market* (1762), as an attempt to "revise and rethink" the "mode of production" of the "literary marketplace" "as Boswell *wishes* it were" (p. 95). In two complementary chapters, Allan Ingram and Jennifer Preston Wilson chart Boswell's mental state and the changing definition of the malady during his writing of *The Hypochonriack*, and in a fitting final chapter Nigel Aston shows how Boswell turned to the political press in his frustrated quest for career preferment from the incoming administration of William Pitt in 1783. Even seasoned Boswell scholars will find much that is new in this impeccably edited volume.

Boswell Collections consists of eleven talks presented by members of the Boswell Society at various meetings from 2015 to 2019. While Boswell is the thread that ties most of these essays together, many focus on lives that were in some way affected by him. Cecil Courtney opens the volume with an entertaining and detailed account of the friendship and correspondence between Belle de Zuylen and Boswell; Sonia Anderson explores the family of Sir Alexander Dick and its long relationship with the Boswells of Auchinleck; and Michael Bundock tells the story of Francis Barber, Samuel Johnson's black household servant who was released from slavery by Johnson's friend, Dr. Richard Bathurst, and who inherited a £70 annuity and a sizable portion of Johnson's estate upon the Great Cham's death in 1784. Roger Craik recounts the somewhat short and tragic lives of the five children born to Boswell and his wife, and David R. Boswell of Auchinleck goes on "A Genealogical Chase" to find the unknown subject of a family portrait from the time of his 5x grandparents, Margaret Catherine Boswell and Major-General Nicholas Carnegie. Joanne Wilson discusses four objects on display at the Samuel Johnson Birthplace Museum, including an extremely rare copy of Boswell's "Verses in the Character of a Corsican," mentioned above. The centerpiece of this volume is a talk given by Susan Rennie on her discovery in the Bodleian Library in 2008 of the surviving manuscript materials for "Boswell's Dictionary of Scots." Unfortunately, readers will be distracted by a lamentable lack of editorial consistency and competence, and much of the content here can be found elsewhere in more reader-friendly formats.

Michael Amrozowicz, State University of New York at Albany

Allan Ramsay's Future. Special Issue of *Studies in Scottish Literature*, edited by Murray Pittock and Craig Lamont. Volume 46, Issue 2 (2020).

In 2018 the Edinburgh Works of Allan Ramsay was funded by the UK Arts and Humanities Research Council and officially began its work. Under the general editorship of Murray Pittock, it also draws on the expertise of an impressive range of scholars in the UK and US, many of whom are among the contributors to this special issue of *Studies in Scottish Literature*. Since then, the project has functioned as a hub of scholarly activities and publications on Ramsay and his contemporaries. The special issue under review here is the latest such publication, representing some of the most recent fruits of the labor that goes into the Edinburgh Edition. Like that edition, this special issue aspires not only to refresh scholarly work and provide new insights into Ramsay and his early eighteenth-century Scottish context but also to achieve "revitalization of Ramsay's public image and the development of cultural tourism and celebration based on both Allan Ramsay and his son" (p. 4). Though lofty even for a large research project, this worthy and important goal has begun to be realized over the last few years with the inauguration of several commemorative events in Edinburgh and the Scottish Borders—"Ramsay Country"—and the installation of a plaque at the Allan Ramsay Hotel in the Pentland Hills village of Carlops.

Such a broad revival of interest in one of Scotland's foundational writers and entrepreneurs is impressive, as is the research generated by the Edinburgh Edition. With its focus on "Allan Ramsay's Future," the seven articles collected in this special issue offer a broad range of discussions of the influence, dissemination, and reception of Ramsay's activities from the 1720s to our own time. Murray Pittock's opening article offers a survey of Ramsay's (posthumous) national renown and importance while setting out to counter latter-day tendencies to relegate the influential poet to regional and demotic literatures. Rhona Brown unveils Ramsay's embeddedness in Jacobite networks via a study of the names and connections that occur in his poem "The Fair Assembly" (1723). Craig Lamont investigates the commemoration of and heritage claims to *The Gentle Shepherd*, its settings and characters, in periodicals and posthumous editions of Ramsay's works. Ralph McLean identifies Ramsay, Thomas Ruddiman, and Archibald Pitcairne as contributors to an emerging neoclassical linguistic trend of Latin imitations. Steve Newman connects Ramsay's manuscript (re)mediations to the culture of improvement in reading *The Gentle Shepherd* as a "major text" of the period. Brianna Robertson-Kirkland tracks the history of changes to the music in *The Gentle Shepherd* across editions from 1725 to 1788. And Jeremy Smith discovers in the collaborations of Ramsay and Ruddiman on *The Ever Green* and *The Gentle Shepherd* the synthesis of a stylized Scots that would make them progenitors of Robert Burns and Hugh MacDiarmid.

All these essays are excellent, each in its own way and according to its specific goals and materials, and are thus highly recommended reading for those working on related topics. One that deserves particular mention is Lamont's intricately detailed yet eminently readable study of commemorative claims to Ramsay history and heritage—no small achievement for a study that seeks to collect a host of posthumous references and inscriptions scattered across roughly six decades worth of periodicals and monuments while also attempting to unravel their often-conflicting assertions. In addition, it nicely anchors the special issue's collection of essays—always at risk of succumbing to the centripetal forces of a scholarly field and the various interests of its practitioners—around *The Gentle Shepherd* as a sort of Ramsayan gravity well; it gives the special issue weight and coherence, and it creates a textual focus from which the other essays can branch out without spinning off into space. Taken as a whole, the special issue thus offers added value by bringing together a group of refreshing, inventive perspectives on a comparatively neglected writer and his context that build on and enrich each other. In doing so, it generates a thematic field within which new lines of investigation can arise. To study Ramsay's participation in, and influence on, contemporary poetics, for example, is one worthy and valuable thing. Yet as the various essays collected here speak to and reflect on each other, it becomes clear that the true scope and depth of Ramsay's shaping of Scottish (lowland) culture can be captured and fruitfully investigated only by means of a multifaceted, multidisciplinary lens. In accumulating such a rich variety of approaches, foci, and source materials, this special issue makes good on its promise to provide "some of the best current research on the importance of Ramsay's achievement in the broader picture of eighteenth-century studies" (p. 7). It also goes a long way to demonstrating Ramsay's continued relevance and importance for contemporary reconsiderations of Scotland's heritage and cultural wealth.

Sören Hammerschmidt, GateWay Community College

Patrick Scott, ed., ***Robert Burns: A Documentary Volume***. Gale Dictionary of Literary Biography Volume 383. Farmington Hills, MI: Gale, 2019. Pp. xxx + 476.

Robert Burns: A Documentary Volume is a strange book, learned and unwieldy in equal measure. The volume is the work of the distinguished Burns scholar Patrick Scott, yet Scott's name does not appear until the title page: it's nowhere on the book's cover or spine. The book is very much a library reference series volume, although one whose audience I have trouble imagining in the 2020s.

The book is divided into six sections: Burns's early years through 1783, spent chiefly in Ayrshire; the Mossgiel years that led to the Kilmarnock edition; Burns's newfound fame in Edinburgh; two sections on his years of farming and being an excise officer in Dumfriesshire; and a final section titled "Aftermath" that ends with familiar material on the visits of the Wordsworths, John Keats, and Frederick Douglass to key Burns sites. Each section

proceeds by splicing together texts, mostly excerpted, to form a documentary biography. According to the publisher, there are over 300 documents included, 34 facsimiles, 45 sidebars, 10 maps, and over 100 illustrations, all in black and white. Some of the reproductions, like the 1778 map of Edinburgh on page 150, are too small and low-resolution to be useful. Many of the items come from the G. Ross Roy Collection of Robert Burns and Scottish Literature at the University of South Carolina.

The effect of the volume's short excerpting of documentary snippets can be disorienting. In the first section, "A Poor Man's Son in Ayrshire," for instance, we are treated, in the span of three pages, to an excerpt from the *Burns Chronicle* from 1899 on Agnes Brown, Burns's mother; a second excerpt on Burns's mother, from an 1850 letter "transcribed from a photocopy" in the Roy Collection at South Carolina; a 1933 observation that Burns was sickly at birth; an excerpt in Burns's voice from James Currie's 1800 edition of Burns's works; seven stanzas of "The Cotter's Saturday Night"; followed by excerpts from a 1764 Scottish catechism (p. 23–25). There's usually a discernible narrative logic to Scott's threading of excerpts, but the result is neither a book to enjoy reading from start to finish nor a useful reference for scholars. Scott's short preface tells us that "Almost everything that 'everyone knows' about Burns is wrong." (p. xxvii). Yet no one can assess the reliability of sources presented in this fragmentary way.

On the positive side, there is a wealth of information included in the book. Section two, "Mossgiel and the Kilmarnock Edition," for instance, includes excerpts from Jethro Tull's *Horse-Hoeing Husbandry* and a 1770 treatise on agriculture that treats the "several kinds of ploughs used in Scotland" (p. 85). But how would one find either of these items in a volume of short excerpts without an index? The only index in the volume is a 108-page "cumulative index" for the entire 383 volumes of the Dictionary of Literary Biography series, plus, inexplicably, five other multivolume sets published by Gale.

Gale's Dictionary of Literary Biography series began in 1978 with a volume entitled *The American Renaissance in New England*. Most of the volumes have been devoted to groups of authors rather than single authors. I don't know who uses books like this anymore. The mandates of Gale's series weigh heavily on what should have been a rich selection of Burnsiana by someone who knows the documentary sources as well as anyone alive. Rather than a print edition of its three hundred eighty-third volume at the price of $441, Gale would have done researchers and hobbyists alike a more useful service if this book were instead a searchable, digital collection with full texts within clickable reach.

Jeff Strabone, Connecticut College

Frances B. Singh, ***Scandal and Survival in Nineteenth-Century Scotland: The Life of Jane Cumming***. Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, and Woodbridge, UK: Boydell & Brewer, 2020. Pp. xxxviii + 318.

Frances B. Singh's *Scandal and Survival* offers a new perspective on a relatively well-known libel case: Miss Marianne Woods and Miss Jane Pirie against Dame Helen Cumming Gordon. Starting in Edinburgh in 1811 and dragging on until 1821, this case offers an opportunity to interrogate intersecting contemporary attitudes to gender, race, and sexuality. Singh recognizes this but takes a different approach, seeking to understand the psychological impulses behind Jane Cumming's accusation of sexual relations between two teachers, Woods and Pirie.

Singh's exploration of Cumming's life illuminates the global context of Scottish society at the end of the long eighteenth century, beginning with George, Jane Cumming's father. Eldest son of Sir Alexander Penrose and Helen Cumming Gordon, George served with the East India Company. He led a luxurious life and amassed substantial debts before dying at age twenty-six, on board a ship bound for home in 1800. Like many white men in India, George Cumming formed a romantic relationship with a young Indian woman (referred to as his "wife" by his uncle, the author Henry Mackenzie). Their two children, Jane and Yorrick, had already been separated from their mother and placed in a school by 1800, and on George's death they became the responsibility of their Scottish grandparents. The story of Jane Cumming's uneasy integration in and exclusion from the polite society of her family is interwoven into Singh's narrative, providing fascinating glimpses into class, race, and legitimacy.

The book follows Cumming from India to Scotland, exploring her early education and eventual placement at the Woods and Pirie school in Edinburgh, through to the famous court case with its imposing rooms and men, and on to her marriage to William Tulloch and its breakdown. The latter is aptly illustrated by Jane's decision to join the Free Church in the Disruption of 1843 while her husband, the minister of Dallas, remained with the established church. As a history of a mixed-race, Scottish-South Indian woman, navigating polite and middling cultures, and their prejudices, Jane Cumming's life may offer an important corrective to the predominance of the white experience in Scotland's cultural histories. There are hints of this history here, and the inclusion of other mixed-race women, such as Eliza Raine (Anne Lister's first lover), to contextualize Jane Cumming's experience is a productive approach. However, this is not developed. Too often points are quickly made and glossed over, such as the irony of Tulloch falling short of the ideal of monogamy when "Presbyterian missionaries in India were implying Scottish Christians were morally superior to 'heathen' Indians" (p. 184). There is significant, diverse scholarship on colonialism, missionary work, gender, and sexuality, and it is unfortunate that Singh does not engage with it.

Singh does sometimes engage critically with Orientalist readings of Cumming by contemporaries, particularly that of the law lords who presided over the 1811 libel case. Yet these are not given the critical reading neces-

sary to access Cumming's voice. Instead, the focus regularly returns to a psychological reading of Cumming. Rather than provide an insight into her selfhood, this pathologizes her. While Singh recognizes the racism of the era, it is primarily deployed to explain Cumming's assumed aggression and vindictive attitude. According to Singh, the negative mental impact of racial prejudice contributed to Cumming's "outbursts" alongside her "erotic sensitivity to situational and contextual stimuli, stress and anxiety, and child maltreatment" (p. 291). These various explanations are interesting, but they rely on a significant amount of conjecture. Without any real analysis of gender and power, and neglecting to engage effectively with Scottish and British gender history, the descriptions of the behavior of Jane Cumming and her teacher, Jane Pirie, as unwomanly can appear as accusation rather than analysis.

Jane Cumming is entrapped in this normative censure over the course of the book. Singh tells us that within a year at the Woods and Pirie school, "she became a bully, a sexual aggressor, a ringleader, a hate-filled plotter seeking revenge, the fabricator of a salacious story" (p. 91). Describing the events leading up to Cumming's accusation, Singh emphasizes Pirie's unfair treatment of Cumming due to racism and her insecure, jealous attachment to Woods, alongside her lack of "the gracious manners and self-control that characterized the well-bred woman" (p. 83). In turn Jane Cumming's "revenge" against the teachers is declared to have been "fueled by an adolescent's sexual desire, and frustration and deep unhappiness" (p 98). Describing her reaction to Tulloch's infidelity two decades later, Singh draws a direct link to the 1811 case, with Cumming rebelling "against authoritarian figures" and defying "the cultural expectations of the well-behaved woman by making sexual allegations that had some basis but could not be independently proved" (pp. 186–87). It is possible that Cumming was jealous, malicious, prone to angry outbursts and other similar character traits, but rather than condemn or sympathize, the historian dealing with this complex interplay of race, class, sexuality, and gender might have more success considering Jane Cumming's life in terms of her negotiation of power.

It would also be useful to allow for an understanding of the sexualities of Jane Cumming, Jane Pirie, and Marianne Woods within a queer and contextualized, rather than modern psychoanalytic, framework. It is a difficult and worthy task to turn attention away from the teachers and attempt to access the life of a mixed-race girl via court and other documents, which so often reiterate a gendered racist stereotyping. To do so, Cumming's voice needs to be creatively excavated from the archives. Here a critical race and queer reading of the sources would likely have proven more fruitful than Singh's combination of conjecture and modern psychology. This methodology conjures a troubling and unconvincing picture of Jane Cumming. Most problematically, it has a tendency to reinscribe the normative constructs of gender and sexuality and, to a lesser-degree, race, that the case reveals and subjects Cumming to. The end result, for this reader at least, is that by the end of the book, Jane Cumming herself remains obscured though not so much as her mother, "an Indian woman whose name is unknown" (p. 2).

Woods and Pirie won their libel case against Dame Helen Gordon Cumming, and Jane Cumming's allegation regarding their sexual relationship was deemed unproven. Yet this does not necessarily mean that Cumming was lying. Indeed, as explored in Lillian Faderman's *Scotch Verdict* (1983), it is plausible—though impossible to know with certainty—that Woods and Pirie were lovers. Either way, there are many instances in the libel case that offer promising avenues of inquiry into Scottish attitudes to queer sexualities and race at the beginning of the nineteenth century. The book ends with appendices, the first of which is an essay by Singh on Woods, Pirie, and romantic friendship. This would have been better placed in the context of the book's overall argument, but it too lacks a nuanced understanding of historical queer intimacies. If a critical race and queer analysis had informed Singh's methodology, fewer important points of analysis would have been stumbled over. This may have led to a less condemnatory depiction of Jane Cumming and provided more space for her voice to emerge.

Rosalind Carr, Birkbeck, University of London

Adam Budd, ***Circulating Enlightenment: The Career and Correspondence of Andrew Millar, 1725–1768***. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020. Pp. cxliv + 506.

In *Circulating Enlightenment*, Adam Budd gathers together practically every extant piece of information—letters, assignments of copyright, invoices, 234 documents in all—from the forty-three-year career of Andrew Millar, and enlightens them with a brilliant introduction, extensive annotations, eighty-nine illustrations, four appendices, and a comprehensive bibliography. The introduction uses new information and reevaluates published material to provide a nuanced version of Millar's life, reinforcing Millar's position as the dominant publisher of the Enlightenment (particularly the Scottish version) and correcting some popular misconceptions. For example, Budd demonstrates that although Millar often sought the advice of experts, he was himself more bibliographically sensitive and involved than he has sometimes been given credit for. Budd also explores how Millar used his publishing skills to become one of the wealthiest booksellers of his day.

Millar became a liveryman of the Stationers' Company in 1738 and was later elected Renter Warden. It is useful to know that Millar also became a member of the Court of Assistants in 1763. This is another indicator of Millar's financial acumen, for Assistants received larger shares of dividends than other members of the Company. But actually attending the Court was not a high priority for Millar, who attended once in November 1763 but then missed the next eighty-one monthly meetings held during his lifetime (London Book Trade database: 20312/ASS).

The introduction concludes with the Latin memorial to Millar published in the *Scots Magazine* in June

1768 (fig. 37). Full of playful puns on the print trade, this could have been the perfect ending, had it not been for the flawed English translation. The first lines should translate as something like "Sacred to the memory / Of Andrew Millar. / The book of his life completed, / This is the end of Andrew Millar, / Chief of his colleagues in matters typographical." Budd's translation: "To the sacred memory / Of ANDREW MILLAR. / A life finished by a book, / Here by his wine jars / ANDREW MILLAR / First among colleagues in the matter of printing" (p. cxliv). One is left with the unfortunate image of Millar, surrounded by bottles of wine (in fact no alcohol is mentioned in the Latin, despite Miller's reputation for hard drinking), meeting an untimely death-by-large-book—an image reinforced a few lines later: "For him is pressed upon, killed by the first page." The translation is inadvertently amusing but completely misses the point, and Budd's gloss on the translation only compounds the errors.

The edition itself begins with Millar's earliest extant letters (L1, L2), which establish him as a man of integrity, even at some personal risk: as a nineteen-year-old apprentice to James McEuen, and still in Scotland, Millar printed an alternative version of the 1725 Malt Tax Riots, even though his master had been threatened with imprisonment for doing just that. He must have noticed then that there were commercial merits in reporting both sides of a controversy, and he exploited that tactic later in his career, sometimes jeopardizing the trust of friends. For example, David Hume's relationship with Millar became uncomfortable when Millar leaked one of Hume's letters to John Brown and shared a prepublication copy of one of Hume's works with his enemy, William Warburton (L127, L131).

While there are a few letters from literary celebrities like Samuel Johnson (L92, L150), Tobias Smollett (L136), and Charlotte Lennox (L112, L113), longer sequences of correspondence are more revealing. Thirty-three letters written between July 1741 and July 1742 are from Henry Miles, Millar's editor of *The Works of the Honourable Robert Boyle* (1744), which was to remain the standard edition for two and a half centuries. The value of his letters lies in the minute details of editorial strategy. Starting with his "Memorandums in order to prepare for the new Edition of Mr Boyle's Works" (L25), Miles remains single-mindedly focused on such topics as collating earlier editions and repairing their defects, adding new material, searching for more documents, placing and numbering of plates, the confusion created by discontinuous pagination, and how to construct an index. All this develops his original editorial thought, but it comes almost as a relief when, in a personal postscript, he mentions the measures he has taken to ensure that Millar won't be affected after one of Miles's daughters comes down with smallpox (L46). Fifty-two letters track the vicissitudes of Millar's complicated relationship with David Hume. Some of these letters have been published before, but Budd reedits them and supplies extensive footnotes. Indeed, his annotations are exceptionally satisfying, ensuring that readers never leave a letter without understanding exactly what is going on.

Although historians of the book might have hoped for more written correspondence between Millar and his book trade colleagues, such as his printers William Strahan and William Bowyer and his successor Thomas Cadell, it does not exist. Budd more than makes up for that with his annotated analysis of the posthumous sale of Millar's copies (Appendix 4). This includes more than 850 shares in almost 160 titles or editions, with information on size of share, purchaser, and price. Even a cursory examination of these pages reveals the breadth of Millar's publishing empire.

There is one caveat though: Budd's transcriptions are not always accurate. While the coronavirus pandemic has made it impossible to travel to libraries to check original documents against this edition, the National Archives has been offering free digital images, including that of the probate copy of Millar's will. Budd reproduces the will—an important record of Millar's wealth, loyalties, and generosity—in Appendix 3. He standardizes spelling and introduces paragraphs, which he acknowledges, but he also silently inserts punctuation that is not in the original; in one instance this distorts the meaning. Worse, the transcription itself is sloppy. To mention a few instances, "Rector" is transcribed as "Record," "Reverend" as "honoured," and "Coach horses" as "Catch horses." When "heirs" incorrectly comes out as "Sons," Budd adds a slightly puzzled note about why the sons of such a young man should be mentioned. He claims that several words cannot be transcribed because they are illegible, but they are clear in the National Archive's digital image, and in one case—"relict"—the word is formulaic.

As for the letters, Budd makes an editorial decision to opt for diplomatic transcription. That is, rather than modernizing the text for twenty-first-century readers, he aims to retain the original manuscripts' spellings, abbreviations, capitalizations, and punctuation. Budd's justification makes sense: that this should assist us to "recover Millar's present and his past" (p. xv). But diplomatic transcription demands extra attention from the editor, who must ensure that even the most eccentric writing is accurately reproduced.

On the first page of his "Note on the Text," Budd includes an image of part of a letter from Millar to David Hume (fig. 1), then transcribes a line describing friends' "affectionate remembrance of" Hume. The problem—as can be seen by checking the image—is that Millar spelled it "affectianate." This mis-transcription takes nothing away from Millar's meaning, but it does not inspire confidence in Budd's transcriptions. Then there are two mistakes in the first few lines of the transcription on p. 131 of Richardson's "poetical epitaph for Andrew Millar" (L87, fig. 56, duplicating fig. 28): "from" is omitted in line 4, and the exclamation point is missing at the end of the next line. That said, L4, checked against an image of the Huntington Library manuscript, *is* absolutely accurate, and L74 (fig. 53) is almost so, except that Budd fails to signal a couple of above-the-line additions. It could be

that the mistakes noted here are aberrations, but these spot-checks raise doubts.

In every other respect, this volume is admirable, and I agree with Barbara Benedict's back-cover blurb that overall *Circulating the Enlightenment*, with its wealth of analysis and new information, is "a must-read for any scholar of book history, eighteenth-century culture and Scottish studies."

Christine Ferdinand, Oxford University

BRIEFLY NOTED

Tatsuya Sakamoto, ***David Hume and Adam Smith: A Japanese Perspective***. Foreword by Ryu Susato. Tokyo: Edition Synapse; London and New York: Routledge, 2020. Pp. xxi + 297.

Tatsuya Sakamoto has been one of the leading Japanese scholars of Scottish political economy for many years. His craft is on full display in this welcome collection of ten of his best previously published essays, often updated or revised. Part I, titled "Hume's Economic Thought in Historical Contexts," contains seven pieces, including perhaps his best known, "Hume's 'Early Memoranda' and the Making of His Political Economy" (2011), and my personal favorite, "Hume's Political Economy as a System of Manners" (2003). A fascinating chapter on the tension between the "Dominion of Learning" and the "Dominion of Conversation" in Hume's thought (2011) has been translated into English for the first time. Part II, "Hume and Smith in Japan," contains three essays (two newly translated into English) on the impact of Adam Smith on a variety of Japanese thinkers (including our beloved Hiroshi Mizuta) since the late nineteenth century, with Hume playing the role of Smith's "counterpart" or "rival" (p. vii). Taken as a whole, the essays range over the course of Sakamoto's scholarly life, and it is therefore appropriate that Ryu Susato has provided a foreword which discusses Sakamoto's personal development up to the time of his retirement from Keio University in 2018, when he began a new chapter in his life as a professor at Waseda University, researching a wide range of topics, old and new.

Richard B. Sher, New Jersey Institute of Technology/Rutgers University, Newark

RECENT ARTICLES BY ECSSS MEMBERS

Thomas AHNERT and Martha MCGILL, "Scotland and the European Republic of Letters around 1700," in *SPSC*, 73–93.

Corey ANDREWS, "'Caledonia's Bard, Brother Burns': Robert Burns and Scottish Freemasonry," in *AE*, 143–60.

Alex BENCHIMOL, "The 'Spirit of Liberal Reform': Representation, Slavery, and Constitutional Liberty in the Glasgow Advertiser, 1781–1794," *Scottish Historical Review* 99.1 (2020): 51–84.

Christopher J. BERRY, "James Steuart on the Public Good," in *The Economic Thought of Sir James Steuart: First Economist of the Scottish Enlightenment*, ed. José M. Menudo (Routledge, 2020), 3–13.

Christopher J. BERRY, "Ideas of Dependency and Freedom in the Scottish Enlightenment," in *Scotland and Arbroath, 1320–2020: 700 Years of Fighting for Freedom, Sovereignty, and Independence*, ed. Klaus Peter Müller (Peter Lang, 2020), 181–98.

Christopher J. BERRY, "From Poverty to Prosperity: The Recalibration of Frugality," in *Roman Frugality: Modes of Moderation from the Archaic Age to the Early Empire and Beyond*, ed. Ingo Gildenhard and Cristiano Viglietti (Cambridge University Press, 2020), 372–99.

Christopher J. BERRY, "O Problema da Coesão na Sociedade Comercial," *Discurso: Revista da Filosofia* 50.1 (2020): 9–23.

Christopher J. BERRY, "The History of Ideas on Luxury in the Early Modern Period," in *The Oxford Handbook of Luxury Business*, ed. Pierre-Yves Donzé, Véronique Pouillard, and Joanne Roberts (Oxford University Press, 2020), 1–22.

C. B. BOW, "The "Final Causes" of Scottish Nationalism: Lord Kames on the Political Economy of Enlightened Husbandry, 1745–82," *Historical Research* 91 (2018): 296–313.

Alexander BROADIE, "Introduction: Seventeenth-Century Scottish Philosophy," in *SPSC*, 1–10.

Alexander BROADIE, "Robert Baron's *Metaphysica generalis* on the Nature of Free Judgment," in *SPSC*, 127–39.

Alexander BROADIE, "James Dundas, the First Lord Arniston, on the Idea of Moral Philosophy and the Concept of Will," in *SPSC*, 158–73.

Alexander BROADIE, "William Chalmers (Gulielmus Camerarius) (1596–c.1678): A Scottish Catholic Voice on the Best and the Worst," in *SPSC*, 191–207.

Rhona BROWN, "Networks of Sociability in Allan Ramsay's *The Fair Assembly*," in *SSL46.2*, 22–39.

Rhona BROWN, "The 'Bohemian Club': A Study of Edinburgh's Cape Club," in *AE*, 127–42.

John CAIRNS, "The Legacy of Smith's Jurisprudence in Late Eighteenth-Century Edinburgh," in *Philosophy, Rights and Natural Law: Essays in Honour of Knud Haakonssen*, ed. Ian Hunter and Richard Whatmore (Edinburgh University Press, 2019), 278–305.

Toni Vogel CAREY, "Adam Smith's Newtonian Ideals," *Adam Smith Review* 11 (2019): 297–314.

Toni Vogel CAREY, "What Did Adam Smith Learn from François Quesnay?," *Journal of Scottish Philosophy* 18.2 (2020):175–91.

Rosalind CARR, "Achieving Manhood in Associational Culture: Student Societies and Masculinity in Enlightenment Edinburgh," in *AE*, 191–205.

James J. CAUDLE, "'Soaping'" and 'Shaving' the Public Sphere: James Boswell's 'Soaping Club' and Edinburgh

Enlightenment Sociability," in *AE*, 103–26.

James J. CAUDLE, "Clashes of Conversations in James Boswell's *Hebrides* and *Life of Johnson* and 'My Firm Regard to Authenticity'," in *Writing Lives in the Eighteenth Century*, ed. Tanya M. Caldwell (Bucknell University Press, 2020), 141–72.

James J. CAUDLE, "The Case of the Missing Hottentot: John Dun's Conversation with Samuel Johnson in *Tour to the Hebrides* as Reported by Boswell and Dun," in *Community and Solitude: New Essays on Johnson's Circle*, ed. Anthony W. Lee (Bucknell University Press, 2019), 53–78.

James J. CAUDLE, "A Model Minority? The Dissenting Press and Political Broadcasting in the Georgian Revolution," in *Negotiating Toleration: Dissent and the Hanoverian Succession, 1714–1760*, ed. Nigel Aston and Ben Bankhurst (Oxford University Press, 2019), 33–52.

James J. CAUDLE, "'The End of the Beginning?' The Rhetorics of Revolutions in the Political Sermons of 1688–1716," in *The Hanoverian Succession in Great Britain and its Empire*, ed. Brent S. Sirota and Allan I. Macinnes (Boydell Press, 2019), 82–99.

James J. CAUDLE, "Affleck Generations: The Libraries of the Boswells of Auchinleck, 1695–1825," in *Before the Public Library: Reading, Community, and Identity in the Atlantic World, 1650–1850*, ed. Mark Towsey and Kyle Roberts (Brill, 2018), 98–122.

Greg CLINGHAM, "Anecdotes of Bishop Thomas Barnard," *Johnsonian News Letter* 70.1 (2019): 23–44.

Greg CLINGHAM, "John Opie's Portraits of Dr. Johnson," *Harvard Library Bulletin* 28.2 (2017; published 2019): 57–80.

Greg CLINGHAM, "'I stole his likeness': An Unknown Drawing of Samuel Johnson and James Boswell," *The Burlington Magazine* 161 (March 2019): 220–22.

Greg CLINGHAM, "Lady Anne Barnard: Remnants and Renewal," *Bulletin of the National Library of South Africa* 73.2 (2019): 167–78.

Greg CLINGHAM, "Lady Anne Lindsay Meets Dr. Johnson: A (Virtually) Unknown Episode in Johnson and Boswell's Scottish Tour," *Johnsonian News Letter* 68.2 (2017): 25–39.

Cecil COURTNEY, "Belle de Zuylen and James Boswell," in *Boswell Collections Vol. 5*, ed. Dane Love (The Boswell Society, 2019), 7–25.

William DONALDSON, "The Poetry of William Forbes of Disblair (1661–1740)," *Studies in Scottish Literature* 45.2 (2019): 121–37.

William DONALDSON, "The Ballad and the Border: Scott's Minstrelsy and the Making of the Ballad Tradition," in *Street Music and Narrative Traditions*, ed. Sergio Bonanzinga, Luisa Del Giudice, and Thomas A. McKean (Edizioni Museo Pasqualino, 2020), 247–56.

Vivienne DUNSTAN, "'A Court in Decline? Examining the Regality Records of Melrose, Roxburghshire, 1657–84," *Journal of Scottish Historical Studies* 40.1 (2020): 1–16.

Roger L. EMERSON, "Assembling the Enlightened Scots: Fifty Years of Research," *Journal of Scottish Philosophy* 18 (2020): 105–11.

Howard GASKILL, "What Did James Macpherson Really Leave on Display at His Publisher's Shop in 1762?," in *OOT*, 29–52.

Clarisse GODARD DESMAREST, "Women Patrons and Designers in Early Eighteenth-Century Scotland: Lady Panmure and Lady Nairne" and "Living Horizontally: The Origin of the Tenement in Paris and Edinburgh," in *AoS*,233–53, 455–83.

Clarisse GODARD DESMAREST, "Princes Street, Edinburgh: A Street of Encounters," *Book of the Old Edinburgh Club*, new ser., 15 (2019): 13–28.

Clarisse GODARD DESMAREST, "Scottish and English Architecture: A 'Provincial" Relationship?," *e–Rea: Revue électronique d'études sur le monde anglophone* 17.1 (2019).

Clarisse GODARD DESMAREST, "Introduction" and "Commemorating the Founding of the New Town of Edinburgh in 1967 and 2017," in *NTE*, 1–18, 253–71.

Julian Goodare and Martha MCGILL, "Exploring the Supernatural in Early Modern Scotland," in *SEMS*, 1–24

Gordon GRAHAM, "Introduction," in "Symposium," 311–13.

Sören HAMMERSCHMIDT, "Mysterious Miss Churchill: Jane Collier's Copy of a Letter in the Richardson Correspondence," *Notes and Queries* 67.3 (2020): 415–21.

James A. HARRIS, "Hume's Peculiar Definition of Justice," in *Philosophy, Rights and Natural Law: Essays in Honour of Knud Haakonssen*, ed. Ian Hunter and Richard Whatmore (Edinburgh University Press, 2019), 216–37.

Eugene HEATH, "Imagination, Affirmation, and Interaction: Reasons for Reading Adam Smith's Moral Philosophy," *The Independent Review* 25.1 (2020): 123–31.

Eugene HEATH, "Sir John Davies on Custom and the Common Law," *Review of Politics* 82.3 (2020): 438–58. [includes a section on Hume, Ferguson, Smith, and other Scottish thinkers]

Eugene HEATH, "Education, Commerce, and Public Spirit: Craig Smith's Study of Adam Ferguson," in "Symposium," 313–20.

Jamie J. KELLY, "The Rhetoric of Empire in the Scottish Mission in North America, 1732–63," *Scottish Church History* 49 (2020): 25–37.

Jamie J. KELLY, "The Mission at Home: The Origins and Development of the Society in Scotland for Propagating Christian Knowledge," *eSharp* 24 (2016): 1–21.

Gauti KRISTMANNSSON, "James Macpherson's *Poems of Ossian*: A Translation of 'Low' Culture into 'High'?," in *OOT*, 53–64.

Anthony LEWIS, "Georgian New Towns of Glasgow and Edinburgh," in *NTE*, 78–96.

Anthony LEWIS, "Town Housing and Planning: Alexander McGill, James Gibbs and Allan Dreghorn in Early Georgian Glasgow," in *AoS*, 407–29.

Felicity LOUGHLIN, "Socrates and Religious Debate in the Scottish Enlightenment," in *Brill's Companion to the Reception of Socrates*, ed. Christopher Moore (Brill, 2019), 658–81.

Felicity LOUGHLIN, "The Pagan Supernatural in the Scottish Enlightenment," in *SEMS*, 204–20.

Felicity LOUGHLIN, "The Study of Pagan Religions in Enlightenment Scotland: The Case of Thomas Blackwell (1701–1757)," *Scottish Church History* 45 (2016): 82–98.

C. Alasdair MACFARLANE, "Pirates and Publicity: The Making and Unmaking of Early Modern Pirates in English and Scottish Popular Print," *Humanities* 9 (2020): 1–17.

Roger MAIOLI, "Between Relativism and Design: The Limits of Hume's Secularity," *Modern Intellectual History, First View* (2020): 1–25.

Anna MARKWART, "Adam Smith and Sophie de Grouchy on Education," *Studia z Historii Filozofii* 4.10 (2019): 63–81.

Anna MARKWART, "Adam Smith and the Roots of Sympathy," *Studia Philosophica Kantiana, Presovska Univerzita w Presove* 2 (2019): 21–34.

Karen E. MCAULAY, "A Music Library for St Andrews: Use of the University's Copyright Music Collections, 1801–1849," *Journal of the Edinburgh Bibliographical Society*, no. 15 (2020): 13–33.

Martha MCGILL, "Angels, Ghosts and Journeys to the Afterlife: The 'very rare and memorable' Stories of James Cowan (1707–10)," *Miscellany of the Scottish History Society* 16 (2020): 159–94

Martha MCGILL, "Angels in Early Modern Scotland," in *SEMS*, 86-106.

Martha MCGILL and Alasdair RAFFE, "The Uses of Providence in Early Modern Scotland," in *SEMS*, 160–77.

MCGILL–see Ahnert

MCGILL–see Goodare

Carol MCGUIRK, "The King and THE PEOPLE in Burns and Lady Nairne, with a Coda on Jane Austen's Favorite Burns Song," *Studies in Scottish Literature* 46.1 (2020): 14–22.

Ralph MCLEAN, "Compylit in Latin: Allan Ramsay and Scoto-Latinity in the Eighteenth Century," in *SSL46.2*, 61–76.

Ralph MCLEAN, "Professors, Merchants, and Ministers in the Clubs of Eighteenth-Century Glasgow," in *AE*, 85–100.

R. J. W. MILLS, "James Beattie, Jean-Jacques Rousseau and the Character of Common Sense Philosophy," *History of European Ideas* 46.6 (2020): 793–810.

R. J. W. MILLS, "Religion, Scepticism and John Gregory's Therapeutic Science of Human Nature," *History of European Ideas* 46.7 (2020): 916–33.

R. J. W. MILLS, (2020 online/ print forthcoming) "David Hume and the Myth of the 'Warburtonian School'," *History of European Ideas*.

Sebastian MITCHELL, "Ossian and Orality, or the Sound of Ossian," in *OOT*, 65–78.

Steve NEWMAN, "'Some Pastoral Improvement' in *The Gentle Shepherd*: Mediation, Remediation, and Minority," in *SSL46.2*, 77–102.

Steve NEWMAN, "Scottish Pastoral" ("National Song in *The Gentle Shepherd*: Original Impurity in Scottish Pastoral") *Romantic National Song Network* (August 2019).

Murray PITTOCK, "Edinburgh: Smart City of 1700," in *NTE*, 19–38.

Murray PITTOCK, "Allan Ramsay: Romanticism and Reception," in *SSL46.2*, 8–21.

Murray PITTOCK and Craig Lamont, "Introduction," in *SSL46.2*, 3–7.

Spartaco PUPO, "Personal Identity as Political System in David Hume," in *The Person at the Crossroads: A Philosophical Approach*, ed. James Beauregard, Giusy Gallo, and Claudia Stancati (Vernon Press, 2020), 19–34.

Spartaco PUPO, "Hume politico a Napoli. Per una rilettura della fortuna del 'celebre scozzese' negli scritti degli illuministi meridionali," *Il Pensiero Politico* 53.1 (2020): 3–35.

Alasdair RAFFE, "Who Were the 'Later Covenanters'?," in *The National Covenant in Scotland, 1638–1689*, ed. Chris R. Langley (Woodbridge, UK: Boydell, 2020), 197–214.

RAFFE–See MCGILL

Jane RENDALL, "'The Principle of Mutual Support': Female Friendly Societies in Scotland, c. 1789–1830," *Journal of Scottish Historical Studies* 40.1 (2020): 17–39.

Jane RENDALL, "Women's Associations in Scotland, 1790–1830," in *AE*, 206–27.

RENDALL–See WALLACE

Susan RENNIE, "Boswell's Dictionary of Scots," in *Boswell Collections Vol. 5*, ed. Dane Love (The Boswell Society, 2019), 51–58.

Ian Cameron ROBERTSON, "Some Archaeology on James Beattie's *The Minstrel* (1771 and 1774)," *Scottish Literary Review* 12.2 (2020): 137–58.

John ROBERTSON, "Enlightenment and Modernity, Historians and Philosophers," *International Journal for History, Culture and Modernity* (2020): 1–44.

Patrick SCOTT, "The Ghost at the Feast: Religion and Scottish Literary Criticism," *Studies in Scottish Literature* 45.2 (2019): 3-6; expanded in Scott, ed., *The Ghost at the Feast: Religion and Scottish Literary Criticism* (2020), 3–8.

Patrick SCOTT, "The Roy Manuscript of Burns's 'To John Syme'," *Studies in Scottish Literature* 45.2 (2019): 161–68.

Patrick SCOTT, "Burns, Blacklock, and Francis Grose: Three Sketches at Auction," *Burns Chronicle* 129 (2020): 4–9.

Patrick SCOTT, "The Roy Manuscript of Burns's 'Answer' to a Guidwife," *Burns Chronicle* 129 (2020): 10–20.

Patrick SCOTT, "A Burns Puzzler: What Colour was Anna's Hair," *Burns Chronicle* 129 (2020): 46–50.

Patrick SCOTT, "Burns's 'Farewell to the Brethren' (and the sisters?)," *Burns Chronicle* 129 (2020): 64–67.

Patrick SCOTT, "A Burns Antedating and Another (Mis)Attribution: James Hogg, Allan Cunningham, Monk Lewis, and 'The Hermit'," *Editing Burns for the 21st Century* (8 April 2020).

Patrick SCOTT, "'Yon High Mossy Mountains': A Burns Song Manuscript from the Roy Collection," *Studies in Scottish Literature* 46.1 (2020): 147–57.Patrick SCOTT, "The Missing Manuscript of 'A Red Red Rose'," *Editing Burns for the 21st Century* (22 September 2020).

Silvia SEBASTIANI, "Temps, progrès et races dans les Lumières écossaises*," Cahiers d'Histoire. Revue d'histoire critique,* special issue on *La fabrique européenne de la race (17e–20e siècles)*, 146 (2020): 27–46.

Clifford SISKIN, "Enlightenment, Information, and the Copernican Delay: A Venture into the History of Knowledge," *History and Theory* 59.4 (2020): 168–83.

Craig SMITH, "Reading *Adam Ferguson and the Idea of Civil Society*," in "Symposium," 328–32.

Fiona STAFFORD, "Dr Johnson and the Ruffian: New Evidence in the Dispute between Samuel Johnson and James Macpherson," in *OOT*, 17–28.

John STONE, "*The Two Noble Kinsmen* and Eighteen Other Newly Discovered Early Modern English Quartos in an Hispano–Scottish Collection," *Notes and Queries* 67.3 (2020): 367–74.

Paula J. TELESCO, "Identifying the Unknown Source of a Pre-Rameau Harmonic Theorist: Who was Alexander Malcolm's Mysterious Ghostwriter?" *Eighteenth Century Music* 17 (2020): 37–52.

Paul TONKS, "British Union and Empire in the Origin of Commerce: Adam Anderson as Eighteenth-Century Historian and Scottish Political Economist," *History* 105 (2020): 60–81.

Mark C. WALLACE and Jane RENDALL, "Introduction," in *AE*, 1–30.

Nathaniel WOLLOCH, "Adam Smith and the Concept of Natural Capital," *Ecosystem Services* 43 (2020): 1–5.

Paul WOOD, "The Scottish School of Common-Sense Philosophy," in *The Cambridge Companion to Common-Sense Philosophy*, ed. Rik Peels and René van Woudenberg (Cambridge University Press, 2020), 66–85.

Key to the Abbreviations

AE=Association and Enlightenment: Scottish Clubs and Societies, 1700–1830, ed. Mark C. Wallace and Jane Rendall (Lewisburg, PA: Bucknell University Press, 2020 [2021]).

AoS = The Architecture of Scotland, 1660–1750, ed. Louisa Humm, John Lowrey, and Aonghus MacKechnie (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2020).

NTE= The New Town of Edinburgh: An Architectural Celebration, ed. Clarisse Godard Desmarest (Edinburgh: John Donald, 2019).

OOT=Orality, Ossian and Translation, ed. Gerald Bär (Berlin: Peter Lang, 2020).

SEMS= The Supernatural in Early Modern Scotland, ed. Julian Goodare and Martha McGill (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2020).

SPSC=Scottish Philosophy in the Seventeenth Century, ed. Alexander Broadie (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020).

SSL46.2=Studies in Scottish Literature 46.2 (2020). Special issue on Allan Ramsay edited by Murray Pittock and Craig Lamont.

"Symposium"="Symposium: Craig Smith's *Adam Ferguson and the Idea of Civil Society*," *Journal of Scottish Philosophy* 18.3 (2020).

ECSSS Statement of Finances, 1 Jan. 2020–31 Dec. 2020

Bank of Scotland Chequing Account

Balance 1 Jan. 2020: £23,602.00

Income: +£932.23 (dues, book orders, and donations other than PayPal)

Expenses: –£0

Balance 31 Dec. 2020: £24,534.23

Bank of America Checking Account

Balance 1 Jan. 2020: $22,438.26

Income: +$9467.82 (dues, book orders, and donations other than PayPal: $1891.00; transfer from PayPal: $5851.82 ASECS contribution to Daiches-Manning Fellowship: $1500; PTS conference refund: $225.00)

Expenses: –$2662.84 (website fees [BlueHost for 3 years of hosting and domain name; Sitelock for security]: $849.61; fee to have back issues of newsletters scanned: $1500; 2 copies of *Association and Enlightenment*: $53.94; US Post Office for additional mailings: $3.79; NJ nonprofit organization annual registration fee: $30.50)

Balance 31 Dec. 2020: $29,243.24

PayPal.com Account

Balance 1 Jan. 2020: $2141.44

Net Income (after PayPal fees): +$3921.69 (dues, book orders, and donations)

Expenses:–$127.20 (software for newsletter)

Withdrawals: $5851.82 (transfer to Bank of America checking account)

Balance 31 Dec. 2020: $84.11

Total Assets as of 31 Dec. 2020 [vs. 31 Dec. 2019]: £24,534.23 [£23,602.00] + $29,327.35 [$24,579.70]

ECSSS/ASECS Daiches-Manning Fellowship at IASH, Fund at University of Edinburgh as of 31 Dec. 2020 [vs. 31 Dec. 2019]: £59,440 [£53,742]

Eighteenth-Century Scotland (ISSN 1085-4894) is published annually by the Eighteenth-Century Scottish Studies Society (ECSSS) and is sent to all ECSSS members each spring. Submissions of articles, announcements, and news items are welcome. Address all correspondence to the editor: Richard B. Sher (rbsher6@gmail.com or sher@njit.edu).

Tell a Friend—or a Library—about ECSSS

If you appreciate this newsletter, others may, too. Please tell a friend or your university library about us.

Our membership fees are payable to "ECSSS" in U.S. dollars by check or money order, or by direct deposit into our Edinburgh bank account (contact the Executive Secretary for details), or by sending the appropriate amount to funds@ecsss.org at PayPal.com

2021 Membership Rates:

Individuals: $35 or £27
Retired: $18 or £14
Graduate Students and Unwaged Early Career Researchers: Free
Institutions: $60 or £47
Supporting Members: $60 or £47
Five-Year Supporting Members: $240 or £188

Supporting and institutional memberships help to support the Daiches-Manning Memorial Fellowship, an annual award (co-sponsored by ECSSS and the American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies) which enables a post-doctoral scholar to conduct short-term research on eighteenth-century Scotland at the Institute for Advanced Studies in the Humanities (IASH) at the University of Edinburgh. The fellowship commemorates two past-Directors of IASH and recipients of ECSSS's Lifetime Achievement Award: David Daiches (1912–2005) and Susan Manning (1953–2013). Separate donations to the Daiches-Manning Fellowship Fund are also warmly appreciated and may be made either to ECSSS along with membership fees (see above) or by donating directly to the Fellowship Fund by credit card at Daiches-Manning Fellowship, where additional information about the fellowship can be found. Thank you!

Visit Us on the Web at www.ecsss.org.

For information on our Studies in 18th-Century Scotland Book Series:
ECSSS Studies in Eighteenth-Century Scotland

Eighteenth-Century Scotland
Federated NJIT/Rutgers-Newark History Department
New Jersey Institute of Technology
University Heights
Newark, NJ 07102-1982 USA